

**THE REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY OF NIAGARA
BUDGET REVIEW COMMITTEE OF THE WHOLE
MINUTES - OPEN SESSION**

**BRCOTW 4-2019
Thursday, February 14, 2019
Council Chamber
Niagara Region Headquarters, Campbell West
1815 Sir Isaac Brock Way, Thorold, ON**

Committee: Bradley (Regional Chair), Butters, Bylsma, Campion, Chiocchio, Darte, Diodati, Disero, Easton, Edgar, Fertich, Foster, Gibson, Greenwood, Heit, Huson, Insinna, Ip, Junkin, Nicholson, Redekop, Steele, Ugulini, Villella, Whalen (Committee Vice Chair), Zalepa (Committee Chair)

Absent/Regrets: Bellows, Gale, Jordan, Rigby, Sendzik, Witteveen

Staff: H. Chamberlain, Director, Financial Management & Planning/Deputy Treasurer, T. Harrison, Commissioner/Treasurer, Enterprise Resource Management Services, Dr. M. Hirji, Associate Medical Officer of Health, A. Jugley, Commissioner, Community Services, V. Kuhns, Acting Director, Economic Development, R. Mostacci, Commissioner, Planning & Development Services, A.-M. Norio, Regional Clerk, T. Potts, Senior Budget Analyst, M. Trennum, Deputy Regional Clerk, C. Ryall, Director, Transportation Services, R. Tripp, Acting Chief Administrative Officer

1. CALL TO ORDER

Committee Chair Zalepa called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

2. DISCLOSURES OF PECUNIARY INTEREST

There were no disclosures of pecuniary interest.

3. PRESENTATIONS

There were no presentations.

4. DELEGATIONS

There were no delegations.

5. ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

5.1 CSD 22-2019

2019 Levy Operating Budget

Matt Robinson, Director, GO Implementation Office, and Heather Talbot, Financial and Special Projects Consultant, provided information respecting Niagara Regional Transit. Topics of the presentation included:

- Overview: Where We've Been
- Milestones: What We've Achieved
- Transit Governance: Aspirational Timelines
- Moving Transit Forward: Where We're Going
- Inter-Municipal Transit Service Enhancement Implementation Strategy
- Niagara Regional Transit Revenue Outlook & 2019 Budget Strategy
- Transit Jurisdictional Comparison

Helen Chamberlain, Director, Financial Management & Planning/Deputy Treasurer, provided information respecting 2019 Levey Operating Budget. Topics of the presentation included:

- 2019 Levy Operating Budget: Key Themes
- Budget Process
- Departmental Budgets at 2% Guidance
- Regional Department Base Budget
- Assessment Growth
- Use of NPCA Refund
- Not Accommodated within Guidance
- Summary of Budget Impact
- NRPS Request In Excess of Guidance
- Historical Tax Levy Increases
- Household Impacts
- Understanding the Risks and Opportunities
- Next Steps

Moved by Councillor Bylsma
Seconded by Councillor Ip

That Report CSD 22-2019, dated February 14, 2019, respecting 2019 Levy Operating Budget, **BE RECEIVED** and the following recommendations **BE APPROVED**:

1. That the 2019 net levy budget relating to the Niagara Regional Departments with a total of \$178,101,908 as consolidated in Appendix 1 of Report CSD 22-2019 **BE APPROVED** including the following:
2. That an increase of \$2,647,125 or 1.5% over the 2018 departmental operating budget **BE APPROVED** in accordance with Council approved guidance;
3. That an increase of an additional \$885,757 or 0.5% over the 2018 departmental operating budget, as detailed in Appendix 2 of Report CSD 22-2018, **BE APPROVED** in accordance with Council approved additional guidance;
4. That the Niagara Peninsula Conservation Authority differential reserve refund of \$1,284,237 **BE APPROVED** to fund one time initiatives as detailed in Appendix 2 of Report CSD 22-2019;
5. That an additional increase of \$7,975,215 or 2.3% over the 2018 consolidated levy **BE APPROVED** to fund service enhancements to the Niagara Regional Transit (NRT) program;
6. That an additional increase of \$900,000 or 0.3% over the 2018 consolidated levy **BE APPROVED** to provide sustainable funding for the continuation of the Waterfront Investment Program (WIP);
7. That an additional increase of \$250,000 or 0.1% over the 2018 consolidated levy **BE APPROVED** to provide sustainable funding for the continuation of the Niagara Investment in Culture (NIC) grant program;
8. That an additional 1.65% or \$5,705,155 of assessment growth **BE APPROVED** to fund an increase in Niagara Region Development Charge grants of \$3,525,308 and the Niagara Regional Police Services operating budget of \$2,179,847;

9. That the 2019 net departmental tax levy of \$190,752,431 in addition to the ABCs of \$181,705,896 for a total tax levy of \$372,458,327 **BE APPROVED**; and
10. That the necessary by-law **BE PREPARED** and **PRESENTED** to Council for consideration.

