

Proposed Collection Service Options for Niagara Region's Next Collection Contract

Public Works Committee Meeting

January 8, 2019

Proposed Collection Service Options

- Background
- Rationale for Options
- Base Garbage Collection Service Options
- Targeted Stakeholder Consultation
- Broad-Based Stakeholder Consultation
- Recommendations



Background

- Niagara Region's next garbage, recycling and organics collection contract is set to begin by March 8, 2021.
- Provides an opportunity to complete a service delivery review to improve program effectiveness (i.e. increase diversion) and efficiencies (i.e. mechanisms to reduce or avoid costs).
- On April 12, 2018, Regional Council approved proposed base collection services to be included in the stakeholder consultation and engagement process.
- Purpose of the report is to seek Council's approval of the proposed base collection services being recommended for inclusion in Niagara Region's next collection RFP, based on the results of input received during the stakeholder consultation and engagement phase, subject to input from LAMs.

Rationale for Options

- Standardize garbage container (bag/can) limits across all Industrial, Commercial, and Institutional (IC&I) and Mixed-Use (MU) properties, which use the Region's base curbside garbage collection service;
- Increase participation in Region's diversion programs;
- Results of curbside audits and other collection monitoring/measurements, which illustrate service usage/need;
- Improve program communication and services provided to residents and businesses; and
- Best practices and/or major trends in Niagara's 13 municipal comparators (e.g. every-other-week garbage collection).

Base Garbage Collection Service Options

- 1) Every-other-week (EOW) garbage collection for **all sectors outside DBAs**, as a **base** service:
 - Weekly collection of recycling and organics to continue
 - Garbage container limit for all properties would double and/or
- 2) Mandatory use of clear bags for garbage, with the option of allowing an opaque privacy bag to be placed inside the clear bag:
 - The clear bag program will be for **all sectors (both inside and outside DBAs)**, as a **base** service.

Key Drivers – EOW Garbage and Clear Bags

- extend existing landfill site capacity;
- contract cost avoidance (EOW garbage collection);
- increase participation and capture rates in diversion programs:
 - *Nearly 50% of low density residential garbage is organic waste and only 48% use the residential Green Bin program*
 - *IC&I and MU audits show diversion programs underutilized*



Base Garbage Collection Service Options

- 3) Establishment of a 4 item limit per residential unit, per collection, for large item collection at LDR properties, as a **base** service.
- 4) Discontinuation of appliances and scrap metal collection at LDR properties.

Key drivers: Contract cost avoidance for services with limited usage.

- *99% of properties using the large item service set out 4 items or less and 92% of the total bookings were for 4 or less items*
- *Appliances and scrap metal:*
 - *Tonnages have decreased by 94% since 2007*
 - *Items can be recycled, at no cost, at the Region's Drop-off Depots, or by scrap metal haulers/dealers*
 - *Only 6% of properties are using the service*

Base Garbage Collection Service Options

- 5) Change the weekly garbage container limits for IC&I and MU properties located inside DBAs from 7 containers to 4 containers per property, as a base service.
- 6) Change the weekly garbage container limit for MU properties located outside DBAs from 6 containers to 4 containers per property, as a base service.

Key Drivers: Standardize base garbage collection limits across similar sectors to improve service delivery and program communication, increase participation and capture rates in diversion programs, potentially avoid contract costs for a service level, which is not needed.

- *Average number of garbage containers placed out per week:*
 - *IC&I and MU properties inside the DBA is 2.1 and 2.0*
 - *MU properties outside the DBA is 2.4*

Targeted Stakeholder Consultation

Stakeholders	Consultation Activities and Comment
Regional Departments and ABCs	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Planning and Development Services Department noted the proposed options align with and support policy 4.2.9.1 d) i) of the Growth Plan, which relates to waste management; also reviewed the proposed container limit changes pertaining to MU properties inside and outside DBAs and anticipate that smaller MU developments would not be affected by the proposed change in container limits.• Economic Development indicated their work generally revolves around larger industrial companies, which would not use the Region's curbside garbage collection service, and would not be impacted by the proposed collection options.• Niagara Regional Housing did not support of EOW garbage collection, or mandatory use of clear bags for garbage
Waste Management Advisory Committee	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Supported all proposed options

Targeted Stakeholder Consultation

Stakeholders	Consultation Activities and Comment
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Business Improvement Associations • Chambers of Commerce • Niagara Industrial Association • Venture Niagara 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 15 meetings held in Aug. / Sept. • 2 follow-up emails requesting feedback and letters sent for distribution to members with proposed options, link to survey, open house/community booth info etc. • Six organizations provided comment, of which only Pelham Business Association supported the proposed DBA options
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Destination Marketing Organizations (DMOs) 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Met with Tourism Niagara on behalf of 5 DMOs in Sept. • Letter - Sept. 18 for each tourism agency describing proposed options, audit data, info about survey and public events etc. • Follow-up email with link to project website, survey and request for feedback • No comment received

