



THE REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY OF NIAGARA
PROCEDURAL BY-LAW REVIEW COMMITTEE
AGENDA

PBLRC 02-2019

Monday, June 17, 2019

9:30 a.m.

Committee Room 4

Niagara Region Headquarters

1815 Sir Isaac Brock Way, Thorold ON

	Pages
1. <u>CALL TO ORDER</u>	
2. <u>DISCLOSURES OF PECUNIARY INTEREST</u>	
3. <u>PRESENTATIONS</u> None.	
4. <u>DELEGATIONS</u> None.	
5. <u>ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION</u>	
5.1 <u>PBLRC-C 5-2019</u> Procedural By-law Considerations	3 - 9
5.2 <u>PBLRC-C 6-2019</u> Regional Council Expense Policy	10 - 41
6. <u>CONSENT ITEMS FOR INFORMATION</u>	
6.1 <u>PBLRC-C 3-2019</u> Comparison of Bourinot's Rules of Order and Robert's Rules of Order	42 - 44
6.2 <u>PBLRC-C 4-2019</u> Comparison of Municipal Procedural By-laws	45 - 65
7. <u>OTHER BUSINESS</u>	

8. **NEXT MEETING**

The next meeting will be held at the call of the Chair.

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

If you require any accommodations for a disability in order to attend or participate in meetings or events, please contact the Accessibility Advisory Coordinator at 905-980-6000 (office), 289-929-8376 (cellphone) or accessibility@niagararegion.ca (email).

MEMORANDUM

PBLRC-C 5-2019

Subject: Procedural By-law Considerations

Date: June 17, 2019

To: Procedural By-law Review Committee

From: Ann-Marie Norio, Regional Clerk

The following items have been referred to the Procedural By-law Review Committee for consideration during its review:

- Elimination of Co-Chair system for Public Health and Social Services Committee
- Membership Limits for Standing Committee
- Membership on all Standing, Steering and Advisory Committees, even if renewable, be for a two (2) year term
- Clarity respecting discussion following a presentation to Committee

In addition, staff have included a possible format option for a new procedural by-law attached as Appendix 1 for Committee's consideration. This format is favoured by staff and will allow for ease of use and reference by Members.

Respectfully submitted and signed by

Ann-Marie Norio
Regional Clerk

Appendices

Appendix I Draft Procedural By-law Format

A

ARTICLE I	7
Short Title.....	7
ARTICLE II	7
Interpretation	7
Article III	
General Provisions	11
ARTICLE IV	11
Meetings.....	11
ARTICLE V	
Roles	16
ARTICLE VI	
Duties	18
ARTICLE VII	
Conduct during meetings.....	20
ARTICLE VIII	
Rules of Debate	22
ARTICLE IX	
Order of Business.....	24
ARTICLE X	
Quorum	25
ARTICLE XI	
Committee of the Whole	26
ARTICLE XII	
Minutes.....	27
ARTICLE XIII	
Presentations / Delegations / Deputations	28
ARTICLE XIV	
By-Laws	30
ARTICLE XIX	
Committees.....	35
ARTICLE XV	
Consent / Correspondence	31
ARTICLE XVI	
Resolutions / Notice of Motion	32
ARTICLE XVII	
Reports / Communication	33
ARTICLE XVIII	
Disclosure of Interest.....	34
ARTICLE XIX	
Committees	3
ARTICLE XX	
General Rules / All Committees	36
ARTICLE XXI	
New Business / Unfinished Business	38
ARTICLE XXII	
Voting	39
ARTICLE XXIII	
Parliamentary Process - Motions.....	41
ARTICLE XXIV	
Resignation / Members / Vacancies	47
ARTICLE XXV	
Repeal / Enactment Procedural By-law.....	48

B

By-Laws

Confirmatory By-law	31
Readings	30

C

Committee of the Whole

Conduct of business	26
No vote	27
Reports considered	26

Committees

Ad Hoc	35
Special	35
Standing	36

Conduct during meetings

Breach of Rules	20
Code of Ethic - Confidentiality	21
Powers to expel	21

Consent / Correspondence

Inclusions	32
Routine matters	31

D

Duties

Council Members	18
Mayor and Committee Chair	19
Mayor- Enforce order	19
No Interference with Administration	19

G

General Provisions

Parliamentary Authority	11
Severability	11
Suspension of Rules	11
Two-Thirds Vote calculation	11

I

Interpretation

Abstention	7
Act	7
Acting Mayor	7
Ad Hoc Committee	8
Adjourn	7
Advisory Committee	8
Chair	8
Chief Administrative Officer	8
Clerk	8
Committee	8
Committee of the Whole	8
Council	8
Debate	8

In-Camera	8
Local Board.....	9
Meeting.....	9
Member	9
Municipal Corporation	9
Point of Information	9
Point of Order.....	9
Question of Privilege	9
Recorded Vote	9
Seal.....	10
Special Committee	9
Standing Committee.....	9
Time.....	10

M

Meetings	
Closed to public	13
Closed to public – Confidential matters	15
Closed to public - resolution.....	15
Committee of the Whole	16
Delivery Notice	12
Electronic	15
Emergency.....	13
Emergency location	13
Exceptions	12
Inaugural	11
Nature of Business	12
Open to public	13
Public.....	11
Public – Termination hour.....	16
Public Notice.....	12
Special.....	12
Special – no other business.....	13
Special Notice	12
Minutes	
Recorded	27
Motions	
Adjourn.....	46
Amend	44
Amend Something Previously Adopted	45
Appeal	41
Close Debate – Put the Question	43
General.....	43
Point of Order	42
Question of Privilege	41
Recess	46
Reconsideration	44
Refer or Commit.....	43
Request for Information	42
Rescind	45
Withdrawal of Motion.....	42

N

New Business / Unfinished Business	
New Business – non-routine	39

Pending List.....	38
Routine nature.....	38

O

Order of Business	
Agenda.....	24
Agenda Delivery.....	24

P

Presentations / Delegations / Deputations	
Delegation – Inappropriate for Council.....	30
Delegations – requests for action.....	29
Delegations – Time Limit.....	29
Presentation defined.....	28
Presentation Exception to Time Limit.....	28
Presentation Time Limit.....	28
Previously heard - PAC.....	30
Request deadline.....	28
Restrictions and permission.....	29

Q

Quorum	
Absence of Mayor.....	26
Conflict of Interest – lack of Quorum.....	26
No Quorum – permitted motions.....	25

R

Reports / Communication	
Deadline for submission.....	33
Tender, Quotation, RFP Reports.....	33
Resignation / Members / Vacancies	
Appointments.....	47
Resolutions / Notice of Motion	
Deferred when mover absent.....	33
Inclusion to Agenda.....	32
When required.....	32
Roles	
CAO.....	17
Clerk.....	18
Council Members.....	16
Head of Council.....	17
Rules of Debate	
Chair to preserve order.....	22
Integrity of Employees.....	24
Speaking – time limit.....	23
Speaking determination.....	23

S

Short Title	
Citation.....	7

V

Voting

Calculation 2/3's vote	41
Failure to vote.....	40
Recorded	40
Separating Motion.....	40
Separating Motion – not permitted	40

DRAFT

DRAFT

MEMORANDUM

PBLRC-C 06-2019

Subject: Amendments to Regional Council Expense Policy

Date: June 17, 2019

To: Procedural By-law Review Committee

From: Ann-Marie Norio, Regional Clerk

At its meeting held on May 16, 2019, Regional Council approved the following resolution of the Corporate Services Committee:

*That Report CSD 31-2019, dated May 8, 2019, respecting Councillor Information Request re: Councillor Expense Policy, **BE RECEIVED** and that the following recommendations **BE APPROVED**:*

- 1. That the current Expense Policy **BE REVISED** to include items 1 through 15 outlined in the Alternatives Reviewed section of Report CSD 31-2019;*
- 2. That the revised Expense Policy **BE SENT** to the next Procedural By-law Review Committee meeting for final review prior to Council approval; and*
- 3. That staff **PROVIDE** Corporate Services Committee with a report comparing the first two quarters to the same two quarters of the previous terms of Council to determine if there has been an increase in mileage and other similar types of expenses, since making Councillors 'whole' again after the federal tax policy change.*

Report CSD 31-2019 is attached to this memorandum as Appendix 1. In accordance with the above recommendation, staff have provided a draft amended policy that includes the items from CSD 31-2019 as well as updates to ensure consistency and best practices. A breakdown of the changes is included in Appendix 2.

Respectfully submitted and signed by

Ann-Marie Norio
Regional Clerk

Appendices

Appendix 1 Report CSD 31-2019

Appendix 2 DRAFT Regional Council Expense Policy

Subject: Councillor Information Request re: Councillor Expense Policy

Report to: Corporate Services Committee

Report date: Wednesday, May 8, 2019

Recommendations

That this report **BE RECEIVED** for information.

Key Facts

- The purpose of this report is to respond to Councillor Ip's information request from the January 9, 2019 Corporate Services Committee meeting regarding the Regional Council Expense Policy.
- The Regional Council Expense Policy C-RC-001, approved by Council in November 2017 and last revised in April 2018, is meant to govern the reimbursement of expenses incurred by Members of Council during activities related to the Regional Business of Niagara Region.
- Andrew Sancton Consulting, as an Independent External Governance Auditor, first reported on the expense policy in his September 30, 2018 Fact Book, and again in his Final Report dated April 5, 2019 presented to the Committee of the Whole on April 11, 2019.
- This report compares the Regional Council Expense Policy, Dr. Sancton's analysis and recommendations, and staff expense policy and financial best practices.

Financial Considerations

There are no direct financial implications to changing the Regional Council Expense Policy; however, if Council were to impose limits that exceed the available budget there would be a corresponding financial impact. The 2019 annual budget for administrative expenses is \$80,300 for the office of the Regional Chair, and \$139,352 for Members of Council.

Analysis

At the January 9, 2019 Corporate Services Committee, Councillor Ip requested *"that staff provide a report respecting recommendations from a financial and accounting perspective regarding potential amendments to the Councillor Expense Policy related to expense approvals, spending limits, permitted expenses and required back up documentation to coincide with the independent external governance auditor's report respecting Councillor expenses."*

Dr. Sancton's and Dr. Cobban's Final Report COTW-C 04-2019 was brought forward at the April 11, 2019 Committee of the Whole meeting. Staff has completed a comparison of the independent external governance auditor's recommendations, the current Regional Council Expense Policy C-RC-001 (Appendix 1), and staff's interpretation of best practices regarding processing and approving business-related expenses.

Expense approvals

The independent auditor's final report made no recommendations regarding overall approval of Councillor expenses. Staff noted in our review that the policy is not clear on who is ultimately responsible for executing approval. Under Roles and Responsibilities, Members of Council, item 5.1.c states that Councillors "sign-off on all expenses submitted to or paid by Niagara Region". Regional Administrative Staff responsibility 5.2.d says staff "advise Members if any submitted or proposed expenditure is an ineligible expense or a breach" of the Councillor expense policy.

The Region uses PeopleSoft Financials (PSF) to process all employee travel and expense reports, including for Councillors, with an electronic workflow method of approval. Presently, Council expense reports are keyed into PSF by Region administrative staff and Councillors are not currently required to sign-off or review those expenses after receipts are submitted, therefore no evidence of item 5.1.c electronically exists. The Regional Clerk is assigned the authority in PSF to electronically approve Councillor expenses, and the CAO electronically approves the Regional Chair's expenses. Specific language regarding who owns authorization of the eligibility of an expense, and, by extension, the electronic approval responsibility for Council expenses, should be included in the policy for clear accountability.

In comparison, Region employee process is established based on best practice in accounting which suggests that an individual should not approve their own expenses, and based on our corporate structure, expenses should go to an approver. Employees are required to either key their own expenses into PSF, or, for those who have an administrative staff key expenses on their behalf, to regularly review their department operating statements for errors or omissions. Regardless of who keys the submission, all expenses are sent for electronic approval to the employee's manager. The employee is responsible for adhering to the policy and the manager is responsible for ensuring consistent application of the policy and authorizing the expense. (Please note, the employee expense policy is currently under review with updates expected to several sections in 2019; it was last revised in 2005.)

In addition, there seems to be ambiguity in the policy language regarding instances where staff is unable to confirm that the expense is eligible for reimbursement. The responsibilities for Audit Committee item 5.3 include to "a) Review any expenditures submitted by Members but not processed by Regional Administrative Staff as per this

policy; and b) Provide recommendation on reimbursement to Council who will make the final decision.”

In staff’s opinion, the policy should specify that expenses should only be directed to Audit Committee for approval when a reimbursement request is submitted that falls within a grey area of allowable expenses based on administrative staff’s review. This aligns with the independent auditor’s recommendation “that staff be required to forward any expense claims that do not clearly conform to the expense policy to the Audit Committee.” As currently written, it could be interpreted that Audit Committee, and ultimately Council, has the ability to override and authorize expenses deemed ineligible within the policy.

Staff recommends the policy should state that approval is delegated to the Regional Clerk for Councillors and to the CAO for the Regional Chair, with decisions regarding ambiguous expense eligibility to Audit Committee, as per the current operating model.

