

**THE REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY OF NIAGARA  
PROCEEDINGS OF COUNCIL  
MINUTES**

**CL 13-2023**

**Thursday, September 21, 2023**

**Council Chamber - In Person and Electronic Meeting  
Niagara Region Headquarters, Campbell West  
1815 Sir Isaac Brock Way, Thorold, ON**

Council: Bradley (Regional Chair), Bateman, Campion, Chiocchio, Craiton, Davies\*, Diodati, Easton, Foster, Gale, Ganann, Heit, Huson, Insinna, Ip, Kaiser, Morocco, Redekop, Rigby, Seaborn, Secord, Siscoe\*, Steele, Ugulini, Whalen, Witteveen, Zalepa

Absent/Regrets: Grant, Jordan, Junkin, Sorrento, Villella

Staff: D. Barnhart, Chief of Staff, Governance\*, D. Carnegie, Acting Commissioner, Public Works, E. Fabiani, Client & Support Advisor, D. Gibbs, Director, Legal & Court Services, C. Habermebl, Director, Waste Management Services\*, T. Harrison, Commissioner/Treasurer, Corporate Services, A. Jugley, Commissioner, Community Services, A. Kasmani, Medical Officer of Health, S. Klair, Director, Children's Services\*, K. Lotimer, Legislative Coordinator, F. Meffe, Director, Human Resources, A.-M. Norio, Regional Clerk, C. Ogunniyi, Manager, Diversity, Equity, Inclusion and Indigenous Relations\*, M. Sergi, Commissioner, Growth Strategy & Economic Development, G. Spezza, Director, Economic Development, A. Stea, Director, Community & Long Range Planning\*, S. Tait, Manager, Policy and Planning, Waste Management Services\*, F. Tassone, Director, Transportation Services, R. Tripp, Chief Administrative Officer

Others: C. Stout, General Manager, Niagara Transit Commission\*

\* indicates members who participated electronically, all other members participated in person

---

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

Regional Chair Bradley called the meeting to order at 6:30 p.m.

**2. LAND ACKNOWLEDGMENT STATEMENT**

Councillor Huson read the Land Acknowledgment Statement.

**3. ADOPTION OF AGENDA**

Councillor Foster rose on a point of order stating he believed the delegation from Harry Schlange (Agenda Item 7.3.1) respecting Q2 Financial Update (Minute Item 6.1, Minutes CSC 9-2023) was not properly before Council as the materials submitted did not relate to the report as required in accordance with the Procedural By-law. The Chair ruled that, as the submitted materials were unrelated to the referenced report, the matter was not properly before Council; therefore, the delegation was out of order and would not be heard.

**3.1 Addition of Items**

Moved by Councillor Morocco  
Seconded by Councillor Bateman

That Tarryn Anderson, Victim Services Niagara, and Nicole Regehr, Gillian's Place, **BE PERMITTED** to appear before Council as individual delegates respecting Motion - Recommendations from the Renfrew County Inquest and Declaration of Intimate Partner Violence as an Epidemic (Agenda Item 13.1).

**Carried**

**3.2 Changes in Order of Items**

Moved by Councillor Diodati  
Seconded by Councillor Craitor

That the order of the agenda **BE AMENDED** to move the delegation respecting Additional Information Regarding Development Charges at 4389 Beechwood Road, Niagara Falls (Agenda Item 7.5) to be first under Delegations and to consider Report CSD 42-2023 (Minute Item 6.2, Minutes CSC 9-2023) immediately following the delegation on this matter.

**Carried**

Moved by Councillor Ip  
Seconded by Councillor Foster

That the order of the agenda **BE AMENDED** to move consideration of Correspondence Item CSC-C 18-2023 (Minute Item 5.3, Minutes CSC 9-2023) to immediately following the delegations on this matter and to move the motion respecting Declaration of Intimate Partner Violence as an Epidemic (Agenda Item 13.1) to immediately following the delegations regarding this motion.

**Carried**

Moved by Councillor Steele  
Seconded by Councillor Gale

That Council Agenda CL 13-2023, **BE ADOPTED**, as amended.

**Carried**

**4. DISCLOSURES OF PECUNIARY INTEREST**

There were no disclosures of pecuniary interest.