Moved by Councillor Ip
Seconded by Councillor Butters

1. That \$198,000 in adjustments to Councillor remuneration **BE REMOVED** from this budget;
2. That no adjustments **BE MADE** to Councillor remuneration until staff have developed a formula comparable to the City of St. Catharines that is tied to data from Statistics Canada or some other relevant data set; and
3. That a policy **BE DEVELOPED** and a By-law **BE PASSED** that directs how Councillor remuneration shall be automatically adjusted each year, rather than Councillors voting on their own remuneration from time to time.

Each clause of the motion was considered separately as follows:

1. That \$198,000 in adjustments to Councillor remuneration **BE REMOVED** from this budget.

Recorded Vote:

Yes (23): Bradley, Butters, Bylsma, Campion, Chiocchio, Darte, Disero, Easton, Edgar, Fertich, Foster, Gibson, Greenwood, Huson, Insinna, Ip, Junkin, Nicholson, Steele, Ugulini, Villella, Whalen, Zalepa.

No (3): Diodati, Heit, Redekop.

Carried

2. That no adjustments **BE MADE** to Councillor remuneration until staff have developed a formula comparable to the City of St. Catharines that is tied to data from Statistics Canada or some other relevant data set.

Recorded Vote:

Yes (6): Butters, Chiocchio, Gibson, Greenwood, Huson, Ip.

No (20): Bradley, Bylsma, Campion, Darte, Diodati, Disero, Easton, Edgar, Fertich, Foster, Heit, Insinna, Junkin, Nicholson, Redekop, Steele, Ugolini, Villella, Whalen, Zalepa.

Defeated

Based on clause 2 being defeated, Councillor Ip withdrew clause three (3) of the motion.

Moved by Councillor Ip
Seconded by Councillor Greenwood

That Clause 7 of the motion related to Report CSD 22-2019 **BE AMENDED** to read as follows:

- 7. That any approvals related to the NPCA levy not BE GIVEN and no payments be made to the NPCA until such time as we have received answers we consider to be satisfactory to the questions that were asked at the meeting of January 31, 2019, including detailed budget information with respect to the \$2.5+ million that was not reported on in the presentation made to Council on that date; and***

That the 2019 net departmental tax levy of \$190,554,431 in addition to the ABCs ***of only the Niagara Regional Police Service, Niagara Regional Housing, and Court Services of \$174,604,323*** for a total tax levy of \$365,158,754 **BE APPROVED**.

Moved by Councillor Whalen
Seconded by Councillor Disero

That clause 7 **BE FURTHER AMENDED** as follows:

7. That the 2019 net departmental tax levy of \$190,554,431 in addition to the ABCs **of only the ~~Niagara Regional Police Service, Niagara Regional Housing, and Court Services~~** of \$27,184,113 for a total tax levy of \$217,738,544 **BE APPROVED**;

That the NRPS BE REQUESTED to find further cost savings related to program changes of 3.1 million dollars.

Carried

The Committee Chair called the vote on the motion, as amended, as follows:

That Clause 7 of the motion related to Report CSD 22-2019 **BE AMENDED** to read as follows:

- 7. That any approvals related to the NPCA levy not BE GIVEN and no payments be made to the NPCA until such time as we have received answers we consider to be satisfactory to the questions that were asked at the meeting of January 31, 2019, including detailed budget information with respect to the \$2.5+ million that was not reported on in the presentation made to Council on that date;***

That the 2019 net departmental tax levy of \$190,554,431 in addition to the ABCs of only Niagara Regional Housing, and Court Services of \$27,184,113 for a total tax levy of \$217,738,544 **BE APPROVED**; and

That the NRPS **BE REQUESTED** to find further cost savings related to program changes of 3.1 million dollars

The clauses of the motion, as amended, were considered separately as follows:

That any approvals related to the NPCA levy not BE GIVEN and no payments be made to the NPCA until such time as we have received answers we consider to be satisfactory to the questions that were asked at the meeting of January 31, 2019, including detailed budget information with respect to the \$2.5+ million that was not reported on in the presentation made to Council on that date.