Spending limits

Dr. Sancton’s report recommends “That councillors may attend up to 3 conferences per year of two or more days in duration requiring overnight accommodations. Conferences must be related to their duties as a Regional Councillor, and they must register as a Regional Councillor (i.e., not as a Mayor). Conferences must be located within continental North American. No more than 4 council members may attend any one particular conference. Exceptions to these stipulations require approval of Council.”

We anticipate that will be difficult to administer such limits within grey areas, i.e. if the conference is two or more days, how to define the requirement of overnight accommodations, where then the maximum does not apply, despite what may be high registration and travel costs.

Also, the intricacy of Dr. Sancton’s suggestion could not be restricted in PeopleSoft Financials since budget checking for an expense category (i.e. registration fees) does not cross-reference against a group of employees. Therefore, the four council member maximum would require a manual verification process and be subject to error due to the timing of expense submissions (staff may not know who has registered until Councillors submit receipts one or more months after the fact). To mitigate this, a centralized registration or pre-approval process would be required so staff could ensure the maximum number of councillors is not exceeded, thereby adding additional processing complexity.

Administrative burden aside, from 2016 to 2018, an average of 14 Members of Council (including some mayors) were reimbursed for attendance at AMO’s annual conference each year, with an average of 12 (also including some mayors) reimbursed for each annual FCM conference over the same period. There were very few paid registrations

by Councillors at any conference outside of these two. As such, Dr. Sancton's recommendation would require a significant shift to Regional Council's usual practices. Staff also observed that in spite of having this number of Councillors attending AMO and FCM, we have not exceeded the Members of Council administrative budget over the same period (excluding one unusual legal expense).

Dr. Sancton discussed in the Final Report that he was not opposed to creating an overall budget limit for individual councillor expenses, but expressed concern regarding the equality of applying the same limits when each councillor is subject to differing population and geographic influences. In the Fact Book, he identified several comparable municipalities (Peel, Durham, and Waterloo) that applied equal limits on either overall spending or certain expense categories. In the spirit of transparency and ability to ensure consistent application of the policy, staff believe that if a spending limit per Councillor is to be considered it should be for an overall annual limit. For example, the 2019 administrative expense budget for all Members of Council is \$139,352 (includes registration fees; office, printing, and postage; advertising and promotion; travel and meals; and telephone and communication expenses). This budget could be split between all 31 Councillors so each has an annual budget of \$4,495, to be used for any conference, travel, and other expenses as a Councillor deems appropriate to serve their constituents (within expense policy guidelines) in furtherance of Regional business. The Regional Chair would be subject to different limits. Such limits could be managed electronically within the PeopleSoft Financials expense process.

In reviewing attendance at the AMO and FCM conferences, an average of five mayors were reimbursed for each annually from 2016 to 2018. Dr. Sancton's recommendation is that a mayor's attendance should instead be reimbursed at the local area municipality level and this would require amendment to the current policy.

It is important to note that in prior years when one-third of Councillor remuneration was deemed to be expenses and therefore exempt from taxation, some members expensed little to no mileage or meals. With the federal government's elimination of the tax-exempt Municipal officers' expense allowance as of January 1, 2019, we may find an increase in expense submissions. As such, the current 2019 administrative expense budget may not stretch as far as in the past. Staff will monitor expenses throughout 2019 to determine the ultimate impact.

On the whole, with respect to spending limits, staff are recommending an overall annual spending limit per Councillor, and updating the policy language to exclude reimbursement to mayors for the AMO and FCM conferences.

Permitted expenses

Staff believe that much of the language around permitted expenses is reasonable within usual prudent financial policy. The following areas are exceptions and may require clarification.

Annual newsletter

The final report from Dr. Sancton included a recommendation “That councillors be reimbursed for the expenses of producing and distributing 1 newsletter annually.” In the interest of determining an expense’s eligibility, staff would prefer to have as little ambiguity and as much ease of administration as possible. As such, a limit on newsletters or promotional materials could be accommodated within the spending limits discussed above. In addition, the policy does not currently specify newsletters as an allowable expense; instead item 4.7.d refers to “Promotional material related to Regional Business” and will require updating.

Staff also recommends specifying newsletters as allowable and stating a limit to the annual allowance during an election year to add clarity over and above the existing reference in section 4.10 to the *Use of Municipal Resources During an Election Campaign Period* policy. For example, Peel Region’s Councillor expense policy specifies that in an election year, “no newsletter shall be distributed or any expenses reimbursed relating to newsletters from May 1 to the end of the Council term”.

Legal expenses

In Dr. Sancton’s Fact Book, he questioned if legal costs relating to a Code of Conduct complaint should be considered “routine” enough to be included in the expense policy. The Final Report recommended “That legal expenses arising from or in any way related to complaints under the Code of Conduct be deemed ineligible expenses.”

In staff’s experience, “routine” isn’t a guiding accounting principle of expense reimbursement; instead “business purpose” and correlation to the requirements of an employee’s role would normally be considered. However, staff agrees with Dr. Sancton’s recommendation to deem legal fees related to Code of Conduct complaints as ineligible expenses. This was previously recommended by staff when the expense policy was last updated in 2018. Eligibility of other legal costs should continue to be governed by the Region’s *Legal Indemnification* policy, as currently referenced in expense policy section 4.9.c.

Mileage

The Councillor expense policy states in item 4.3.d that “the mileage rate applied will be in accordance with Canada Revenue Agency (CRA) guidance”, but does not specify a

rate. For clarity, the Region pays mileage for staff and Councillors at one year behind the current year's CRA rate (i.e. the 2019 Region rate is the 2018 CRA rate), as per direction given by Corporate Services Committee in 2013. The policy item should be updated to reflect as such.

In addition, under the Region's staff expense policy, an employee's travel from their home to their "normal work location" would not be an eligible expense, as that would be deemed a taxable benefit by CRA. It should be noted that Councillors are not employees of the Region. At this time, Councillor mileage to Regional headquarters is reimbursed, and Dr. Sancton's Final Report suggested that mileage for attending council meetings should continue to be an allowable expense claim. Therefore, the Council expense policy should clearly deem that Regional headquarters is not a Councillors' "normal work location" and, accordingly, mileage for travelling to committee and council meetings would be eligible for reimbursement.

Staff note that a Regional Chair would be excluded from this definition, given that his or her office is located at Regional headquarters. We also found that making this change in accordance with Dr. Sancton's recommendation would differ than some other upper tier municipality council expense policies. For example, in their policy, Peel Region specifically defines their headquarters address as the "normal work location" and states that "travel from home to a Member of Council's normal workplace and back is considered by the Canada Revenue Agency as personal use of the vehicle and is not subject to reimbursement".

The mileage calculation section also does not specify what constitutes an allowable trip; therefore, staff recommends adding language regarding what is permitted as "Regional business". In the Final Report, Dr. Sancton recommends "That councillors be reimbursed for mileage for attending official regional functions only". The independent auditor also comments that "travel costs related to other activities that, while they may relate to their duties and responsibilities as regional councillors, do not constitute official regional business (e.g., attending community events, meeting with constituents)" and should therefore not be reimbursed.

Consequently, along with recommending that the policy states that the mileage rate will be paid at one year behind the current year's CRA rate and defining "normal work location", Staff recommend defining "Regional business" within the expense policy as "attendance at official Regional functions". Staff acknowledge that this definition will be subject to interpretation unless Council wishes to define it more explicitly.

Per Diems

In reviewing the Council expense policy, staff also noted that the Councillors' applicable per diem rate is \$85 (item 4.5.c). For comparison, Peel Region, Waterloo Region, Durham Region, and Hamilton all have a Council per diem rate of \$75.

The policy also does not index the per diem rate for Councillors, nor does the Region's employee expense policy. (The rate is currently set at \$65 for staff and is under review as part of the employee expense policy update planned for this year).

Staff recommend updating the per diem rate to \$75 to be in line with comparable municipalities, and indexing the rate to inflation once per council term.

Required backup documentation

Staff found several gaps in the policy and procedure with respect to required backup documentation. For example, CRA guidelines require that when meals are reimbursed (as under the expense policy Meals/Per Diem sections 4.5.f and 4.5.g) the names of those attending the meal and business reason for expense must be specified with the receipt. This requirement is not specified in the existing policy. Adding such language would bring the Region in line with clauses in similar policies at several other municipalities including Peel Region, City of Toronto, and City of Ottawa.

Adding this requirement will also assist staff in properly administering the policy. When receipts are submitted without proper reference, staff may not be able to identify if a receipt was an allowable meal, or if it should have been included as part of a per diem (which could result in a Councillor being over-reimbursed). Councillors also do not always log information regarding the nature of the business on the receipt, so staff is unable to verify it was for Council-related ("Regional") business.

The policy does not currently require Councillors to provide documentation to support a mileage claim (see item 4.1). The policy should state that a Google Map printout (or equivalent) be provided as backup, similar to the requirements for staff under the employee expense policy.

We also recommend reviewing the expense submission process to ensure consistent application of the policy by Councillors (for example, by requiring a standard submission form that includes Councillor sign-off, or even granting limited PeopleSoft Financials access so Councillors can view and submit their own expenses electronically).

Overall, to improve requirements for documentation, staff recommend updating the policy language to require noting the names of attendees and business reason for the expense on meal receipts, to record brief details of the nature of the Regional business on any receipt, to provide a Google Map printout (or equivalent) as backup to a mileage claim, and to implement a new submission process for Councillor expenses.

Other - Timeliness

In addition to the four categories requested by Councillor Ip, staff are highlighting one other item for review. We noted that within the current Councillor expense policy there

exists conflicting instructions for Councillors regarding the timeliness of submission. Under item 4.11 Timelines, Councillors are required to submit expense reports within 30 days after the end of each quarter; however, item 5.1.b under Roles and Responsibilities for Members of Council states to “submit expenses on a regular monthly timeline.” Not only would standard business and accounting practices suggest that submitting at least once a month is preferable, but by submitting 30 days after quarter end, such expenses may not comply with the Region’s quarterly financial reporting timelines.

Adding in staff processing time, a Councillor’s expenses, if submitted 30 days after quarter end, would miss the quarterly financial statement deadline and therefore also miss inclusion in the Region’s quarterly Open Data report posted on our website. (Dr. Sancton recommended “That staff publish the councillor expenses quarterly disclosures on the Niagara Regional Council webpage”; however, this is already required and currently occurs accordingly under Council expense policy item 4.11.b). Those expenses would then not be included on any reports until the subsequent quarter end (potentially up to six months after the expense was actually incurred).

Staff recommend updating the policy language to require Councillors submit expenses at least once per month to align with best practices and to meet financial reporting deadlines.

Alternatives Reviewed

Instead of accepting this report for information only, Council could choose to accept some or all of the following staff recommendations regarding updating language and processes within the Council expense policy:

1. That section 5.2 be updated to define that approval of Councillor expenses shall be delegated to the Regional Clerk for Councillors and to the CAO for the Regional Chair;
2. That section 5.3.b regarding Audit Committee responsibilities be updated to state that when staff are unable to make determinations regarding eligibility, expenses shall be forwarded for approval by the Audit Committee;
3. That a clause be added to section 4 stating that allowable expenses shall be limited to an overall annual amount for each Councillor and Regional Chair, to be set as part of the annual budgeting process for the Region;
4. That section 4.8 regarding Ineligible Expenses be updated to include reimbursement to mayors for the AMO and FCM conferences;

5. That the list of Eligible Expenses item 4.7.d is updated to include newsletters, specifically: “promotional material related to Regional Business, including newsletters”;
6. That language is added under Election Year Restrictions item 4.10 to clarify that “In an election year, no newsletters or promotional material shall be distributed or any expenses reimbursed relating to newsletters or promotional material from May 1 to the end of the Council term”;
7. That Legal Expenses item 4.9.a regarding Code of Conduct complaints is updated to state “Legal costs arising from or in any way related to complaints under the Code of Conduct are Ineligible Expenses”;
8. That mileage section 4.3.d.ii is updated to specify that the rate will be paid at one year behind the current year’s CRA rate;
9. That mileage section 4.3.d.i is updated to define an eligible trip as travel for “Regional business”, which is subsequently defined as “attendance at official Regional functions”, as well as to define that, with the exception of Regional Chair, a Councillor’s “normal work location” is not Regional headquarters;
10. That the per diem rate in 4.5.c is amended to \$75 and language added to increase the per diem rate based on the Consumer Price Index once per term of council;
11. That an item is added to the Meals/Per Diem section 4.5 to require that the names of all attendees and Regional business reason for the meeting must be listed on a meal receipt when claiming an actual meal expenditure instead of a per diem;
12. That the supporting documentation section 4.1 is updated to require that any expense claim includes a brief description of the nature of the Regional business;
13. That the supporting documentation section 4.1 is updated to require a Google Map printout (or equivalent) as backup to a mileage expense;
14. That the Timelines item 4.11.a is revised to require Councillors to submit expenses at least once every month; and
15. That staff be directed to formalize the expense submission process for Councillors, either with an updated Excel or PDF form (or equivalent), or with secure access to PeopleSoft Financials.