Broad Based Stakeholder Consultation

Medium	Outreach Description
Letters	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 1,369 businesses <u>inside</u> Designated Business Areas (DBAs); 1,980 businesses <u>outside</u> DBAs; 125 multi-residential properties Oct 22• Contained proposed options, link to survey, open house/community booth info and invitation to contact Region
Web	• Project webpage on Niagara Region website and webpage banner Oct 23 to Nov 30
	• LAM provided with P&E for websites that had link to project webpage Oct 22
Social Media	• Facebook paid advertisement with link to project webpage; Twitter post on Niagara Region Twitter with link to project webpage; Facebook posts with details Oct 25 - Nov 28

Broad Based Stakeholder Consultation

Medium	Outreach Description
Newspaper: Print Ads Invitation to participate in stakeholder consultation with link to project webpage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Niagara This Week Oct 25, Nov 1,8,15,22
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> St. Catharines Standard Oct 27, Nov 10
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Welland Tribune, Niagara Falls Review Nov 3
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> News Now Nov 15, Nov 22
Newspaper: Online Ads (same content as print ads)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 24 hour ad - St. Catharines Standard, Welland Tribune, N.F. Review websites Oct 30, Nov 6,13, 20
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 24 hour ad - Niagara This Week website Nov 24
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1 week ad - News Now website Nov 22-29
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> 2 week ad - Niagara Independent website Nov 19-30
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Big Box Takeover- St. Catharines Standard, Welland Tribune, N.F. Review Oct 30, Nov 5,11,20

Broad Based Stakeholder Consultation

Medium	Outreach Description
Media Coverage Overview of proposed options and rationale. Reference to project webpage, survey and events	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• Media release Oct 24• Radio interview on 610 CKTB Newstalk Nov 5• Television coverage on Cogeco YourTV; accessible online and aired daily on YourTV Nov 5-30• Articles - St. Catharines Standard/Niagara Falls Review, Voice of Pelham, Erie Media Oct 28, Nov 5, 7, 23
Post Cards Invitation to participate in consultation. List of key options and link to survey/webpage	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 100-200 post cards available at each Local Area Municipal office and Regional HQ and landfill sites; distributed at every community booth and open house Oct 23 –Nov 30

Broad Based Stakeholder Consultation

Method	Responses
On-line Survey - Closed midnight, November 30, 2018	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • LDR: 6,639 completed • MR: 38 completed • IC&I and MU: 166 completed
Random Telephone Survey – Completed December 7, 2018	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • LDR only: 1,253 completed
Community Booths - Oct 30 –Nov 26 Table and poster boards with proposed options. Attendees completed on-line surveys and staff responded to questions and comments.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One booth in each LAM • In malls, arenas, community centres and libraries • Approx. 450 visitors in total at booths
Open Houses - Various dates from Nov 1-Nov 28 Presentation with question and answer period. Attendees completed on-line surveys and staff responded to questions and comments.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • One open house in each LAM • Total of 67 attendees

Broad Based Stakeholder Consultation

Method	Responses
Facebook Comments Comments posted through Niagara Region's Facebook advertisement were responded to by staff and tracked	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 1,467 comments were posted between Oct. 25 and Nov. 30
Waste Info-Line Calls, Emails and Web Submissions	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 36 comments were recorded between Oct. 29 and Nov. 28• 2 additional comments were received in June
Additional Email, Phone Call and In-Person Comments Emails, calls and comments provided in-person from residents and business owners that did not provide an address but requested a response were recorded.	<ul style="list-style-type: none">• 20 comments received between Oct. 26 and Dec. 2• 7 additional calls received in June

Recommendations

Based on results of the stakeholder engagement and consultation process, the following key recommendations are being made, for LAM comment:

- a) Include Pricing for EOW Garbage Collection
 - best practices and experience with EOW garbage collection in Niagara's municipal comparator group and the potential for significant cost avoidance and increased diversion

Recommendations

b) Four-Item Limit on Large Items, per Collection

- reflects actual usage statistics and responses from a majority of survey respondents

c) Discontinuation of Appliances and Scrap Metal Collection

- reflects actual usage statistics and responses from a majority of survey respondents

d) Change Weekly IC&I and MU Base Garbage Container Limits Inside DBAs

- based on actual usage statistics and responses from a majority of base service user on-line survey respondents, although 5 organizations representing DBAs did not support and 1 supported this change

Recommendations

- e) Change Weekly MU Base Garbage Container Limits Outside DBAs
- based on actual usage statistics and to achieve a standardized base collection service across all similar sectors (in combination with option d) above), reduce service and contract complexity, improve program communication across the region and increase diversion efforts
 - IC&I sector outside the DBAs has had 4 container limit per property, as a base service since March 2011, but only one-third of MU on-line survey respondents felt they could manage if this change was made

Conclusion/Next Steps

- Regional staff are attending LAM Committee/Council meetings to provide a presentation on the proposed collection service options and/or address any questions.
 - **Please contact Andrea Metler as soon as possible to schedule a date (andrea.metler@niagararegion.ca) .**
 - Letter issued to Clerks of each LAM (May 2018) and to each PWO (June 2018) requesting:
 - i. Municipal comments on proposed options; and
 - ii. Confirmation of enhanced services (if applicable) to be included in next contract.
- Original deadline Feb. 1, 2019 extended to Feb. 20, 2019**
- Regional staff are engaging LAM PWO on the proposed base and enhanced services
 - Report back to PW Committee