
Subject: Appointment of Citizen Members to the Waste Management Planning Steering Committee

Report to: Waste Management Planning Steering Committee

Report date: Monday, September 28, 2020

Recommendations

1. That the Waste Management Advisory Committee (WMAC) **BE DISCONTINUED**, effective immediately;
2. For this current term of Regional Council, the past WMAC Chair and delegate **CONTINUE** to remain as members of the Waste Management Planning Steering Committee (WMPSC);
3. For future terms of Regional Council, a formal application process for selecting two (2) citizen members to sit on the WMPSC, **BE IMPLEMENTED**;
4. That the existing WMPSC's Terms of Reference **BE AMENDED** to include the following composition:
 - Maximum of 12 individuals, including: the Regional Chair, up to nine (9) Regional Councillors and two (2) citizen members.
 - The citizen members will not have a vote on legal or financial matters and will not be present during closed sessions, or receive confidential information.
5. That a complete update to the existing WMPSC's Terms of Reference **BE COMPLETED** by Niagara Region's Clerk's Department, in consultation with Waste Management staff.

Key Facts

- The purpose of this report is to respond to the Councillor Information Request made at the October 28, 2019 WMPSC meeting to provide information with respect to amending the WMPSC's Terms of Reference to include citizen members.
- Report WMPSC-C 35-2019 was submitted at the October 28, 2019 WMPSC meeting. It provided the recommendation to discontinue the WMAC, effective immediately. It also responded to the Councillor Information Request made at the August 26, 2019 WMPSC meeting, requesting information on options to include citizen members on the WMPSC, given that the Region received a limited number of applications for membership on the WMAC, for the current four-year Council term.

- Report WMPSC-C 35-2019 was deferred until the January 27, 2020 WMPSC meeting, in order to provide WMPSC members with additional information with respect to amending the WMPSC's Terms of Reference to include citizen members.

Financial Considerations

Currently, two (2) Regional staff are required to attend five (5) WMAC evening meetings each year. If the WMAC is discontinued, there would be a savings associated with Regional staff no longer attending these meetings.

Analysis

Background

An independent external governance review was conducted in 2018 (CLK 05-2019 - Recommendations from Independent External Governance Auditor – First Report). As a result, a number of Regional Advisory/Steering Committees were discontinued by Regional Council in February 2019 because the Committees had not met in quite some time or their mandate was no longer relevant.

The initial intent of the WMAC was to provide input on the development of Niagara Region's long-term waste plan, which required regularly scheduled meetings. However, the content of recent WMAC meetings has mainly included reports, which were previously presented to WMPSC and/or Public Works Committee (PWC). These reports are available to all members of the public for review on-line. In addition, WMAC members and the public can attend WMPSC and PWC meetings, or request to speak/present at these meetings, if they wish to do so.

Report WMPSC-C 35-2019 was submitted at the October 28, 2019 WMPSC meeting. It provided the recommendation to discontinue the WMAC, effective immediately. It also responded to the Councillor Information Request made at the August 26, 2019 WMPSC meeting, requesting information on options to include citizen members on the WMPSC, given that the Region received a limited number of applications for membership on the WMAC, for the current four-year Council term.

Report WMPSC-C 35-2019 was deferred until the January 27, 2020 WMPSC meeting, in order to provide WMPSC members with additional information with respect to amending the WMPSC's Terms of Reference to include citizen members.

Proposed Option for WMAC

On April 15, 2019, Niagara Region advertised for citizen members for all of its advisory Committees. Applications were taken over a two-week period. The Region received three (3) applications for membership on the WMAC before the submission deadline, and another two (2) applications were received after the deadline. Due to the minimal interest, the Region contacted these five (5) applicants and obtained their support for repurposing the WMAC into an ad-hoc committee, instead. As a result, the Region is proposing that the WMAC be discontinued, effective immediately.