Relationship to Council Strategic Priorities

Though the current strategic priorities are under review, this report would tie to Advancing Organizational Excellence by improving expense transparency and streamlining processes.

Other Pertinent Reports

CL-C 64-2018 Niagara Region Independent External Governance Auditor Fact Book
COTW-C 04-2019 Niagara Region Independent External Governance Auditor Final Report

Prepared by:

Erin Amirault, MBA
Associate Director, Finance Operations
and Systems
Enterprise Resource Management
Services

Recommended by:

Todd Harrison, CPA, CMA
Commissioner/Treasurer
Enterprise Resource Management
Services

Submitted by:

Ron Tripp, P.Eng.
Acting Chief Administrative Officer

This report was prepared in consultation with Lyndsey Ferrell, Program Financial Specialist, Nora Charette, Manager ERP Business Support, and Ann-Marie Norio, Regional Clerk, and reviewed by Helen Chamberlain, Director, Financial Management & Planning/Deputy Treasurer and Donna Gibbs, Director, Legal & Court Services

Appendices

Appendix 1 C-RC-001 Regional Council Expense Policy

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

Page 1 of 7

Policy Owner	Administration – Corporate Services, Office of the Regional Clerk, Regional Clerk
Approval Body	Council
Approval Date	November 16, 2017
Effective Date	November 17, 2017
Review by Date	August 31, 2019

1. Policy

- 1.1. The Regional Council Expense Policy governs the reimbursement of expenses incurred by Members during activities related to the Regional Business of Niagara Region.

2. Purpose

- 2.1. The objective of this policy is to provide consistent rules and guidelines to Members with respect to Eligible Expenses incurred in performing their duties.
- 2.2. The policy provides specific and clear direction regarding diverse expenses, and clarifies what are Eligible Expenses and Ineligible Expenses.
- 2.3. The policy establishes the provision of public access to expense information of Members.
- 2.4. The policy captures the following principles:
 - a) Maintain Integrity of Council
 - i. The integrity of Council as a whole and the offices of the Members must be protected; and
 - ii. The interest of Council as a whole takes precedence over the personal interest of individual Members.
 - b) Maintain Accountability
 - i. Members are the stewards of resources and are ultimately accountable to the public for the type and level of expenses they incur;

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

- ii. Since members use public funds when they perform their duties, the public expects public funds to be used solely for fulfillment of their public duties;
 - iii. Members' expenses should be reasonable and reflect what the public expects of an elected official; and
 - iv. Members' personal expenses must be kept separate from expenses related to Regional Business.
- c) Maintain Transparency
 - i. The public has a right to know how public funds allocated to Members are spent; and
 - ii. The public's right to Members' expense information must be balanced against the need to protect personal information, and the need to allow time for proper account and reconciliation of expenses.

3. Scope

- 3.1. This policy applies to all Members and establishes the basis upon which the Members will be reimbursed or have payment coverage for Eligible Expenses incurred while undertaking activities related to Regional Business while acting in their role as an elected official.

4. Roles and Responsibilities

- 4.1. All expenses submitted for reimbursement must be accompanied by supporting documentation and itemized receipts, except for mileage.
- 4.2. Members may attend conferences, conventions, meetings and other events using allocated funds in the current budget for registration fees and Eligible Expenses.
- 4.3. Transportation
 - a) Members shall make every attempt to use the most economical and efficient mode of transportation including:
 - i. economy airfare, first class rail fare including taxi fares to and from terminals or parking where required, or
 - ii. mileage rate for personal automobile usage and parking, or
 - iii. rented automobile and actual fuel cost.
 - b) Members shall make efforts to share travel costs when travelling to the same destination.

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

- c) If a more expensive means of transportation is chosen, only the most economical equivalent charges will be allowed. For example, if a Member chooses to drive to a destination where it is more economical to use air transportation, only the equivalent air transportation charge will be permitted.
- d) Calculation of Mileage
 - i. Mileage calculation will be based on the lesser of the actual distance being either from the Member's home to the destination, or the distance from the Member's normal work location to the destination.
 - ii. The mileage rate applied will be in accordance with Canada Revenue Agency guidance.

4.4. Accommodation

- a) Where overnight accommodation is required, the single room rate will be paid and must be accompanied by appropriate receipts.

4.5. Meals/Per Diem

- a) A \$85.00 per diem rate represents the maximum that will be paid to each Member attending a conference, convention, or other event when an overnight stay is required.
- b) Where all meals are included in registration fees, the per diem rate is not applicable.
- c) Where some meals are included in registration fees, the allocation for included meals shall be deducted from the per diem using the following guideline:

Breakfast	\$15.00
Lunch	\$20.00
Dinner	\$35.00
Incidentals	<u>\$15.00</u>
	\$85.00

- d) There shall be no reimbursement for any meal expenditure incurred during the time that a Member is entitled to a per diem allowance.
- e) The daily rate allowance is to be calculated on a 24-hour basis and not a working day basis. It shall be paid from the time of leaving for the function until the time of arrival home, to the nearest 1/2 day.

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

Page 4 of 7

- f) Notwithstanding (b), (c) and (d), actual expenditures incurred may be reimbursed in lieu of the per diem rate; however, such expenditures must be reasonable in the circumstances based on the explanation provided by the Member which must accompany the receipt.
 - g) Members may be reimbursed for reasonable Eligible Expenses related to meals incurred during the course of Regional Business and shall include the following:
 - i. Meals while travelling on behalf of Niagara Region; or,
 - ii. Meals required where circumstances warrant.
- 4.6. Monetary exchange costs will be allowed at the prevailing rates in order to convert Canadian dollars to other currencies (primarily to U.S. dollars). Payment will be made to Members in Canadian dollars.
- 4.7. The following is a list, though not exhaustive, of Eligible Expenses:
- a) Memorabilia and souvenirs for constituents
 - b) Mobile devices in accordance with the current information technology mobile device policy. While engaged in Regional business, Members shall arrange an appropriate out of country mobile device plan in order to avoid excessive roaming charges.
 - c) Office supplies (e.g. paper, pens, printer cartridges, etc.)
 - d) Promotional material related to Regional Business
 - e) Subscriptions related to Regional Business or municipalities in general
 - f) A maximum of one ticket for a Member when representing Niagara Region at an event of a public nature (e.g. community dinners, events with proceeds going to charity, etc.).
 - g) 407 ETR, GO TRAIN ticket
 - h) Parking related expenses save and except parking fines.
- 4.8. The following is a list, though not exhaustive, of Ineligible Expenses
- a) Additional accommodation for days outside a formal Conference
 - b) Alcohol and alcoholic beverages are ineligible expenses unless purchased or provided as a matter of hospitality for protocol while conducting Regional Business
 - c) Mobile devices outside the current information technology mobile device policy
 - d) Companion registration fees and expenses at Conferences
 - e) Personal entertainment (e.g. sight-seeing, concerts, sporting events, etc.)
 - f) Personal services (e.g. shoe shine, valet service, spa treatments, etc.)
 - g) Personal vehicle costs beyond mileage (e.g. maintenance, repair, etc.)
 - h) Traffic and parking fines

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

4.9. Legal Expenses

- a) Legal costs arising from or in any way related to complaints under the Code of Conduct are Eligible Expenses.
- b) Legal costs related to personal conflict of interest opinions are Ineligible Expenses.
- c) Costs involving certain legal proceedings against Members shall be reimbursed in accordance with the current legal indemnification policy and are subject to review by the Audit Committee for recommendation to Council.
- d) Requests for reimbursement of legal costs outside this policy or the legal indemnification policy shall be submitted to the Audit Committee for recommendation to Council.

4.10. Election Year Restrictions

Note: Revision 1.0 - April 12, 2018, section 4.10 subsections (a) and (b) were repealed (see Report GM 5-2018).

Note: Revision 1.0 – April 12, 2018, section 4.10 was amended by adding the following clause (see Report GM 5-2018):

- c) Regional Councillors shall be directed by the *Use of Municipal Resources During the Election Campaign Period* policy.

4.11. Timelines

- a) Members shall submit quarterly expense reports with itemized receipts attached within 30 days after the end of each quarter to allow time for staff to verify and reconcile expenses before posting online; and
- b) Expense report information will be posted online on a quarterly basis and for a rolling period of 7 years plus current year.

5. Roles and Responsibilities

5.1. Members of Council

- a) Adhere to this policy;
- b) Submit expenses on a regular monthly timeline;
- c) Sign-off on all expenses submitted to or paid by Niagara Region;
- d) Meet all financial, legal and tax obligations; and,
- e) Consult with Regional Administrative staff for guidance with respect to the eligibility of an expense and/or any interpretation on the application of this policy.

5.2. Regional Administrative Staff

- a) Ensure consistent application of this policy;
- b) Process expenses in accordance with this policy;
- c) Ensure the supporting documentation is in place and that expenditures conform to this policy;

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

- d) Advise Members if any submitted or proposed expenditure is an Ineligible Expense or a breach of this policy;
 - e) Track actual expenses against approved budget; and
 - f) Each year, incorporate budget dollars in the annual budget for Council to consider for funding or reimbursing Members' Eligible Expenses
 - g) Complete the yearly Councillor Remuneration Report as required by the Act
- 5.3. Audit Committee
- a) Review any expenditures submitted by Members but not processed by Regional Administrative Staff as per this policy; and
 - b) Provide recommendation on reimbursement to Council who will make the final decision.

6. References and Related Documents

6.1 Legislation

- a) Section 283 of the Act provides the authority for councils to pass by-laws to pay remuneration and expenses to members of council and local boards.
- b) Section 284(1) of the Act requires that in each year, on or before March 31, the treasurer provide to council, a statement on remuneration and expenses paid to members of council and local boards in the previous year.
- c) Section 284(2) of the Act requires the identification of the by-law under which the remuneration or expenses were authorized.
- d) Council and board members' remuneration and expenses are provided for in the operating budget of Niagara Region, or the budget of the agency, board or commission.

6.2 By-Laws

- a) By-Law 2017-99

6.3 Related Policies

- a) Expenses – Reimbursement of Policy (Corporate Policy C3.E02)
- b) Training and Development - Approval for Workshops/Seminars/Conferences Policy (Corporate Policy C3.T01.7)

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

Page 7 of 7

7. Document Control

The electronic version of this document is recognized as the only valid version.

Approval History

Approver(s)	Approved Date	Effective Date
Council – Version 1.0	November 16, 2017	November 17, 2017
Council – Revision 1.0	April 12, 2018	April 12, 2018

Revision History

Revision No.	Date	Summary of Change(s)	Changed by
1.0	April 12, 2018	Section 4.10 clauses (a) and (b) were repealed. Section 4.10 was then amended by adding the existing clause.	Council, CL 5-2018, April 12, 2018

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

Policy Owner	Administration – Corporate Services, Office of the Regional Clerk, Regional Clerk
Approval Body	Council
Approval Date	November 16, 2018
Effective Date	November 17, 2018
Review by Date	August 31, 2019

1. Policy

- 1.1. The Regional Council Expense Policy governs the reimbursement of expenses incurred by Members during activities related to the Regional Business of Niagara Region.

2. Purpose

- 2.1. The objective of this policy is to provide consistent rules and guidelines to Members with respect to Eligible Expenses incurred in performing their duties.
- 2.2. The policy provides specific and clear direction regarding diverse expenses, and clarifies what are Eligible Expenses and Ineligible Expenses.
- 2.3. The policy establishes the provision of public access to expense information of Members.
- 2.4. The policy captures the following principles:
 - a) Maintain Integrity of Council
 - i. The integrity of Council as a whole and the offices of the Members must be protected; and
 - ii. The interest of Council as a whole takes precedence over the personal interest of individual Members.

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

b) Maintain Accountability

- i. Members are the stewards of resources and are ultimately accountable to the public for the type and level of expenses they incur;
- ii. Since members use public funds when they perform their duties, the public expects public funds to be used solely for fulfillment of their public duties;
- iii. Members' expenses should be reasonable and reflect what the public expects of an elected official; and
- iv. Members' personal expenses must be kept separate from expenses related to Regional Business.

c) Maintain Transparency

- i. The public has a right to know how public funds allocated to Members are spent; and
- ii. The public's right to Members' expense information must be balanced against the need to protect personal information, and the need to allow time for proper account and reconciliation of expenses.

3. Scope

- 3.1. This policy applies to all Members and establishes the basis upon which the Members will be reimbursed or have payment coverage for Eligible Expenses incurred while undertaking activities related to Regional Business while acting in their role as an elected official.

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

4. Roles and Responsibilities

- 4.1. All expenses submitted for reimbursement must include the following:
 - a) Itemized receipts
 - b) Supporting documentation, including:
 - i. A brief description of the nature of Regional business; and
 - ii. A Google map print out as back up to a mileage expense.
- 4.2. Members may attend conferences, conventions, meetings and other events using allocated funds in the current budget for registration fees and Eligible Expenses.
- 4.3. Approved expenses shall be limited to an annual amount for each Councillor and the Regional Chair, as per the applicable annual budget.
- 4.4. Transportation
 - a) Members shall make every attempt to use the most economical and efficient mode of transportation including:
 - i. economy airfare, first class rail fare including taxi fares to and from terminals or parking where required; or
 - ii. mileage rate for personal automobile usage and parking; or
 - iii. rented automobile and actual fuel cost.
 - b) Members shall make efforts to share travel costs when travelling to the same destination.
 - c) If a more expensive means of transportation is chosen, only the most economical equivalent charges will be allowed. For example, if a Member chooses to drive to a destination where it is more economical to use air transportation, only the equivalent air transportation charge will be permitted.