Recorded Vote:

Yes (11): Bradley, Butters, Campion, Chiocchio, Edgar, Fertich, Heit, Ip, Redekop, Ugulini, Villella.

No (13): Bylsma, Darte, Disero, Easton, Foster, Gibson, Huson, Insinna, Junkin, Nicholson, Steele, Whalen, Zalepa.

Defeated

That the 2019 net departmental tax levy of \$190,554,431 in addition to the ABCs of only Niagara Regional Housing, and Court Services of \$27,184,113 for a total tax levy of \$217,738,544 **BE APPROVED**; and

That the NRPS **BE REQUESTED** to find further cost savings related to program changes of 3.1 million dollars.

Recorded Vote:

Yes (19): Bradley, Butters, Bylsma, Chiocchio, Disero, Easton, Fertich, Foster, Gibson, Greenwood, Heit, Huson, Ip, Junkin, Nicholson, Ugulini, Villella, Whalen, Zalepa.

No (6): Campion, Darte, Edgar, Insinna, Redekop, Steele.

Carried

Moved by Councillor Heit
Seconded by Councillor Nicholson

That clause four of the motion related to Report CSD 22-2019 **BE DEFERRED** for one year.

Carried

That Report CSD 22-2019, dated February 14, 2019, respecting 2019 Levy Operating Budget, **BE DEFERRED**, as amended, to the Budget Review Committee of the Whole meeting being held Thursday, February 28, 2019.

Recorded Vote:

Yes (25): Bradley, Butters, Campion, Chiocchio, Darte, Disero, Easton, Fertich, Gibson, Greenwood, Heit, Huson, Insinna, Ip, Junkin, Nicholson, Redekop, Ugulini, Villella, Whalen.

No (5): Bylsma, Edgar, Foster, Steele, Zalepa.

Carried

5.2 CSD 23-2019

2019 Fees and Charges By-law

Moved by Councillor Steele

Seconded by Councillor Huson

That Report CSD 23-2019, dated February 14, 2019, respecting 2019 Fees and Charges By-law, **BE RECEIVED** and the following recommendations **BE APPROVED**:

1. That the 2019 fees and charges schedule, effective April 1, 2019, and attached in this report as Appendix A of Report CSD 23-2019, **BE APPROVED**; and,
2. That the necessary by-law **BE PREPARED** and **PRESENTED** to Council for consideration.

Carried

5.3 CSD 1-2019

2019 Capital Budget - **REVISED**

Moved by Councillor Huson

Seconded by Councillor Fertich

That Report CSD 1-2019 - REVISED, dated February 14, 2019, respecting 2019 Capital Budget - REVISED, **BE RECEIVED** and the following recommendations **BE APPROVED**:

1. That the 2019 Capital Budget for the Niagara Regional Departments and Agencies, Boards and Commissions of \$274,283,966 as per Appendix 1 to Report CSD 1-2019, **BE APPROVED IN PRINCIPLE** pending final by-law approval anticipated to be on February 28, 2019 and subject to approval of the Niagara Regional Transit separate levy being considered with the 2019 operating budget;
2. That financing in the amount of \$249,255,706 gross and \$227,445,255 net **BE INITIATED** upon approval of the 2019 Capital Budget and **BE ALLOCATED** to the projects as summarized in Appendix 2 to Report CSD 1-2019; and
3. That the necessary by-laws **BE PREPARED** and **PRESENTED** to Council for consideration to coincide with the approval of the operating budget.

Carried

6. CONSENT ITEMS FOR INFORMATION

Moved by Councillor Whalen
Seconded by Councillor Steele

That the following items **BE RECEIVED** for information:

CSD 24-2019

Financial Disclosure Requirements - Ontario Regulations 284/09

BRC-C 06-2019

Niagara Peninsula Conservation Authority (NPCA) Memorandum of Understanding Regarding Debt

Carried

7. OTHER BUSINESS

There were no items of other business.

8. CLOSED SESSION

Committee did not resolve into closed session.

9. NEXT MEETING

The next meeting will be held on Thursday, February 28, 2019, at 4:00 p.m. in the Council Chamber, Regional Headquarters.

10. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 10:10 p.m.

Councillor Zalepa
Committee Chair

Matthew Trennum
Deputy Regional Clerk

Ann-Marie Norio
Regional Clerk