The Region will call upon those interested individuals to participate in focus groups and/or attend meetings, as required by the Region, to obtain their input on various projects. This would be supplementary to the extensive communication/outreach the Region already undertakes for these projects.

Comparison of Other Municipalities

Appendix A provides an overview of the various public waste management advisory and/or standing committees at twelve (12) of Niagara Region's comparator municipalities (i.e. Cities of Guelph, Hamilton, London, Ottawa, Toronto, and Windsor, Simcoe County, and the Regions of Durham, Halton, Peel, Waterloo and York).

Based upon a review of these twelve (12) comparator municipalities:

- Seven (7) of these municipalities (i.e. Guelph, Halton, Hamilton, London, Ottawa, Peel, and Windsor) include a combination of Councillors and/or citizen members on their waste management advisory and/or standing committee.
- Five (5) comparator municipalities (i.e. Durham, Simcoe, Toronto, Waterloo, and York) do not have a waste management advisory and/or standing committee.

Options for Including Citizen Members on the WMPSC

In accordance with the current WMPSC's Terms of Reference, the WMAC Chair and another member designated by the WMAC sit as the only non-political members of the WMPSC. The WMAC members do not have a vote on legal or financial matters presented to the WMPSC, for consideration.

If the Region's proposal to discontinue the WMAC is approved by Council, there would no longer be any citizen representation on the WMPSC. As a result, the Region is proposing that for this current term of Regional Council, the past WMAC Chair and delegate would continue to remain as members of the WMPSC.

For future terms of Regional Council, the Region is proposing that a formal application process for selecting two (2) citizen members to sit on the WMPSC be implemented, which would include the following:

- An online application would be posted on Niagara Region's website, for a period of three (3) weeks, for interested citizens to apply.
- Citizens would need to demonstrate why they would like to sit on the WMPSC, and include their relevant waste management experience.
- Staff reps for WMPSC, in consultation with the WMPSC Chair (and/or Vice Chair), would review all submissions and rank them, based on a best-fit criteria.
- Two (2) citizen members would be chosen and recommended to WMPSC members, for their approval.
- These two (2) citizen members would be submitted to PWC and Regional Council, for final approval.

Amendments to WMPSC's Existing Terms of Reference

The WMPSC is currently comprised of a maximum of 12 individuals, including the Regional Chair, nine (9) Regional Councillors, and two (2) representatives from the WMAC. The representatives of the WMAC do not have a vote on legal or financial matters.

If it is the WMPSC's intention to include two (2) citizen members on this Committee, the WMPSC's existing Terms of Reference would need to be amended to provide for these citizen members, along with the following criteria for their membership:

- Citizen members will not have a vote on any legal or financial matters.
- Citizen members will not be present during closed sessions, or receive confidential information.

This amendment would be included, as part of a complete update to the existing WMPSC's Terms of Reference, which has not been amended since February 2002. This complete update would be undertaken by Niagara Region's Clerks Department, in consultation with Waste Management staff. Subject to WMPSC's final approval of the updated Terms of Reference, a PWC report would then be developed, for their approval.

Alternatives Reviewed

The alternative to discontinuing the WMAC would be to maintain it. This is not being recommended due to available opportunities to attend WMPSC and the already limited

number of interested residents. With only five (5) members, a quorum of three (3) members would be required at each meeting, which may be difficult to obtain.

The alternative to including citizen members on the WMPSC would be to eliminate them from this Committee. This is not being recommended as there would no longer be any public input into the planning and evaluation process for Waste Management programs, policies, etc.

Relationship to Council Strategic Priorities

The Region's recommendation to discontinue the WMAC supports Council's strategic priority of Sustainable and Engaging Government by promoting an organizational culture that values continuous improvement, collaboration, and innovation.