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

d) Calculation of Mileage

- i. Mileage will be reimbursed for trips related to Regional business (specifically, for attendance at official Regional functions) and calculation will be based on the lesser of the actual distance from the Member's home to the destination, or the distance from the Member's normal work location (Regional headquarters is the normal work location for the Regional Chair only) to the destination; and
- ii. The mileage rate applied will be one year behind the current year's Canadian Revenue Agency (CRA) rate.

4.5. Accommodation

- a) Where overnight accommodation is required, the single room rate will be paid and must be accompanied by appropriate receipts.

4.6. Meals/Per Diem

- a) A \$75.00 per diem rate represents the maximum that will be paid to each Member attending a conference, convention, or other event when an overnight stay is required.
- b) Where all meals are included in registration fees, the per diem rate is not applicable.
- c) Where some meals are included in registration fees, the allocation for included meals shall be deducted from the per diem using the following guideline:

Breakfast	\$15.00
Lunch	\$20.00
Dinner	\$30.00
Incidentals	<u>\$10.00</u>
	\$75.00

- d) There shall be no reimbursement for any meal expenditure incurred during the time that a Member is entitled to a per diem allowance.
- e) The daily rate allowance is to be calculated on a 24-hour basis and not a working day basis. It shall be paid from the time of leaving for the function until the time of arrival home, to the nearest 1/2 day.

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

- f) Notwithstanding (b), (c) and (d), actual expenditures incurred may be reimbursed in lieu of the per diem rate; however, such expenditures must be reasonable in the circumstances and Members must provide the names of all attendees and Regional business reason for the meeting on the meal receipt.
 - g) Members may be reimbursed for reasonable Eligible Expenses related to meals incurred during the course of Regional Business and shall include the following:
 - i. Meals while travelling on behalf of Niagara Region; or,
 - ii. Meals required where circumstances warrant.
 - h) The per diem rate may increase once per term of council based on the Consumer Price Index.
- 4.7. Monetary exchange costs will be allowed at the prevailing rates in order to convert Canadian dollars to other currencies (primarily to U.S. dollars). Payment will be made to Members in Canadian dollars.
- 4.8. The following is a list, though not exhaustive, of Eligible Expenses:
- a) Memorabilia and souvenirs for constituents;
 - b) Mobile devices in accordance with the current information technology mobile device policy. While engaged in Regional business, Members shall arrange an appropriate out of country mobile device plan in order to avoid excessive roaming charges;
 - c) Office supplies (e.g. paper, pens, printer cartridges, etc.);
 - d) Promotional material related to Regional Business, including newsletters;
 - e) Subscriptions related to Regional Business or municipalities in general;
 - f) A maximum of one ticket for a Member when representing Niagara Region at an event of a public nature (e.g. community dinners, events with proceeds going to charity, etc.);
 - g) 407 ETR, public transportation ticket;
 - h) Parking related expenses save and except parking fines.

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

4.9. The following is a list, though not exhaustive, of Ineligible Expenses:

- a) Additional accommodation for days outside a formal Conference;
- b) Alcohol and alcoholic beverages are ineligible expenses unless purchased or provided as a matter of hospitality for protocol while conducting Regional Business;
- c) Mobile devices outside the current information technology mobile device policy;
- d) Companion registration fees and expenses at Conferences;
- e) Reimbursement to mayors for Association of Municipalities of Ontario (AMO) and Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM) Conferences;
- f) Personal entertainment (e.g. sight-seeing, concerts, sporting events, etc.);
- g) Personal services (e.g. shoe shine, valet service, spa treatments, etc.);
- h) Personal vehicle costs beyond mileage (e.g. maintenance, repair, etc.);
- i) Traffic and parking fines.

4.10. Legal Expenses

- a) Legal costs arising from or in any way related to complaints under the Code of Conduct are Ineligible Expenses.
- b) Legal costs related to personal conflict of interest opinions are Ineligible Expenses.
- c) Costs involving certain legal proceedings against Members shall be reimbursed in accordance with the current legal indemnification policy and are subject to review by the Audit Committee for recommendation to Council; and
- d) Requests for reimbursement of legal costs outside this policy or the legal indemnification policy shall be submitted to the Audit Committee for recommendation to Council.

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

4.11. Election Year Restrictions

Note: Revision 1.0 - April 12, 2018, section 4.10 subsections (a) and (b) were repealed (see Report GM 5-2018).

Note: Revision 1.0 – April 12, 2018, section 4.10 was amended by adding the following clause (see Report GM 5-2018):

- c) Regional Councillors shall be directed by the *Use of Municipal Resources During the Election Campaign Period* policy.
- d) In an election year, no newsletters or promotional materials shall be distributed nor any expenses reimbursed relating to newsletters or promotional material from May 1 to the end of the Council term.

4.12. Timelines

- a) Members shall submit monthly expense reports with itemized receipts attached within five (5) days after the end of each month to allow time for staff to verify and reconcile expenses before posting online.
- b) Expense report information will be posted online on a quarterly basis and for a rolling period of 7 years plus current year.

5. Roles and Responsibilities

5.1. Members of Council

- a) Adhere to this policy
- b) Submit expenses on a regular monthly timeline
- c) Sign-off on all expenses submitted to or paid by Niagara Region
- d) Meet all financial, legal and tax obligations
- e) Consult with Regional Administrative staff for guidance with respect to the eligibility of an expense and/or any interpretation on the application of this policy.

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

5.2. Regional Administrative Staff

- a) Ensure consistent application of this policy
- b) Process expenses in accordance with this policy
- c) Ensure the supporting documentation is in place and that expenditures conform to this policy
- d) Advise Members if any submitted or proposed expenditure is an Ineligible Expense or a breach of this policy
- e) Track actual expenses against approved budget
- f) Each year, incorporate budget dollars in the annual budget for Council to consider for funding or reimbursing Members' Eligible Expenses
- g) Complete the yearly Councillor Remuneration Report as required by the *Municipal Act, 2001*
- h) Approval of Councillor expenses shall be delegated to the Regional Clerk for Councillors and to the CAO for the Regional Chair

5.3. Role of Audit Committee

- a) Consider reimbursements forwarded from staff when they are unable to determine eligibility;
- b) Consider reimbursements from Members when they are in disagreement with staff determination of eligibility;
- c) Review costs involving legal proceedings against Members to ensure they are reimbursed in accordance with the current Legal Indemnification Policy as required;
- d) Consider any requests for reimbursement of legal costs that fall outside of this policy or the Legal Indemnification Policy; and
- e) Provide recommendation(s) to Council respecting reimbursements.

<i>Policy Category</i>	<i>Name of Policy</i>
<i>Regional Council</i>	<i>Regional Council Expense Policy</i>

6. References and Related Documents

6.1 Legislation

- a) Section 283 of the *Municipal Act, 2001*, provides the authority for councils to pass by-laws to pay remuneration and expenses to members of council and local boards
- b) Section 284(1) of the *Municipal Act, 2001*, requires that in each year, on or before March 31, the treasurer provide to council, a statement on remuneration and expenses paid to members of council and local boards in the previous year
- c) Section 284(2) of the *Municipal Act, 2001*, requires the identification of the by-law under which the remuneration or expenses were authorized
- d) Council and board members' remuneration and expenses are provided for in the operating budget of Niagara Region, or the budget of the agency, board or commission.

6.2 By-Laws

- a) By-Law 2017-99

6.3 Related Policies

- a) Expenses – Reimbursement of Policy (Corporate Policy C3.E02)
- b)

Current Wording	New wording	Added Provisions
<p>Section 4.1: All expenses submitted for reimbursement must be accompanied by supporting documentation and itemized receipts, except for mileage.</p>	<p>4.1. All expenses submitted for reimbursement must include the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a) Itemized receipts b) Supporting documentation, including: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i. A brief description of the nature of Regional business; and ii. A Google map print out as back up to a mileage expense. 	
		<p>Roles and Responsibilities ADD: Approved expenses shall be limited to an annual amount for each Councillor and the Regional Chair, as per the applicable annual budget.</p>
<p>Section 4.3: d) Calculation of Mileage i) Mileage calculation will be based on the lesser of the actual distance being either from the Member's home to the destination, or the distance from the Member's normal work location to the destination. ii) The mileage rate applied will be in accordance with Canada Revenue Agency guidance.</p>	<p>d) Calculation of Mileage i. Mileage will be reimbursed for trips related to Regional business (specifically, for attendance at official Regional functions) and calculation will be based on the lesser of the actual distance from the Member's home to the destination, or the distance from the Member's normal work location (Regional headquarters is the normal work location for the Regional Chair only) to the destination; and ii. The mileage rate applied will be one year behind the current year's Canadian Revenue Agency (CRA) rate.</p>	

Amendments to the Regional Council Expense Policy

Current Wording	New wording	Added Provisions
<p>Section 4.5 – Per Diem amount \$85.00</p> <p>Breakfast \$15.00</p> <p>Lunch \$20.00</p> <p>Dinner \$35.00</p> <p>Incidentals \$15.00</p>	<p>New Per Diem:</p> <p>Breakfast \$15.00</p> <p>Lunch \$20.00</p> <p>Dinner \$30.00</p> <p>Incidentals \$10.00</p> <p>Total \$75.00</p>	
<p>Section 4.5 (f)</p> <p>f) Notwithstanding (b), (c), and (d), actual expenditures incurred may be reimbursed in lieu of the per diem rate; however, such expenditures must be reasonable in the circumstances based on the explanation provided by the Member which must accompany the receipt.</p>	<p>f) Notwithstanding (b), (c) and (d), actual expenditures incurred may be reimbursed in lieu of the per diem rate; however, such expenditures must be reasonable in the circumstances and Members must provide the names of all attendees and Regional business reason for the meeting on the meal receipt.</p>	
		<p>Meals/Per Diem</p> <p>ADD:</p> <p>Monetary exchange costs will be allowed at the prevailing rates in order to convert Canadian dollars to other currencies (primarily to U.S. dollars). Payment will be made to Members in Canadian dollars.</p>

Amendments to the Regional Council Expense Policy

Current Wording	New wording	Added Provisions
<p>Section 4.8:</p> <p>d) Promotional material related to Regional Business</p> <p>g) 407 ETR, GO TRAIN ticket</p>	<p>d) Promotional material related to Regional Business, including newsletters;</p> <p>g) 407 ETR, public transportation ticket;</p>	
		<p>Ineligible Expenses:</p> <p>ADD - Reimbursement to mayors for Association of Municipalities of Ontario (AMO) and Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM) Conferences;</p>
<p>Section 4.9 Legal Expenses:</p> <p>a) Legal costs arising from or in any way related to complaints under the Code of Conduct are Eligible Expenses.</p>	<p>Legal costs arising from or in any way related to complaints under the Code of Conduct are Ineligible Expenses.</p>	

Amendments to the Regional Council Expense Policy

Current Wording	New wording	Added Provisions
d) Requests for reimbursement of legal costs outside this policy or the legal indemnification policy shall be submitted to the Audit Committee for recommendation to Council.	d) Requests for reimbursement of legal costs outside this policy or the legal indemnification policy may be submitted to the Audit Committee for recommendation to Council.	
		<p>Election Year Restrictions ADD:</p> <p>d) In an election year, no newsletters or promotional materials shall be distributed nor any expenses reimbursed relating to newsletters or promotional material from May 1 to the end of the Council term.</p>
<p>Section 4.11:</p> <p>a) Members shall submit quarterly expense reports with itemized receipts attached within 30 days after the end of each quarter to allow time for staff to verify and reconcile expenses before posting online; and</p>	<p>a) Members shall submit monthly expense reports with itemized receipts attached within five (5) days after the end of each month to allow time for staff to verify and reconcile expenses before posting online.</p>	

Current Wording	New wording	Added Provisions
		<p>Regional Administrative Staff ADD: Approval of Councillor expenses shall be delegated to the Regional Clerk for Councillors and to the CAO for the Regional Chair</p>
<p>Audit Committee</p> <p>a) Review any expenditures submitted by Members but not processed by Regional Administrative Staff as per this policy</p> <p>b) Provide recommendation(s) on reimbursement to Council who will make the final decision</p> <p>c) Consider reimbursements forwarded from staff when they are unable to determine eligibility.</p>		<p>a) Consider reimbursements forwarded from staff when they are unable to determine eligibility;</p> <p>b) Consider reimbursements from Members when they are in disagreement with staff determination of eligibility;</p> <p>c) Review costs involving legal proceedings against Members to ensure they are reimbursed in accordance with the current Legal Indemnification Policy as required;</p> <p>d) Consider any requests for reimbursement of legal costs that fall outside of this policy or the Legal Indemnification Policy; and</p> <p>e) Provide recommendation(s) to Council respecting reimbursements.</p>

MEMORANDUM

PBLRC-C 3 -2019

Subject: Comparison of Bourinot's Rules of Order and Robert's Rules of Order

Date: June 17, 2019

To: Procedural By-law Review Committee

From: Ann-Mare Norio, Regional Clerk

At its meeting held on April 10, 2019, the Procedural By-law Review Committee requested that staff prepare a comparison chart of the parliamentary procedures from Bourinot's Rules of Order and Robert's Rules of Order for Committee's information.