**5. PRESENTATIONS**

5.1 Orange Shirt Day and National Day for Truth and Reconciliation

Brian Kon, Indigenous Relations Advisor, and Chantelle Berry, Program Specialist, Indigenous Health, provided information respecting Orange Shirt Day and National Day for Truth and Reconciliation. Topics of the presentation included:

- September 30
- TRC Call to Action #80
- Indian Residential Schools
- Ongoing Impacts

**6. CHAIR'S REPORTS, ANNOUNCEMENTS, REMARKS**

The Regional Chair provided an update respecting activities within the Region.

**7. DELEGATIONS**

7.5 Additional Information Regarding Development Charges at 4389 Beechwood Road, Niagara Falls (Minute Item 6.2, Minutes CSC 9-2023 (Agenda Item 11.5))

7.5.1 Lucas Bahdi, Resident, City of Niagara Falls

Lucas Bahdi, Resident, City of Niagara Falls, appeared before Committee, to request a refund of the Regional portion of development charges for the property located at 4389 Beechwood Road, in the City of Niagara Falls, as he believes they were improperly collected, as a single-family dwelling had previously been on the property.

**11. COMMITTEE REPORTS - OPEN SESSION**

11.5 Corporate Services Committee

11.5.1 Minutes CSC 9-2023, Minute Item 6.2 respecting Additional Information Regarding Development Charges at 4389 Beechwood Road, Niagara Falls

The motion contained in Minute Item 6.2 was considered separately as follows:

That Report CSD 42-2023, dated September 13, 2023, respecting Additional Information Regarding Development Charges at 4389 Beechwood Road, Niagara Falls, **BE RECEIVED** for information.

Moved by Councillor Diodati  
Seconded by Councillor Morocco

That the motion **BE AMENDED** to add the following:

***That a discretionary grant to provide relief from Development Charges in the amount of \$11,471.00, for the property located at 4389 Beechwood Road, in the City of Niagara Falls, BE APPROVED and BE FUNDED by the Tax Payer relief reserve.***

**Carried**

The Regional Chair called the vote on the motion, as amended.

**Carried**

**7. DELEGATIONS**

7.1 Motion - Diversity, Equity and Inclusion and the Damaging Impacts of Hate and Intolerance (Minute Item 5.3, Minutes CSC 9-2023 (Agenda Item 11.5))

7.1.1 Jeff Loucks, Business and Individual Freedom Association (BIFA)

Jeff Loucks, Business and Individual Freedom Association, appeared before Council in opposition of the motion respecting Diversity, Equity and Inclusion and the Damaging Impacts of Hate and Intolerance and urged Council members to consider a mediation approach.

After the delegation from Mr. Loucks, the Regional Chair asked Councillors if there were any questions to the delegate. Councillor Ugulini rose on a point of order to request that questions to delegates be held until all delegations respecting this matter had been heard. The Regional Chair ruled that Councillors would be permitted to ask questions after each delegate.

After questions being posed to the first delegate, Councillor Gale rose on a point of order to challenge the ruling of the Chair regarding questions to individual delegates.

Moved by Councillor Gale  
Seconded by Councillor Ugulini

That the ruling of the Regional Chair **BE SUSTAINED**, permitting questions of delegates after each individual delegation.

**Defeated**

The ruling of the Regional Chair was not sustained, therefore Chair Bradley announced that questions to delegates would be held until all delegations on each matter had been heard.

7.1.2 Ann-Marie Zammit, Resident, City of St. Catharines

Ann-Marie Zammit, resident, City of St. Catharines, appeared before Council, in support of the motion respecting Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion and the Damaging Impacts of Hate and Intolerance, requesting Councillors to support the motion in its entirety.

7.1.3 Sabrina Hill, Resident, City of St. Catharines

Sabrina Hill, resident, City of St. Catharines, appeared before Council, in support of the motion respecting Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion and the Damaging Impacts of Hate and Intolerance.

7.1.4 Zoe Lachance, Resident, City of St. Catharines

Zoe Lachance, resident, City of St. Catharines, appeared before Council to express support for the motion respecting Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion and the Damaging Impacts of Hate and Intolerance, and urged Council members to vote in favour of the motion.

7.1.5 Liz Palmucci, Resident, City of Niagara Falls

Liz Palmucci, resident, City of Niagara Falls, appeared before Council, to express concerns with the motion respecting Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion and the Damaging Impacts of Hate and Intolerance, stating that such a motion would restrict or impede citizen involvement in local government and requested that citizens have an opportunity to provide input on ant proposed Citizen's Code of Conduct.