Other Pertinent Reports

WMPSC-C 35-2019 – Status of the Waste Management Advisory Committee
CLK 05-2019 - Recommendations from Independent External Governance Auditor –
First Report

Prepared by:

Brad Whitelaw, BA, CIM, P.Mgr., CAPM
Program Manager, Policy & Planning
Waste Management Services

Recommended by:

Bruce Zvaniga, P.Eng.
Commissioner of Public Works (Interim)
Public Works Department

Submitted by:

Ron Tripp, P.Eng.
Acting Chief Administrative Officer

This report was prepared in consultation with Ann-Marie Norio, Regional Clerk, and reviewed by Sara Mota, Program Financial Specialist, Sherri Tait, Program Manager, Policy & Planning, and Lydia Torbicki, Manager Waste Policy & Planning, Waste Management Services Division

Appendices

Appendix A Comparison of Other Municipalities' Waste Management Advisory and/or Standing Committees

Appendix A – Comparison of Other Municipalities' Waste Management Advisory and/or Standing Committees.

Committee Mandates	Committee Compositions
<p>Municipality: Durham Region</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Durham does not have a specific public Waste Management Advisory Committee. <p><u>Works Committee:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports to Council on matters relating to Regional public works and infrastructure (i.e. roads, water and waste-water, waste management). 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not Applicable • Works Committee is comprised of eight (8) members of Council only.
<p>Municipality: Guelph</p> <p><u>Public Advisory Committee (PAC):</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Forum for in-depth discussion of key study issues, concerns and solutions; • Not a decision-making body and does not have the authority to vote or commit City resources; • Any recommendations made by the PAC are submitted to Committee of the Whole (COTW), for approval. <p><u>Committee of the Whole:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Fully participates in debate and forwards recommendations to Council for final decision; • Important forum for policy debate and public input on issues within Council's area of responsibility. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PAC is comprised of nine (9) citizen members appointed by Guelph City Council. • PAC members may not be employees of the City of Guelph or members of Council. • COTW is comprised of members of Council only.
<p>Municipality: Halton Region</p> <p><u>Solid Waste Management Advisory Committee (SWMAC):</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Advises and assists the Region with minimizing waste going to the landfill site; • Supports Regional efforts to promote reduction, reuse and recycling (3Rs) of solid waste 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SWMAC is comprised of the following members: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ◦ Four (4) Councillors, one from each Local Municipality, either Regional or Local

Committee Mandates	Committee Compositions
<p>generated in Halton and limit off-site impacts due to operations at the Halton Waste Management Site;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Helps monitor waste haulage in the Region as required by the Conditions of Approvals under the Environmental Assessment Act, 1990; • Combined the mandates of the 2014 to 2018 Joint Municipal/ Regional Waste Management Advisory Committee and Halton Waste Management Site Advisory Committee. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Eight (8) citizens-at-large (preferably, at least four (4) of whom live near the Halton Waste Management Site) ○ One (1) member from the Halton Agricultural Advisory Committee ○ One (1) member from Conservation Halton ○ One (1) member of Regional staff who performs the Environmental Inspector duties (advisory, non-voting)
<p><u>Planning & Public Works Committee (PPWC):</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports to Council on matters relating to Regional planning and public works and infrastructure, including (but not limited to) community planning, sustainable planning & climate change, planning policy, water & wastewater services, waste management, road operations, and infrastructure engineering and construction. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • PPWC is comprised of ten (10) members of Council only.
<p>Municipality: Hamilton</p> <p><u>Waste Management Advisory Committee (WMAC):</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provides overall guidance and direction during the preparation of the City's long-term Solid Waste Management Master Plan; • Advises Council through the Public Works Committee of the study progress and receives feedback, advice and direction, as appropriate. <p><u>Public Works Committee (PWC):</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports to and make recommendations to Council on various matters, which include 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WMAC is comprised of four to five (4 to 5) members, as follows: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Up to three (3) members of City Council; ○ Two (2) citizen members. • PWC is comprised of members of Council only.