The comparison table of these parliamentary procedures is attached as Appendix 1 to this memorandum.

Respectfully submitted and signed by

Ann-Marie Norio
Regional Clerk

Appendices

Appendix I Differences between Bourinot's Rules of Order and Robert's Rules of Order

Differences between Bourinot's Rules of Order and Robert's Rules of Order

Action	Bourinot's Rules of Order (BRO)				Robert's Rules of Order (RRO)			
	Interrupt?	Second?	Debate?	Amend?	Interrupt?	Second?	Debate?	Amend?
End debate on item	1) No 2) No	1) Yes 2) Yes	1) Yes 2) No	1) No 2) No	No	Yes	No	No
Comments:	<p>BRO references two way to end debate on a motion. First, motions on which question is called will be debated at the next meeting if the motion fails. E.g. "I call the question, will the Niagara Region spend \$1.00? If the motion fails, it will be debated at the following meeting. Similar to postponing/deferring an item. Second, a motion to have Council proceed to the next order of business by administering a vote. This requires majority.</p> <p>RRO references one way to end debate on a motion: "I call the question". This requires a 2/3 majority vote in order to proceed.</p>							
Consider item out of order	No	Yes	No	No	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Comments:	While BRO requires a majority vote, RRO requires a 2/3 vote to amend the agenda.							
Postpone discussion on item until more desirable time	No	Yes	Yes, time only	Yes	1) No 2) No	1) Yes 2) Yes	1) Yes 2) Yes	1) No 2) Yes
Comments:	<p>BRO writes that discussion can be postponed to a specific date or indefinitely. It requires a majority vote.</p> <p>RRO references two ways to postpone: (1) <i>indefinitely</i> or (2) <i>definitely</i>. (1) <i>Indefinitely</i> requires a majority vote and postpones the item to an unspecified date rather than formally approving or rejected it. (2) <i>Definitely</i> requires a majority vote and moves the item to the next meeting.</p>							
Postpone consideration of item to address urgent business	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No	No
Comments:	While BRO allows for debate, RRO moves right to a vote if seconded. Both procedures require a majority vote.							
Enquire about procedure/consequences	Yes	No	Yes, point only	No	Yes	No	No	No
Comments:	BRO requires a member to say "Point of Order", and allows for debate specific to the enquiry. No vote is taken, chair rules on the decision. RRO requires a member to say "Point of Parliamentary Procedure", and does not allow for debate. No vote is taken, the Regional Clerk or delegate will provide information being requested.							
Object to incorrect procedure	Yes	No	Yes, point only	No	Yes	No	No	No
Comments:	While BRO allows for debate, RRO does not. The chair rules on the decision for both procedures.							

Differences between Bourinot's Rules of Order and Robert's Rules of Order

Other Notable Differences:

- **RRO** specifies that there are four types of motions and are listed in the following rank (all of which take precedence over the other):
 1. Privileged motions
 2. Incidental motions
 3. Main motions
 4. Subsidiary motions
- **BRO** allows for members to reconsider a motion that has failed. It requires a 2/3 majority vote and can be debated. The motion would then be considered at the next meeting and written notice of motion must then be provided by the specific member, advising that the matter will be readdressed at the next meeting. **RRO** allows for motions to be reconsidered. However, reconsiderations can only be made on the day the vote to be reconsidered was taken, or on the next succeeding day, a legal holiday, or recess not being counted as a day. The motion to reconsider must be put forward by a member who voted on the prevailing side and any member may second it. It can be made while any other question is pending, even if another member has the floor. The motion to reconsider cannot be amended, postponed *indefinitely*, or committed. If the motion to reconsider is postponed *definitely*, the question to be reconsidered and all adhering questions go with it.
- **RRO** allows for members to limit or extend limits of debate by achieving a 2/3 majority vote. E.g. "I move that members be allowed to speak a third time in debate on the main motion". It requires a second and can be amended. It cannot be debated.
- **RRO** allows for a "Division of Question" by achieving a majority vote. Members may move that a motion be divided into two separate paragraphs, both requiring their own vote. It requires a second and can be amended. This can only be applied to main motions and amendments.

MEMORANDUM

PBLRC-C 4-2019

Subject: Comparison of Municipal Procedural By-laws

Date: June 17, 2019

To: Procedural By-law Review Committee

From: Ann-Marie Norio, Regional Clerk

At the Procedural by-law Review Committee meeting held on April 10, 2019, the Committee requested staff provide information respecting a comparison of Niagara Region's Procedural By-law and the procedures from similar-sized municipalities in Ontario as well as Niagara's local area municipalities.

The comparison table of Niagara's 12 local area municipalities is attached as Appendix 1 to this memorandum.

The comparison table of procedural by-laws from similar-sized municipalities in Ontario is attached as Appendix 2 to this memorandum. Staff were able to obtain and review the by-laws from the following municipalities:

- Durham Region (upper tier)
- City of Vaughan (lower tier)
- Peel Region (upper tier)
- York Region (upper tier)
- City of Hamilton (single tier)
- Halton Region (upper tier)

The by-laws were compared based on the following categories:

- | | |
|--------------------------------------|--|
| • curfew | • recorded votes |
| • quorum lost / regained | • other business listed as agenda item |
| • chair, ex-officio | • cancellation of meetings |
| • speaking length / number of times | • notice of motions |
| • presentations / delegations | • points of order |
| • chair voting / head of Council | • points of privilege |
| • reconsiderations | • votes requiring 2/3 majority |
| • code of conduct attached to by-law | • requirements to amend the by-law |
| • definitions of committee | • inaugural |
| • mechanisms to limit debate | |

Respectfully submitted and signed by

Ann-Marie Norio,
Regional Clerk

Appendices

**Appendix I Procedural By-law Review Comparison Table of Local Area
Municipalities**

**Appendix II Procedural By-law Review Comparison Table, Municipal
Comparators**

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart - Local Area Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Fort Erie (2016)	Grimsby (2007)	Lincoln (2015)	Niagara Falls (2019)	Niagara-on-the-Lake (2019)	Pelham (2013)	Port Colborne (2015)	St. Catharines (2015)	Thorold (2017)	Wainfleet (2016)	Welland (2017)	West Lincoln (2013)
Curfew	10:30 p.m. with extension to 11:00 p.m. with vote of majority of members	10:00 p.m., unless extended by a majority vote of the Members of Council present.	11:00 p.m. unless extended by a majority vote of the Members of Council present. (Sec 2.5) The Mayor shall declare a Council meeting adjourned at 11 00 pm if the meeting is in session at that hour unless otherwise determined by a unanimous vote of the Members present (Sec. 5.22)	11:00 pm, and if required to complete all agenda items, the meeting shall be reconvened at 7:00 p.m., the following day or at such other time as may be agreed upon.	11:00 p.m. unless affirmative recorded vote	10:30 p.m. unless 2/3 affirmative vote to extend	10:00 p.m. with 30 minute extension requires 2/3 vote	11:00 p.m. unless majority vote to extend	10:30 p.m. unless 2/3 vote to extend 30 minutes, must be unanimous for further extensions	10:00 p.m., requires 2/3 to go beyond. Not allowed beyond 11:00	11:00 p.m. unless approved by majority of members present	11:00 p.m. with one half hour extension allowed if Council agrees by 2/3 majority vote	11:00 p.m. unless extended by consenting vote of not less than 2/3 of the Members of Council. Can only extend to midnight
Quorum - lost or regained	30 minutes to start meeting, 15 to regain	30 minutes to start meeting, silent on time to regain	15 minutes to start meeting, silent on time to regain	30 minutes to start, silent on time to regain	30 minutes to start, 15 min to regain	15 minutes to start, silent to regain	30 minutes to start meeting, 15 to regain	15 minutes to start meeting, silent to regain	20 minutes to start, silent to regain	15 minutes to start, silent to regain	10 minutes to start	silent	30 minutes to start
Chair Ex-Officio	Yes	Yes	silent	silent	Yes	silent	silent	silent	silent	silent	silent	Yes	silent
Speaking Length/Number of Times	10 minutes, can only speak once to a matter at Council unless 2/3 vote, Committee - no limit on number of speaking times or amount of time	COTW - unlimited number of times to speak. In Council, can only speak a second time if everyone who wants to speak has spoken, can't speak more than twice, 5 minute limit unless Council consent	no limit to number of speaking times in Committee, 15 minute time limit at Council, can't speak for second time unless all wanting to speak have spoken and leave is granted	silent	15 minute time limit unless leave of Council	Cannot speak more than once, without leave of Presiding Officer. Limit of 10 minutes.	COTW - no limit to number of times or length of time, Council 5 minute limit and can only speak once unless leave of Council	10 minute limit to speak, speak only once until every member who wants to speak has spoken	speak only once and 5 minute limit unless permitted by Mayor	5 minutes to speak, and will be given the option of an additional 5 after every Councillor has been allowed to speak, and after a 2/3 vote of Council	10 minute limit unless leave of Council	shall not speak more than twice without leave, 5 minute limit	can only speak a second time if all others have spoken; 10 minute limit unless leave of Chair; unlimited time in Committee unless Chair feels no new points of view are being brought up
Delegations / Presentations	10 minute limit, unless otherwise determined by the Chair. A delegation of not more than five (5) persons, representing a group or organization, shall be limited to two (2) speakers, permitted to speak not more than 10 minutes in total. Only new information is to be presented by successive speakers of such delegation.	Delegations 10 minute limit, unless extended by majority vote. Requests in to Clerk by 3:00 p.m. on Thurs before meeting. Council can refuse to hear delegation if matter is beyond jurisdiction of Council. If matter is operational or administrative, directed to CAO or director first to discuss issue.	not speak longer than ten minutes unless permitted to speak beyond that limit by the Chair, if more than 5 people only 2 can speak for total 10 minutes	Delegations 5 minutes, presentations 10 exclusive of the time required to answer questions from Council or Committee, to address Council or Committee. Only at Council if matter on Council agenda, not enough time to get on Committee agenda, local organization or community group not asking for anything and the presentation would enhance the Council meeting	Delegation or Appointments - 5 minutes unless permitted to speak, unless by majority vote; maximum of 5 appointments permitted; may appear before council by majority vote	10 minute limit, allowed at Council and COTW. Requests given to Clerk no later than 12 pm on Thurs prior to COTW or Council. Only new information permitted if spoken at previous COTW or Council.	only at Council for matters on the agenda, if beyond jurisdiction directed by Clerk to most appropriate authority, 10 minute limit unless Chair allows longer, must provide new information if have presented before, Clerk in consultation with Mayor/CAO has authority to refuse request if outside jurisdiction, contrary to town policies or public interest	2 types identified - individuals appearing to receive a reward or recognition or consultants, external partners, or City staff asked by the CAO to give a verbal report to provide clarification. Time limit and number same as delegations shall appear before Committee instead of Council, limited to 3 at any one meeting, 10 minute time limit, if previously appeared can only give new information, can be refused if outside jurisdiction of municipality	Presentations before council shall be held at special ceremony held at 6:16 pm, not limited to Council presentations for sports awards and community recognition, staff presentations allowed but by request of the CAO to provide clarification for a report that is on the agenda Delegation - shall pertain to a matter within the Council's statutory jurisdiction, Clerk authorized to refuse delegations not related to matters on the agenda, 5 minute limit, Chair can extend, can hear delegate not on agenda by 2/3 vote	10 minute limit for delegations and presentations, can be extended by majority vote. 5 minutes for public meeting. Request must be given to Clerk by Tuesday at 4:30 one week in advance of the meeting	defined in PBL - no more than 4 separate delegations per meeting, 10 minute limit, if appearing for a second time must present new information	Delegations only allowed at General Committee, unless speaking on a matter on a Council agenda.no more than 5 per meeting, ranked according priority in Schedule A of PBL, 10 minute time limit, with 5 minute limit to answer questions	persons and consultants invited to attend to present findings to a specific item may exceed the 10 minute limit and appear more than once If Clerk and or Mayor feels content falls within authority of Committee, will be directed there. No more than 4 per agenda without approval from Chair, 10 minute limit excluding time to answer questions, may be extended by 10 minutes with majority vote of members present. If already appeared, must present new information