7.1.6 Jennifer Korstanje, Councillor, Town of Grimsby

Jennifer Korstanje, Councillor, Town of Grimsby, appeared before Council to express support for the motion respecting Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion and the Damaging Impacts of Hate and Intolerance.

**11. COMMITTEE REPORTS - OPEN SESSION**

11.5 Corporate Services Committee

11.5.2 Minutes CSC 9-2023, Minute Item 5.3 respecting Motion - Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion and the Damaging Impacts of Hate and Intolerance.

The motion contained in Minute Item 5.3 respecting Motion - Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion and the Damaging Impacts of Hate and Intolerance was considered separately as follows:

WHEREAS respect for the views and opinions of others is a hallmark of civil discourse in our society;

WHEREAS freedom of expression is a fundamental value of a free and democratic society;

WHEREAS speech that threatens violence, intimidates, abuses or bullies is not and should not be protected as free expression;

WHEREAS there have been many recent instances of violence, threats of violence, intimidation, abuse, and bullying by some individuals in the Niagara region against others for a variety of reasons other than legitimate differences of political views or opinions;

WHEREAS some elected officials in Niagara have been the subject of violent attacks, online harassment, and physical intimidation over the past several months;

WHEREAS Regional Council approved on February 17, 2022, a Resolution at the Corporate Services Committee that condemned those acts of violence, harassment, and intimidation against members of Regional Council and local area municipal councils, all public servants, and all health care providers;

WHEREAS elected officials are obligated to adhere to the provisions of codes of conduct that regulate their behaviour when serving the public; and

WHEREAS there is no excuse for bad behaviour by any individual against another.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED:

1. That Regional Council **AFFIRMS** that equity, diversity, and inclusion are core values that it supports and will continue to promote;
2. That the Niagara Regional Police Service **BE REQUESTED** to take a more assertive approach to responding to complaints of threats of violence, intimidation, and bullying of elected officials and members of local appointed committees in Niagara;
3. That staff **BE DIRECTED** to investigate the following and provide a report to the Corporate Services Committee as soon as reasonably practical:
  - a) Creation of a program to educate the public on the benefits of equity, diversity and inclusion and conversely the damaging impacts of hate and intolerance;
  - b) Whether Council should consider the creation of a residents or citizens code of conduct to guide individuals engaging elected officials or attending meetings of Regional Council and its Committees and various advisory committees;
  - c) Any further information, data or recommendations that Council should consider to alleviate incidents of hate and intolerance in Niagara;
4. That the Provincial Government **BE REQUESTED** to develop legislation and/or policies to protect elected officials and members of local appointed committees from violence, threats of violence, intimidation, abuse, and bullying by other individuals; and

5. That a copy of this Resolution **BE SENT** to the Premier of Ontario, the Minister of Municipal Affairs and Housing, the Association of Municipalities of Ontario, all municipalities in Niagara, all Niagara MPPs and MPs, and the Chief of the Niagara Regional Police Service for consideration and support.

The following friendly **amendment** to Clause 2 of the motion was accepted by the Regional Chair and the mover and seconder of the motion:

2. That the Niagara Regional Police Service **BE REQUESTED to consider the implementation of training and look to update protocols with respect to** ~~to take a more assertive approach to~~ responding to complaints of threats of violence, intimidation, and bullying of elected officials and members of local appointed committees in Niagara;

The Regional Chair called the vote on the motion, as amended.

Recorded vote:

Yes (25): Bateman, Campion, Chiocchio, Craitor, Didodati, Easton, Foster, Gale, Ganann, Heit, Huson, Insinna, Ip, Kaiser, Morocco, Redekop, Rigby, Seaborn, Secord, Siscoe, Steele, Ugulini, Whalen, Witteveen, Zalepa.

No (0).

**Carried**

## 7. **DELEGATIONS**

### 7.2 Motion - Recommendations from the Renfrew County Inquest and Declaration of Intimate Partner Violence as an Epidemic (Agenda Item 13.1)

- 7.2.1 Dr. Robyn Bourgeois, Associate Professor, Centre for Women's and Gender Studies, Brock University

Dr. Robyn Bourgeois, Associate Professor, Centre for Women's and Gender Studies, Brock University, appeared before Council as an internationally recognized academic expert in the field of gender-based violence and a member of the Domestic Violence Death Review Committee for the Chief Coroner of Ontario, to request that Regional Council support the motion declaring intimate partner violence and epidemic in Niagara Region.