Committee Mandates	Committee Compositions
Waste Management (Solid Waste Planning, Collection, and Disposal).	
<p>Municipality: London</p> <p><u>Advisory Committee on the Environment (ACE):</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports to Council, through Planning and Environment Committee (PEC); • Provides input, advice and makes recommendations on environmental matters affecting the City; • Serves as an advisory, resource and information support group to PEC, Council, and its Committees, as required, and to the citizenry to encourage and promote sustainable programs and functions such as the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ remedial planning toward the clean-up of contaminated areas; ○ waste reduction, reuse and recycling programs; ○ water and energy conservation measures; ○ climate change mitigation; ○ to investigate such other aspects of environmental concerns as may be suggested by Council, its other Committees, or the Civic Administration; ○ to initiate and/or receive submissions and/or delegations regarding any environmental concerns and to report with recommendations to the PEC. <p><u>Planning and Environment Committee:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports directly to Council; • Hears delegations from the public, present reports and recommendations to Council. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • ACE is comprised of a maximum of thirteen (13) members consisting of: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Nine (9) members-at-large; ○ One (1) representative of the Environmental and Ecological Planning Advisory Committee; ○ One (1) representative of the Thames Region Ecological Association; ○ One (1) representative of an environmental and/or private sector interest group; ○ One (1) representative of the Industrial/Commercial/Institutional sector. • PEC is comprised of five (5) members of Council only.

[illegible]

Committee Mandates	Committee Compositions
<p>Municipality: Peel Region</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Peel does not have a specific public Waste Management Advisory Committee. <p><u>Waste Management Strategic Advisory Committee (WMSAC):</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provides strategic guidance to Council on the implementation of the Waste Reduction and Resource Recovery Strategy and the Infrastructure Development Plan. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not Applicable • WMSAC is comprised of members of Council only.
<p>Municipality: Simcoe County</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Simcoe does not have a specific public Waste Management Advisory Committee. <p><u>Committee of the Whole (COTW):</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Reports directly to County Council. • Within COTW, there are three (3) business sections: Performance Management, Human Services, and Corporate Services. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not Applicable • COTW is comprised of members of Council only.
<p>Municipality: Toronto</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Toronto does not have a specific public Waste Management Advisory Committee. <p><u>Infrastructure and Environment Committee (IEC):</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Primary focus is on infrastructure and the natural environment • Monitors and makes recommendations on Toronto's infrastructure needs and services, parks and forestry, and the sustainable use of Toronto's environment. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Not Applicable • IEC is comprised of members of Council only.

Committee Mandates	Committee Compositions
<p>Municipality: Waterloo Region</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Waterloo does not have a specific public Waste Management Advisory Committee. <p><u>Planning and Works Committee (PWC):</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Responsible for reviewing and reporting on all matters relating to planning issues and public works operated by the Region and other functions related to the Region's facilities, which includes residential and industrial waste management. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Not Applicable PWC is comprised of members of Council only.
<p>Municipality: Windsor</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Windsor does not have a specific public Waste Management Advisory Committee. <p><u>Environment, Transportation and Public Safety Standing Committee (ETPSSC):</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Study and report to Council on all matters relating to the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Long-range capital projects; Policy matters relating to general infrastructure development and design; Environmental policies relating to waste management, waste water services, and other environmental matters; Regional infrastructure matters; Transportation networks including roads, and cycling and walking path systems. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Not Applicable ETPSSC is comprised of five (5) members of Council only.
<p>Municipality: York Region</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> York does not have a specific public Waste Management Advisory Committee. <p><u>Committee of the Whole (COTW):</u></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Not Applicable COTW is comprised of members of Council only.

Committee Mandates	Committee Compositions
<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Receives public input, reviews policies and considers staff reports, then recommends actions to Council.	

Note:

Some municipalities have citizen committees established for their landfill sites (i.e. Waterloo), parallel to Niagara Region, and for related disposal facilities such as EFW (i.e. Durham).