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart - Local Area Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Fort Erie (2016)	Grimsby (2007)	Lincoln (2015)	Niagara Falls (2019)	Niagara-on-the-Lake (2019)	Pelham (2013)	Port Colborne (2015)	St. Catharines (2015)	Thorold (2017)	Wainfleet (2016)	Welland (2017)	West Lincoln (2013)
Chair Voting/Head of Council	to break tie only at Council, Committee Chairs only if recorded vote	yes	Mayor may vote on a motion but shall not have a second or casting vote in the event of an equality of votes on any question. At Committee may determine to vote on any matter, vote shall be signified after the votes of each member voting	yes	yes	yes	yes	yes but shall not have a second or casting vote in the event of an equality of votes on any question	at Mayor's discretion to vote, but must vote when a recorded vote	silent	only noted under recorded vote that Chair shall vote on all questions	Only to break a tie vote or on recorded vote	yes
Reconsiderations	at Council, member has to vote in majority, present Notice of Motion to reconsider the matter, referred to next Council meeting and included on agenda, requires approval of 2/3 of Council present, matter can't be reconsidered more than once, matter to be reconsidered may be next order of business or referred to another meeting	must have voted on the prevailing side, must give notice of motion to reconsider, no matter or motion is reconsidered by Council more than once during a period of 12 months following the date on which the original matter was decided. Must be carried by majority of all members present. (instances where reconsideration not allowed listed in Sec 16.1)	given by a Member who voted with the majority on the particular question, must give notice of such motion to reconsider at the same Council meeting at which the decision on the matter was made, may immediately upon notice been given vote whether or not such notice or reconsideration be entertained, matter can only be reconsidered once	at any Regular Council Meeting within one (1)year after a question has been decided by Council, a Member may present a Notice of Motion to Reconsider such matter. Such Notice of Motion shall be referred to the next available meeting of Council. After one year period elapses, can give notice to reconsider, done at next meeting, only requires majority approval	Must be moved and seconded by members that voted with the majority. Requires 2/3 vote. Cannot reconsider motions of previous Councils. Must be made by Notice of Motion	if made at same meeting, give notice in writing for reconsideration, need affirmative vote of 2/3 of members, can only be reconsidered once. If member was absent, can provide notice at next meeting	any motion can be reconsidered if the minority vote comprised not less than 1/3, must be done at same meeting and give notice for next meeting, may be introduced by notice of motion, can only be reconsidered once	must have voted with prevailing side, give notice to reconsider, reconsideration heard at next meeting, only be reconsidered once	notice of motion from member who voted with prevailing side, needs 2/3, only reconsidered once, Sec D 8.2 lists times a reconsideration motion does not apply	Can only reconsider decisions made within current term of Council. Only done by Councillor present at the meeting and voted in the majority, or who was not present when the decision was made. Done through Notice of Motion. Requires 2/3. Debate on the reconsideration allowed. If passed, reconsideration will become next order of business unless motion included direction to postpone reconsideration to a definitive date. Decisions can only be reconsidered once.	Must be given by a Member who voted with the majority on the particular question and such Motion must be given within 12 months of the original Motion. Requires majority vote. Can only be reconsidered once.	member must have voted in opposition, can't be reconsidered in subsequent 12 months unless after 2 subsequent meetings, 2/3 majority vote of those members present at either meeting	must be made by member who voted in majority, given at same meeting or next meeting that the decision was made at, can be put forward again after 12 months have elapsed from the last date that the matter or question was dealt with.
Code of Conduct attached to PBL	yes	no	no	no	no	yes	no	no	no	no	no	no	no
Definition of Committee	means any Standing, Ad Hoc, Steering or Advisory Committee, Sub-Committee or board and any other similar group composed of individuals appointed by Council, or similar entity established by Council and composed of members	Not defined	Not defined	Established by Council, including any advisory, other committee, subcommittee, or similar entity of which at least 50 % of the members are also members of one or more councils.	Any board, commission or committee established by Council, which has at least one (1) Member appointed from Council. The Member(s) appointed by Council may be Member(s), staff of the City, and/or member(s) of the public	Shall mean a committee appointed by Council	"Committee of Council" means COTW, all Standing Committees, any ad hoc committee where at least 50% of the members of the ad hoc committee are members (of council)or members of a local board	means the Committee of Whole of the City which consists of all members of council	means any advisory or other committee, subcommittee, standing or special committee or similar entity established by Council, of which at least fifty per cent of the members are also members of one or more councils or local boards.	Not defined	means any advisory or other committee, subcommittee or similar entity created by Council.	means any advisory or other committee, subcommittee or similar entity of which at least 50% of the members are also members of one or more councils or local boards	means any advisory or other committee, sub-committee or similar entity, including Standing Committees, of which at least 50% of the members are also members of Council or as specified in approved Terms of Reference.
Mechanisms to limit debate	Call the question - has to be next speaker, requires a majority vote	Call the question – requires 2/3 vote, which if granted immediately puts the motion to a vote.	any Member may request the Mayor to put the question for a vote	that the vote now be taken - no explanation	Call the question - called by any Member, at any time during debate, provided all Members have had a chance to speak once to the Motion on the floor. Requires 2/3 vote.	"previous question" - debate closed and vote taken immediately, not allowed in Committee, needs 2/3	"previous question" - not allowed in COTW, can only be moved in the following words "that the question be now put"	call the question	call the question	silent	Motion that the vote now be taken (close debate)	"previous question"	"previous question" only allowed after all members have had opportunity to make submission

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart - Local Area Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Fort Erie (2016)	Grimsby (2007)	Lincoln (2015)	Niagara Falls (2019)	Niagara-on-the-Lake (2019)	Pelham (2013)	Port Colborne (2015)	St. Catharines (2015)	Thorold (2017)	Wainfleet (2016)	Welland (2017)	West Lincoln (2013)
Recorded votes	allowed in Committee, Council and COTW	a recorded vote is taken when requested by any Member or when required by law, not allowed in Council-in-Committee	allowed in Council and Committee	allowed in Council and Committee	Allowed in Council and Committee	only at Council	allowed at Council, Committee of Council, not allowed at COTW	allowed in Council only, must be requested prior to taking of vote	specific provisions for when recorded votes are required Sec B19	Allowed in Council and Committee	allowed in Council	allowed in Council and Committee	allowed in Council and Committee
Other Business listed as agenda item	yes, not defined	new business/enquiries	yes	no, but has announcements	Yes, not defined	new business, also members announcements	new business, member's reports (which must be included with agenda	no	not noted in PBL	no	yes	no	yes but notes should be kept to a minimum
Cancellation of Meetings	silent	when circumstances warrant the Mayor may cancel a meeting, in consultation with senior staff; notice given to staff and to the public online	silent	silent	silent	if Lord Mayor determines there is insufficient business on the agenda to justify holding of a scheduled meeting, Lord Mayor has authority to cancel	mayor in consultation with CAO and Clerk may cancel any meeting for justifiable reasons	where circumstances warrant, the Mayor may, in consultation with the Clerk and or CAO cancel a meeting	silent	Clerk may cancel if quorum will not be available at a meeting. Clerk to provide notice.	Discretion of the Mayor, and the Clerk shall advise Council.	silent	Subject to required public notice, and where circumstances warrant, the Mayor and/or Chair may cancel a meeting
Notice of Motion	shall be presented at a meeting of Council, but shall not be debated until the next regular meeting OR delivered to the Clerk not less than 7 days prior to the date of the meeting at which the motion is to be introduced, can be introduced without notice if Council dispenses with notice requirement and 2/3 vote	will not entertain any motion to introduce new business unless; notice was given at the last regular Council meeting, or Council dispenses with notice by a majority vote of all the Members of Council present.	is required for motions being raised by any Member who wishes to introduce a motion at Council which affects policies or procedures, shall be in writing, given to Clerk at the close of the meeting at which Notice is given. Not debatable until next regularly scheduled Council meeting	silent	silent	introduced at Council or COTW for consideration at next or subsequent meeting and shall be included in the notice of meeting at which it is to be considered, if no notice given can be introduced as new business unless for appropriation of money, appointment to office unless 2/3 vote	must be given 3 calendar days before meeting (excluding weekend and holidays) shall be printed in full on the agenda, notice may be waived on affirmative vote of 2/3 members present and voting	will not consider any motion regarding new business unless was given at last meeting or a motion to dispense with notice is passed by majority vote. After providing notice, must provide motion in writing to Clerk to be included in the agenda for the meeting that the motion is for	introduced at any meeting and unless otherwise directed by Mayor, be included on agenda for next meeting or given 1 business day prior to the publishing of the agenda to the Clerk, the placing of it on the agenda constitutes notice	Must be made verbally at the meeting and provided to the Clerk in writing one week in advance of the meeting. Failing to do so, will result in a delay to the next meeting. If at the third meeting such Notice of Motion is called from the Chair and not proceeded with, it shall be deemed to have been withdrawn. Notices of Motion can be done without notice with 2/3 vote	A notice of motion can be delivered verbally at one cycle of Council and upon being delivered in writing at the next cycle of Council can be discussed and voted on.	introduced at meeting for consideration at next meeting or given to Clerk in writing no later than noon the Monday the week prior to the meeting, reviewed by Clerk and placed on next agenda	items of business that require immediate attention and direction from Council must be introduced by a motion to introduce a new item of business; passed by a majority vote of the members present. New items must be introduced under the "New Item of Business" section on the agenda.
Points of Order	Can ask leave of Chair to raise a question of privilege or point of order, after recognition, shall state point and it shall be immediately decided by Chair, ruling shall be final subject to immediate appeal by member, member shall state grounds for appeal, appeal must be decided without debate by concurring votes of a majority. When member called to order by Chair, member shall cease speaking until point of order is dealt with, cannot speak again to the matter, without permission of the Chair, unless to appeal	When a Member of Council wants to call attention to a violation of these rules, the member may raise a point of order. Upon recognition by the Chair, the Member states the point of order succinctly and the Chair decides upon the point of order. Unless a Member of Council immediately appeals the Chair's decision to the Council, the decision of the Chair is final.	can raise point of order if feels a deviation or departure from the matter under consideration and the current discussion is not within the scope of the proposed Motion, Mayor shall decide and state the point of order, Member shall only address the Mayor to appeal the Mayor's decision to Council, if no appeals the decision of the Mayor shall be final. If appealed Council majority decision is final.	no specific section, all points of order decided by Chair in accordance with the rules of parliamentary law as contained in Robert's Rules of Order.	When a Member desires to call attention to a deviation or departure from the Rules of Procedure, that Member shall ask leave of the Mayor to raise a Point of Order and after leave is granted, the Member shall state the Point of Order to the Mayor and the Point of Order shall be immediately decided by the Mayor. Decision final unless appealed.	member may bring to attention of Presiding Officer that a rule has been broken, be ruled by Presiding Officer without vote, may be appealed	ask leave of Chair to raise point of order, after leave granted, state point, Chair decides point, can only speak again to appeal decision. If not appealed Chair's decision is final, if appealed Council decides without debate and decision is final	May interrupt the person who has the floor to raise point of order when feels deviation from PBL rules, or deviation from matter under consideration or discussion is not within proposed scope of the motion. Mayor shall decide, can be appealed, member may only address Mayor to appeal decision, if no appeal decision of Mayor is final. If appealed Member states case, Mayor can reply and Council shall decide. Council decision is final	may raise point of order, once recognized Mayor will hear point of order and decide, if no appeal, Mayor ruling final, if appealed Mayor to restate decision, if majority of members signify support for appeal, decision of Mayor overturned and point decided by a motion duly put and passed by majority vote	a concern about the order in which business is being considered, or about a procedure or procedures being used in the course of a meeting.	Except as otherwise specified in this subsection, only the Members may raise points of order and privilege. A Point of Order or privilege may be raised, at any time, by a Member without doing so in the form of a Motion. Upon receiving recognition from the Chair, the Member raising the Point of Order or privilege shall state such and await the ruling of the Chair on the Point of Order or privilege so raised. The Clerk may raise a Point of Order upon receipt of recognition from the Chair.	member shall clearly state point of order, Chair shall state rule or authority applicable, decision final unless successfully challenged without debate by majority of members present	be recognized by Chair, raise Point of Order or Point of Privilege shall state such and Chair to rule. The Clerk of the Council may raise a Point of Order upon receipt of recognition from the Chair. Can be appealed, Member shall state the grounds for the appeal and appeal decided without debate, by the concurring votes of a Majority of the Members of Council present.