7.2.2 Naheed Qureshi, Muslim Senior Circle Niagara

Naheed Qureshi, Muslim Senior Circle Niagara, appeared before Council to urge Councillors to support the motion respecting Recommendations from the Renfrew County Inquest and Declaration of Intimate Partner Violence as an Epidemic.

7.2.3 Jennifer Gauthier, Executive Director, Birchway Niagara

Jennifer Gauthier, Executive Director, Birchway Niagara, appeared before Council to request that intimate partner violence be declared an epidemic, highlighting that the implementation of the recommendations from the Renfrew County Inquest is a key step in the commitment to ending intimate partner violence and ensuring the safety and well-being of all community members.

7.2.4 Tarryn Anderson, Victim Services Niagara

Tarryn Anderson, Victim Services Niagara, and Chair of Niagara's Coalition to End Violence Against Women, appeared before Council to request that Councillors support the motion respecting Recommendations from the Renfrew County Inquest and Declaration of Intimate Partner Violence as an Epidemic.

7.2.5 Nicole Regehr, Gillian's Place

Nicole Regehr, Executive Director, Gillian's Place, appeared before Council in support of the motion respecting Recommendations from the Renfrew County Inquest and Declaration of Intimate Partner Violence as an Epidemic.

**13. MOTIONS**

13.1 Recommendations from the Renfrew County Inquest and Declaration of Intimate Partner Violence as an Epidemic

Moved by Councillor Ip  
Seconded by Councillor Steele

WHEREAS the jury that adjudicated the Carol Culleton, Anastasia Kuzyk, and Nathalie Warmerdam Inquest (The Renfrew County Inquest) issued 86 recommendations to the Province of Ontario on Intimate Partner Violence;

WHEREAS Recommendation #1 of the Inquest is for the Province of Ontario to declare Intimate Partner Violence an epidemic;

WHEREAS every six days in Canada a woman is killed by her intimate partner;

WHEREAS on any given night in Canada, more than 6,000 women and children sleep in shelters because it is not safe for them at home;

WHEREAS this past year in Ontario, 52 women, or one every week, were victims of femicide;

WHEREAS violence against Indigenous women (including but not restricted to intimate partner violence) is a national crisis, as evidenced by the findings of the National Inquiry into Missing and Murdered Indigenous Women and Girls, with Indigenous women (61%) experiencing some form of intimate partner violence in their lifetime compared with non-Indigenous women (44%);

WHEREAS gender- and sexually-diverse Indigenous women are particularly at risk, being five times more likely than non-Indigenous gender- and sexually-diverse women to experience intimate partner violence in their lifetime;

WHEREAS in Niagara Region in 2022, there were 5,160 Intimate Partner Violence calls for service made to Niagara Regional Police Service and 1,143 of those calls involved criminal investigations;

WHEREAS for the 2022-2023 fiscal year, Victim Services Niagara provided service to 749 victims of intimate partner violence, including 31 children; developed 91 safety plans for victims and had to revise 55 of those safety plans due to breaches;

WHEREAS for the 2022-2023 fiscal year, Victim Services Niagara provided service to 227 victims of sexual violence;

WHEREAS for the 2022-2023 fiscal year, Birchway Niagara received 2,571 crisis calls; supported 575 women through outreach services; 233 women and children stayed in shelter; and 278 women were turned away due to a lack of space;

WHEREAS for the 2022-2023 fiscal year, Gillian's Place received 10,383 crisis calls; supported 2,017 people through outreach services; 166 adults and 127 children lived in shelter; and 431 people were turned away due to lack of space;

WHEREAS violence against women costs the national justice system, health care systems, social service agencies, and municipalities nearly \$10 billion dollars per year and municipalities are on the front lines in addressing gender-based violence;

WHEREAS more than 40 municipalities and regions across Ontario have declared a gender-based violence and/or intimate partner violence epidemic;

WHEREAS on August 16, 2023, Justice Minister Arif Virani described gender-based violence as an epidemic and stated this his government is committed to ending the gender-based violence epidemic “in all its forms, and is working to address any gaps in the Criminal Code to ensure a robust justice system response;”

WHEREAS on August 20, 2023, Ontario Big City Mayors (OBCM) and Mayors and Regional Chairs of Ontario (MARCO) passed a motion declaring intimate partner violence and gender-based violence epidemic; called on the Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM), the Association of Municipalities of Ontario (AMO), and all municipalities and regions in Ontario and Canada to do the same; and called for changes to the Criminal Code; and