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart - Local Area Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Fort Erie (2016)	Grimsby (2007)	Lincoln (2015)	Niagara Falls (2019)	Niagara-on-the-Lake (2019)	Pelham (2013)	Port Colborne (2015)	St. Catharines (2015)	Thorold (2017)	Wainfleet (2016)	Welland (2017)	West Lincoln (2013)
Point of Privilege	can ask leave of Chair to raise a question of privilege or point of order, after recognized by Chair, shall state point and shall be immediately decided by Chair, ruling shall be final subject to immediate appeal by member, member shall state grounds, appeal must be decided without debate by concurring votes of a majority. When member called to order by Chair, member shall cease speaking until point is dealt with, cannot speak again to matter, without permission of the Chair, unless to appeal	Member asks the Chair to raise a question of privilege, the member making the request is not permitted to enter into any argument or introduce any motion related to the question of privilege. A question of privilege suspends debate on the matter under consideration at the time until the question is decided. Unless immediately appealed the Chair's decision to the Council, the decision of the Chair is final.	if Mayor feels privilege has been breached, then can order member to apologize; if does not apologize, order member to leave Chamber. If no appeal, Mayor decision is final, if appealed put to vote by members and decision of majority is final.	silent	When a Member believes that his or her rights, privileges or integrity, or those of the Members collectively have been prejudicially affected, that Member may ask leave of the Mayor to raise a question of privilege and after leave is granted, the Member shall state the Point of Privilege to the Mayor and the Point of Privilege shall be immediately decided by the Mayor. Decision final unless appealed.	member may raise point of privilege, Chair shall rule on it, may be appealed, majority vote required	a matter of privilege shall receive disposition by Council, dealt with immediately and when settled question so interrupted shall be resumed from where it was suspended. Can speak at any time with consent of Chair to point out the matter	member may rise at any time on a point of personal privilege, suspends debate, when Mayor recognizes breach has taken place shall demand apology, if apology is not given member is asked to leave for duration of meeting, member may only address Mayor to appeal decision, if no appeal decision of Mayor is final. If appealed Member may state their case, Mayor has chance to reply and Council shall decide. Council decision is final	same as above	same as above	same as above	shall clearly state point or issue they wish to correct or explain circumstances that adversely affect them, can be raised at anytime but not to interrupt a speaker	same as above
Votes requiring 2/3	waive rules of PBL, amend or repeal PBL, speak more than once at Council, waive notice of motion req., reconsiderations	call the question	suspend rules	suspend rules, reconsiderations	Extend curfew after first 30 min extension, reconsider, suspend rules, amend or repeal PBL, introduce motion without notice	amend PBL, extend curfew, vary from delegation policy, call the question, suspend the rules, limit or extend debate, reconsideration, introduce motion without notice	suspend rules, provide less than 96 hours notice for agenda and material, extend curfew, waive notice	none	suspend rules, reconsideration	Extend curfew, notice of motion without a notice, additional time to speak for Councillor, reconsider, suspend PBL	none	extend curfew, reconsideration, rescind motion or by-law	none
Requirements to Amend PBL	shall not be amended or repealed except by an affirmative vote of two-thirds of the Members present, but no such amendment or repeal may be considered at any meeting of Council unless notice of the proposed amendment or repeal has been given at a previous regular meeting of Council. The requirement to give notice shall not be waived.	Provided notice has been given, rules may be amended or repealed by a majority vote of the Members of Council present at a regular Council meeting.	silent	no amendment or repeal of this By-law or any part thereof shall be considered at any meeting of the Council unless the amendment or repeal has been previously considered and recommended by a Committee of the Council and the waiving of such prior consideration and recommendation is prohibited.	Shall not be amended except by an affirmative vote of two-thirds of the Members present, but no such amendment may be considered at any Meeting of Council unless notice of the proposed amendment has been given at a previous regular Meeting of Council. The requirement to give notice shall not be waived.	2/3 vote, notice must have been given at previous meeting	notice given at previous meeting, majority of all members present at that meeting vote therefor	give notice, majority of members	silent	silent	notice given at previous meeting, requires majority vote of all members present	silent	majority vote of all Members of Council.

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart - Local Area Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Fort Erie (2016)	Grimsby (2007)	Lincoln (2015)	Niagara Falls (2019)	Niagara-on-the-Lake (2019)	Pelham (2013)	Port Colborne (2015)	St. Catharines (2015)	Thorold (2017)	Wainfleet (2016)	Welland (2017)	West Lincoln (2013)
Inaugural	held after LAMs have had first meeting but not later than 31 days after term commences. Morning and afternoon session, called by the Clerk following inaugural meeting of LAMs. Morning session to start at 10, chaired by Clerk, only for declarations of office and election of Chair. Afternoon meeting at 4, call to order, O' Canada, Declarations of oaths, invocation, inaugural address, resolution to receive inaugural address, confirming by-law.	the place, date and time of the Inaugural meeting is determined by the Mayor-Elect; public notice 7 days in advance, content determined by Mayor-Elect and Clerk, first order of business is declaration of office	held first Monday in December after election at 7:00 p.m.	held first Monday in December after election at 7:00 p.m, Mayor Elect, CAO, Clerk responsible for content and format of the agenda and all arrangements	Silent	must be held 5 days after new Council takes power, time and location set by Lord Mayor, Deputy Lord Mayor filled by by-law, appointment of Chair and Vice Chair of COTW	first Monday of the term for which Council is elected, 6:30 p.m., Mayor-Elect and Clerk determine location, content and format of agenda and programme	first Monday in December following a regular election at 6:30 p.m. Mayor-Elect and Clerk responsible for content and format of the agenda and all arrangements. Approve Deputy Mayor rotation	7:00 p.m. on first Monday of term in place large enough and accessible to allow the public to attend, appoint Deputy Mayor	after a regular election shall be held on the first Tuesday in December at 6:30 p.m. at a location to be fixed by the Clerk. Mayor-elect, CAO and Clerk responsible for content and format of the agenda and arrangements for proceedings	first Tuesday in December at 7:00 p.m., opening ceremonies shall be as determined by the Clerk	first Monday in December at 7:00 p.m.	shall be held not later than thirty-one (31) days after the term of the newly elected Council commences at a time and at a place as directed by the Mayor of the newly elected Council. Opening ceremonies as determined by the Mayor

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart – Comparator Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Durham Region (2018)	City of Vaughan (2011)	Peel Region (2018)	York Region (2018)	City of Hamilton (2014)	Region of Halton (2013)
Curfew	10:30 p.m. with extension to 11:00 p.m. with vote of majority of members	(day mts) no curfew	set curfew (all business carried to next mtg) Sec 4.3 extension with 2/3 members present	(day mtgs) set curfew at 3:30 p.m., can extend by resolution	(day mts) no curfew	Evening meetings in Jan to June, Sept to Nov; Morning meetings July, Aug, and Dec; no curfew	Adjourn no later than 11:30 p.m.
Quorum - lost or regained	30 minutes to start mtg, 15 to regain	30 minutes to start, if lost, meeting shall stand adjourned with unfinished business taken up at the next meeting	30 mins to start mtg, no mention of loss of quorum	30 mins to start, 30 mins to regain if lost during meeting	30 minutes to start mtg, 15 minutes to regain, "Idem" if not achieved in 15 minutes	30 minutes to start meeting, if lost, Chair to decide to continue but no decisions can be made	15 minutes to start Comm meeting, 30 minutes to start Council meeting. If lost at comm, may proceed. If lost at Council, meeting adjourned; no time for re-establishment
Chair Ex-Officio	Yes	Yes	Silent	Yes	The Regional Chair, when present, shall be counted in making the quorum but not in determining the number of Members of a Committee	Of all Standing Committees	Of all Standing Committees

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart – Comparator Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Durham Region (2018)	City of Vaughan (2011)	Peel Region (2018)	York Region (2018)	City of Hamilton (2014)	Region of Halton (2013)
Speaking Length/Number of Times	10 minutes, can only speak once to a matter at Council unless 2/3 vote, Comm - no limit on number of speaking times or amount of time	5 minutes in Council – no more than once to speak, without leave of Council Unlimited number of times to speak for Committee and COTW, as long as every other member who wishes to speak has spoken	Only once, unless to explain until all on speakers list have spoken, 5 min limit, with leave of members 5 minute extension	Council: Can only speak twice, not longer than 5 mins each time without Council permission. No limit in Committee on # of times to speak or time limit	Shall not speak for longer than five (5) minutes on a question without Council's permission. No member shall speak more than once to the same question without permission, except that a reply shall be permitted only from a Member who has presented the main motion	5 minute limit in both Comm and Council unless without leave. Can only speak more than once as per rules Sec 5.8 (2)	Council or COTW, no more than twice, without leave of Council. Committee, no limit, but can only speak another time after other members have spoken. 10 min limit in Council and COTW, no limit in Committee

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart – Comparator Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Durham Region (2018)	City of Vaughan (2011)	Peel Region (2018)	York Region (2018)	City of Hamilton (2014)	Region of Halton (2013)
Presentations	10 minute limit, unless otherwise determined by the Chair. A delegation of not more than five (5) persons, representing a group or organization, shall be limited to two (2) speakers, permitted to speak not more than 10 minutes in total. Only new information is to be presented by successive speakers of such delegation.	10 minutes for presentations at Council or Committee, limited to award presentations and presentations by staff, outside agencies and consultants retained by the Region	Only at Committee, 10 min limit	Staff presentations 10 min limit (council), time can be extended by majority vote (no seconder required) for such reasonable time as Chair may determine	Silent	Committee agendas have Staff Presentation section but no details provided.	Ceremonial or Awards only at Council - 10 mins at both Council and Committee

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart – Comparator Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Durham Region (2018)	City of Vaughan (2011)	Peel Region (2018)	York Region (2018)	City of Hamilton (2014)	Region of Halton (2013)
Delegations	Same provisions as presentations	Only for matters listed on an agenda. Delegations shall be limited to speak not more than five (5) minutes, with the exception that a delegation consisting of more than five persons shall be entitled to two speakers with each limited to speak not more than five (5) minutes. A single two minute extension may be granted by a majority vote.	Deputant shall not be listed on agenda until staff have had an opportunity to address the matter, if matter is with respect to a recently considered matter, cannot be heard within the next 4 regular Comm meetings unless a reconsideration motion is passed. 5 minute time limit. Not permitted at Council unless statutory hearing.	5 min limit at Council, 10 at Comm. (able to extend at both with motion (no seconder req'd) and majority vote.	Unless otherwise permitted by a majority vote, deputants shall be limited to 5 minutes at both Council and Comm. If there is a group of people wishing to address Council or Comm. to a particular position on a particular issue, then Council or Comm. can have group represented by one person or change the amount of time given.	Not permitted at Council. 5 minute time limit at Committee	10 min limit at Committee, 5 minute limit at Council. The time spent receiving and answering questions from Members shall not be deducted from the speaking time provided to Staff Presenters or to Delegates. Speaking times for Delegates and Staff Presenters may be extended or limited if the Chair obtains the approval of the Committee/Council. Delegates include consultants
Chair Voting/Head of Council	To break tie only at Council, Committee Chairs only if recorded vote	Yes	Yes	Only at Council in event of a tie	Can vote in Council and COTW. Committee Chair can vote	Committee Chairs can vote, silent on Head of Council	Yes

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart – Comparator Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Durham Region (2018)	City of Vaughan (2011)	Peel Region (2018)	York Region (2018)	City of Hamilton (2014)	Region of Halton (2013)
Reconsiderations	At Council, member has to vote in majority, present Notice of Motion to reconsider the matter, referred to next Council meeting and included on agenda, requires approval of 2/3 of Council present, matter can't be reconsidered more than once, matter to be reconsidered may be next order of business or referred to another meeting	Member who voted with the prevailing side, may make motion, cannot be reconsidered within 12 months following a decision of council unless 2/3 vote. Debatable, and requires notice of motion, unless dispensed with 2/3 vote	Within next 4 mtgs by 2/3 vote of members present	Within the same term of Council, required 2/3 vote. Not within the same term of Council, majority vote	Shall not be reconsidered within one year unless Council decides to do so by a two-thirds majority vote. Reconsiderations after one-year require majority vote. Requires member who voted in the majority.	After a matter has been decided at Council, a member who voted in the majority, at any Council meeting, can put forward a notice of motion to reconsider the matter (both successful or failed motions) referred to next meeting. A matter can only be reconsidered once during term of Council, requires 2/3 vote	Requires 2/3 vote, must be within one year of the date the motion was adopted, only one reconsideration allowed
Code of Conduct attached to PBL	Yes	No	No	No	No	Yes	No

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart – Comparator Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Durham Region (2018)	City of Vaughan (2011)	Peel Region (2018)	York Region (2018)	City of Hamilton (2014)	Region of Halton (2013)
Definition of Committee	means any Standing, Ad Hoc, Steering or Advisory Committee, Sub-Committee or board and any other similar group composed of individuals appointed by Council, or similar entity established by Council and composed of members	any advisory or other committee, subcommittee or similar entity of which at least 50 per cent of the members are also Members of Regional Council, including a Standing or Special Committee of Council	lists the specific Committees - i.e. COTW, COTW (Closed Session), a Statutory Comm., Ad Hoc Comm. Or a Sub-Committee	any advisory committee or other committee, subcommittee or similar entity, of which at least 50% of the committee members are members of Regional Council.	means any advisory or other committee, subcommittee or similar entity of which at least 50% of the members are also members of Reg Council, and includes COTW, Standing Comm., a special Comm or a Task Force of Council	A Standing Committee, Sub-Committee, Selection Committee or an Advisory Committee or Task Force established by Council from time to time	Any committee, excluding Committee of the Whole, of which at least 50 per cent of the members are Members of Council, including, but not limited to, Standing Committees, sub-committees, Interview, Striking, and CAO Recruitment
Mechanisms to limit debate	call the question - has to be next speaker, requires a majority vote	"vote on the question", requires 2/3 vote	silent	call the question – not allowed in Comm. 2/3 vote req'd	call the question, mover shall not speak to matter again if motion decided in the negative	call the question; not in order if Member speaking or before first time speakers list is exhausted	call the question - requires 2/3 vote, should be moved by someone who has not already debated the motion
Recorded votes	allowed in Committee and Council	Allowed in Council, Committee and Local Board meetings	only allowed at Council	only allowed at Council	only allowed at Council	allowed in Comm and Council	only allowed at Council, COTW
Other Business listed as agenda item	yes, not defined	Yes - A Member may introduce a motion under Other Business without notice, if Council, without debate, dispenses with notice on a 2/3 vote	at Committee only - listed as New Business includes matters of a general nature	Yes, new business or a matter not related to an item on the draft agenda pertinent to the business of the Region that may be of an urgent nature	yes, not defined	Yes; not defined	yes - for Standing Committees, Council has Other Business/ Comments of Members; not defined

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart – Comparator Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Durham Region (2018)	City of Vaughan (2011)	Peel Region (2018)	York Region (2018)	City of Hamilton (2014)	Region of Halton (2013)
Cancellation of Meetings	silent	<p>Council may be cancelled if the Clerk determines in advance that quorum will not be achieved, If the meeting is cancelled by Council resolution, or in the event of exceptional circumstances, at the discretion of the Regional Chair or Clerk</p> <p>Same for COTW and standing committees, but includes circumstance where the meeting is not required as determined by the Clerk/Department Head due to a lack of forecasted agenda items</p>	<p>any meeting may be cancelled or rescheduled to a day, time and place set out in a notice from the City Clerk sent to each Member at least 24 hours in advance and posted to the City's web site. (under Public Notice section)</p>	<p>Subject to consultation with the Regional Clerk, the Regional Chair may cancel or reschedule any regular meeting of Regional Council or any other committee.</p> <p>Committee Chair, subject to Regional Clerk consultation, may cancel or reschedule their committee meeting.</p>	<p>The Clerk may cancel or reschedule a meeting in consultation with the Regional Chair or the Chief Administrative Officer in the Regional Chair's absence.</p>	<p>The Clerk may cancel a Council meeting in consultation with the Mayor or the Deputy Mayor in the Mayor's absence. Notice from Clerk at least 2 business days prior, posted cancellation information on meeting calendar online</p>	<p>notwithstanding any other provision contained in this By-law, a Committee Chair, the Regional Chair, or in his/her absence, the Committee Vice-Chair or Acting Regional Chair may cancel a Regular Meeting of the Committee or Council, as the case may be, if the Committee Chair, Regional Chair, Committee Vice-Chair, or Acting Regional Chair deems it appropriate.</p>

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart – Comparator Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Durham Region (2018)	City of Vaughan (2011)	Peel Region (2018)	York Region (2018)	City of Hamilton (2014)	Region of Halton (2013)
Notice of Motion	shall be presented at a meeting of Council, but shall not be debated until the next regular meeting OR delivered to the Clerk not less than 7 days prior to the date of the meeting at which the motion is to be introduced, can be introduced without notice if Council dispenses with notice requirement and 2/3 vote	shall be given in writing and signed by the mover and the seconder, either at a meeting of Council but shall not be debated until the next regular meeting of Council; or delivered to the Clerk not later than Wednesday noon the week prior to the meeting at which the motion is to be introduced. When a Member's notice of motion has been called from the Chair at two successive meetings and not proceeded with, it shall be dropped from the agenda unless Council decides otherwise	silent	presented by a member at a meeting, for consideration at a subsequent meeting specified in the notice; or delivered to the Regional Clerk not later than seven days preceding the specified meeting; A Notice of Motion shall be added to the agenda for the meeting specified in the Notice of Motion.	A written notice of a motion respecting a substantive matter not on the agenda for a COTW meeting, submitted to the Clerk, moved by a Member, and seconded by another Member, for inclusion on the agenda for a future COTW meeting. It shall be delivered to Clerk prior to start of COTW, and included as a motion on the agenda of the next appropriate COTW meeting or as determined	shall be in writing and given at a meeting of Council or committee, but shall not be debated until the next meeting of council or comm; or (ii) delivered to the Clerk at any time prior to noon of the last business day preceding the date of the meeting at which the notice of motion is to be introduced. If matter is time sensitive or an emergency, motion can be introduced without notice if Council dispenses notice with affirmative vote of 2/3 of Members of Council/Committee present	must be submitted to the Clerk in writing, not less than 4 Business Days prior to the Council Meeting. The Clerk shall include the Motion, in the agenda for the Meeting concerned and the Motion shall be dealt with at this Meeting. Can bring notice during the other business portion of the Council agenda, without the required notice, but must be dealt with at the next Regular Council Meeting. Can be considered at same mtg if considered emerg.requires 2/3

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart – Comparator Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Durham Region (2018)	City of Vaughan (2011)	Peel Region (2018)	York Region (2018)	City of Hamilton (2014)	Region of Halton (2013)
Points of Order	Can ask leave of Chair to raise a question of privilege or point of order, after recognition, shall state point and it shall be immediately decided by Chair, ruling shall be final subject to immediate appeal by member, member shall state grounds for appeal, appeal must be decided without debate by concurring votes of a majority. When member called to order by Chair, member shall cease speaking until point of order is dealt with, cannot speak again to the matter, without permission of the Chair, unless to appeal	When a Member rises on a point of order, he/she shall ask leave of the Chair to raise a point of order and after leave is granted, the Member shall state the point of order and sit down and remain seated until the Chair has decided the point of order. If no Member appeals, the decision of the Chair is final.	Deviation or departure from the rules of procedure, ruling of Chair shall be final unless Member appeals to Council which will then decide upon the question without debate.	a member advises the Presiding Officer and Council or committee that the rules of procedure are being violated; member shall ask permission of the Presiding Officer to raise a point of order; after permission is granted, the member shall state the point of order to the Presiding Officer and the point of order shall be immediately decided by the Presiding Officer; If no member appeals, the decision of the Presiding Officer shall be final	When a Member rises on a point of order, point of privilege or point of personal privilege, the Member shall ask leave of the Chair to raise the point. After leave is granted, the Member shall state the point to the Chair and then remain silent until the Chair has ruled upon the point. Regional Chair rules on point, decision final unless appealed, then Council vote	means a question by a member with respect to any departure from the Procedural By-law or in the practiced conduct of Council or Committee business; not debatable	If a Member disregards the rules of procedure or a decision of the Chair on points of order, practice, interpretation of the rules, and persists in such conduct after having been called to order by the Chair, the Chair shall move “that if the Member apologizes he/she may, by a vote of the Committee/Council, be permitted to remain in his/her seat.” This Motion is not debatable. If the Member fails to apologize, the Member will be ordered by the Chair to leave the Meeting.

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart – Comparator Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Durham Region (2018)	City of Vaughan (2011)	Peel Region (2018)	York Region (2018)	City of Hamilton (2014)	Region of Halton (2013)
Point of Privilege	can ask leave of Chair to raise a question of privilege or point of order, after recognized by Chair, shall state point and shall be immediately decided by Chair, ruling shall be final subject to immediate appeal by member, member shall state grounds for appeal, appeal must be decided without debate by concurring votes of a majority. When member called to order by Chair, member shall cease speaking until point of order is dealt with, cannot speak again to matter, without permission of the Chair, unless to appeal	Where a Member considers that his/her integrity or the integrity of the Council as a whole has been impugned, he/she may, on a point of privilege, rise with the consent of the Chair for the purpose of drawing the attention of Council to the matter. When a point of privilege is raised, it shall be considered and decided by the Chair immediately. The decision of the Chair on a point of privilege is final	may rise at any time on a point of personal privilege where feels that their integrity or the integrity of Council has been impugned by another Member. Ruling of Chair shall be final unless appealed, when Chair recognizes that breach of privilege has taken place, the Chair shall demand that the offending Member apologize and failing such apology shall require offending Member to vacate the Chamber for the duration of the meeting.	permits a request or main motion relating to the rights and privileges of Council or committee i.e. to comfort with respect to heating, ventilation, lighting, noise; to conduct of its officers, employees or visitors; or to accuracy of reports of its proceedings or an individual member or to charges circulated against a member's character). Rise, recognized by Chair, ruling of Chair final unless appealed.	Same as above	A question by a member with respect to the rights of a member individually or Council or a Committee collectively hold, that ensure Council's or a Committee's ability to function freely; not debatable	it is in order only when the dignity, safety or reputation of a Member or Committee/Council is at stake. The Motion allows Members to interrupt the Meeting to state an urgent request. When a point of personal privilege is raised, it shall be considered and decided by the Chair immediately. The decision of the Chair on a Point of Personal Privilege may be appealed

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart – Comparator Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Durham Region (2018)	City of Vaughan (2011)	Peel Region (2018)	York Region (2018)	City of Hamilton (2014)	Region of Halton (2013)
Votes requiring 2/3	waive rules of PBL, amend or repeal PBL, speak more than once at Council, waive notice of motion req., reconsiderations,	Hearing delegation in Council that did not appear before in Committee, introducing motion without notice, vote on the question, reconsider, rescind, suspend PBL,	extension of curfew, at Comm - addition of agenda items once agenda is printed (2/3 of members present), waive PBL rules, reconsideration (2/3 present)	2/3 of the votes cast by members present; suspension of rules of procedure, further amend agenda or addendum agenda after approval, call the question, motion to reconsider, motion to rescind	2/3 members present req'd - to add an item to special meeting if item wasn't on notice, discuss an item deferred if the time of the deferral has not been reached, reconsiderations, to waive notice for a notice of motion, to consider a substantive matter not on the agenda, suspend rules of PBL	2/3 members present - add an OB item to special meeting if item wasn't on notice, dispensing with notice of motion for emergencies, reconsiderations, waive time req of 48 hours for a standing comm report to go before Council, suspend rules of PBL	2/3 members present req'd - suspend PBL rules, emergency notice of motion, call the question (close debate), reconsiderations, waive notice for motion to reconsider

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart – Comparator Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Durham Region (2018)	City of Vaughan (2011)	Peel Region (2018)	York Region (2018)	City of Hamilton (2014)	Region of Halton (2013)
Requirements to Amend PBL	shall not be amended or repealed except by an affirmative vote of two-thirds of the Members present, but no such amendment or repeal may be considered at any meeting of Council unless notice of the proposed amendment or repeal has been given at a previous regular meeting of Council. The requirement to give notice shall not be waived.	silent	silent	silent	By-law shall not be amended or repealed except by a majority vote of Council. No amendment or repeal shall be considered at any meeting of the Council unless notice or a report pertaining to the proposed amendment or repeal was listed on Council's Agenda.	By-law shall not be amended or repealed except by a majority vote of all Members of Council.	shall not be amended or repealed except by a positive vote of three-quarters of the Members of the whole Council. No amendment or repeal shall be considered at any Meeting of Council unless notice of the proposed amendment or repeal has been given as required by this By-law and the Region's Council approved notice provisions.

Procedural By-law Review
Comparison Chart – Comparator Municipalities

Item	Niagara Region (2010)	Durham Region (2018)	City of Vaughan (2011)	Peel Region (2018)	York Region (2018)	City of Hamilton (2014)	Region of Halton (2013)
Inaugural	held after LAMs have had first meeting but not later than 31 days after term commences. Morning and afternoon session, called by the Clerk following inaugural meeting of LAMs. Morning session to start at 10, chaired by Clerk, only for declarations of office and election of Chair. Afternoon meeting at 4, call to order, O'Canada, Declarations of oaths, invocation, inaugural address, resolution to receive inaugural address, confirming by law.	After the councils of the LAMs, but no later than 31 days following day on which the term of office commenced. Order of proceedings: filing of certificates, declarations of office, inaugural address of Chair, appointments to boards and committees, passage of confirming by-law	held the first Tuesday in December. (nothing further noted)	held after area municipalities have held their first meetings, but not later than the 14th day following the day on which the term of office commences. The Regional Clerk shall call the Inaugural Meeting at such time as may be appropriate. Regional Clerk shall preside at the Inaugural Meeting until the Regional Chair is appointed and has taken declaration of office.	Held Thursday following the first Monday in December after a regular election at a time and place to be fixed by the Clerk. Order includes filing of certificates of election, filing or taking of Members' declarations of office; appointment of the Regional Chair; signing of the Regional Chair's declaration of office; confirmatory bylaw and any other relevant bylaws; and other ceremonial proceedings as deemed appropriate by the Regional Chair, the CAO or Clerk.	Held on the first Monday of December in an election year at 5:00 p.m. Proceedings shall include Ceremonial - special address by guests; Filing of Declarations of Office, Council appointments to Standing Committees, Boards and Agencies; and Confirming By-law.	held after the councils of the LAMs have their first meetings but not later than December 14th, with the date, time, and place at Clerk discretion. Includes filing of certificates, declarations of office, signing of declarations, oaths approval of the Striking Committee report; passage of confirming by-law, any other relevant by-laws; other ceremonial proceedings as deemed by Council to be necessary or desirable. Regional Chair may deliver inaugural address

Comparison Chart Council Size Information

Municipality/Region	Council Size	Population (as of 2016)
Niagara Region	32	447,888
Durham Region	29	645,862
City of Vaughan	9	306,223
Peel Region	25	1.382 million
York Region	21	1.11 million
City of Hamilton	16	747,545
Halton Region	24	548,435