WHEREAS Niagara Regional Council recognizes that issues of gender-based violence and intimate partner violence are matters of local importance, including public health, EMS, community services, and community safety, in all of our communities.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED:

1. That Niagara Region **RECOGNIZE** the issues of gender-based violence and intimate partner violence in Niagara as serious to the health and wellness of local residents and their families;
2. That Niagara Region **COMMIT** to engaging with community partners to educate and support our residents about the seriousness and long-term danger of violence in our communities;
3. That Niagara Regional Council **DECLARE**, in accordance with Recommendation #1 of the Renfrew County Inquest, that intimate partner violence and gender-based violence are epidemic;
4. That the Regional Chair **WRITE** a letter to The Honourable Doug Ford, Premier of Ontario, requesting that the Province of Ontario re-consider their previous decision and declare intimate partner violence and gender-based violence as epidemic and act on all of 86 Recommendations from The Renfrew County Inquest;
5. That a copy of this motion **BE SENT** to each of Niagara’s 12 Local Area Municipalities requesting they endorse the declaration of intimate partner violence and gender-based violence as epidemic; and

6. That a copy of this motion **BE SENT** to The Honourable Arif Virani, Minister of Justice, The Honourable Doug Ford, Premier of Ontario, The Honourable Charmaine A. Williams, Associate Minister of Women's Social and Economic Opportunity, The Honourable Parm Gill, Minister of Red Tape Reduction, Niagara four MPs, Niagara's four MPPs, the Association of Municipalities of Ontario (AMO), the Federation of Canadian Municipalities (FCM), Mayors and Regional Chairs of Ontario (MARCO), and Ontario's Big City Mayors (OBCM).

Recorded Vote:

Yes (25): Bateman, Campion, Chiocchio, Craitor, Didodati, Easton, Foster, Gale, Ganann, Heit, Huson, Insinna, Ip, Kaiser, Morocco, Redekop, Rigby, Seaborn, Secord, Siscoe, Steele, Ugulini, Whalen, Witteveen, Zalepa.

No (0).

**Carried**

## **7. DELEGATIONS**

### 7.3 Q2 Financial Update (Minute Item 6.1, Minutes CSC 9-2023 (Agenda Item 11.5))

#### 7.3.1 Harry Schlange, Resident, Town of Niagara-on-the-Lake

This delegation was deemed out of order and was not heard.

#### 7.3.2 Liz Palmucci, Resident, City of Niagara Falls

Liz Palmucci, resident, City of Niagara Falls, advised that she was unable to delegate on this matter.

### 7.4 Appointments to Licensing Appeals Committee and Diversity, Equity and Inclusion Advisory Committee (Minute Item 5.2, Minutes CSC 9-2023 (Agenda Item 11.5))

#### 7.4.1 Liz Palmucci, Resident, City of Niagara Falls

Liz Palmucci, resident, City of Niagara Falls, appeared before Council to express concerns with the confidential nature of the names of citizens approved for appointment to the Diversity, Equity, and Inclusion Committee.

**8. ADOPTION OF MINUTES**

8.1 Council Minutes CL 12-2023

Thursday, August 17, 2023

Moved by Councillor Campion  
Seconded by Councillor Ganann

That Minutes CL 12-2023 being the Open Session minutes of the Regional Council meeting held on Thursday, August 17, 2023, **BE ADOPTED.**

**Carried**

**9. CORRESPONDENCE**

Moved by Councillor Ugolini  
Seconded by Councillor Heit

That the following items **BE RECEIVED** for information:

CL-C 59-2023

A memorandum from A.-M. Norio, Regional Clerk, dated September 21, 2023, respecting Lobbyist Registry Training Follow Up.

CL-C 60-2023

Niagara Region Integrity Commissioner Annual Report – Operating Period August 17, 2022 to August 16, 2023.

CL-C 61-2023

A memorandum from A.-M. Norio, Regional Clerk, dated September 21, 2023, respecting Appointment of Acting Deputy Regional Clerks.

**Carried**

**10. ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION**

10.1 CL-C 57-2023

Niagara Transit Commission Request for Operating Budget Adjustment (Report NTC 10-2023)

Moved by Councillor Siscoe  
Seconded by Councillor Redekop

That Correspondence Item CL-C 57-2023, dated September 21, 2023, respecting Niagara Transit Commission Request for Operating Budget Adjustment (Report NTC 10-2023), **BE RECEIVED**; and

That Regional Council **APPROVE** the adjustment to the Niagara Transit Commission operating budget as outlined in Report NTC 10-2023.

**Carried**

10.2 CL-C 58-2023

Standing Committee Appointment

Moved by Councillor Chiocchio  
Seconded by Councillor Morocco

That Correspondence Item CL-C 58-2023, dated September 21, 2023, respecting Standing Committee Appointment, **BE RECEIVED** and the following recommendation **BE APPROVED**:

1. That, effective immediately, Councillor Seaborn **BE APPOINTED** to the Public Health and Social Services Committee.

**Carried**

**11. COMMITTEE REPORTS - OPEN SESSION**

11.1 Procedural By-law Review Committee

Minutes PBLRC 5-2023, Monday, August 28, 2023

Moved by Councillor Bateman  
Seconded by Councillor Foster

That Minutes PBLRC 5-2023 being the Open Session minutes of the Procedural By-law Review Committee meeting held on Monday, August 28, 2023, **BE RECEIVED** and the recommendations contained therein **BE APPROVED**.

11.1.1 Minute Item 3.1 Respecting PBLRC-C 7-2023 Options for Consideration – Other Business/Announcements and Notice of Motion/Motions

The motion contained in Minute Item 3.1 was considered separately as follows:

That Memorandum PBLRC-C 7-2023, dated August 28, 2023, respecting Options for Consideration – Other Business/Announcements and Notice of Motion/Motions, **BE RECEIVED**; and

That staff **BE DIRECTED** to provide options respecting the agenda item "Other Business" including definitions and provisions that could be applied at both Council and Committee.

The Regional Chair called the vote on the motion respecting Minute Item 3.1 respecting PBLRC-C 7-2023 Options for Consideration – Other Business/Announcements and Notice of Motion/Motions.

**Carried**

11.1.2 Balance of Recommendations from the Procedural By-law Review Committee

The Regional Chair called the vote on the balance of the recommendations from the Procedural By-law Review Committee and declared it,

**Carried**

11.2 Committee of the Whole

Minutes COTW 1-2023, Thursday, September 7, 2023

Moved by Councillor Gale  
Seconded by Councillor Zalepa

That Minutes COTW 1-2023 being the Open Session minutes of the Committee of the Whole meeting held on Thursday, September 7, 2023, **BE RECEIVED** and the recommendations contained therein **BE APPROVED**.

**Carried**

11.3 Public Works Committee

Minutes PWC 9-2023, Tuesday, September 12, 2023

Moved by Councillor Witteveen  
Seconded by Councillor Insinna

That Minutes PWC 9-2023 being the Open and Closed Session minutes of the Public Works Committee meeting held on Tuesday, September 12, 2023, **BE RECEIVED** and the recommendations contained therein **BE APPROVED**.

**Carried**

11.4 Public Health and Social Services Committee

Minutes PHSSC 9-2023, Tuesday, September 12, 2023

Moved by Councillor Morocco  
Seconded by Councillor Craitor

That Minutes PHSSC 9-2023 being the Open Session minutes of the Public Health & Social Services Committee meeting held on Tuesday, September 21, 2023, **BE RECEIVED** and the recommendations contained therein **BE APPROVED**.

**Carried**

11.5 Corporate Services Committee

Minutes CSC 9-2023, Wednesday, September 13, 2023

Moved by Councillor Foster  
Seconded by Councillor Whalen

That Minutes CSC 9-2023 being the Open and Closed Session minutes of the Corporate Services Committee meeting held on Wednesday, September 12, 2023, **BE RECEIVED** and the recommendations contained therein **BE APPROVED**, save and except Minute Items 5.3 and 6.2.

**Carried**



11.6 Planning and Economic Development Committee

Minutes PEDC 9-2023, Wednesday, September 13, 2023

Moved by Councillor Huson  
Seconded by Councillor Davies

That Minutes PEDC 9-2023 being the Open Session minutes of the Planning and Economic Development Committee meeting held on Wednesday, September 13, 2023, **BE RECEIVED** and the recommendations contained therein **BE APPROVED**.

**Carried**

12. **CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE OFFICER'S REPORT(S)**

There were no Chief Administrative Officer's Reports.

13. **MOTIONS**

13.2 2024 Budget Mitigation Measures

Moved by Councillor Gale  
Seconded by Councillor Seaborn

WHEREAS the past practice of Regional Council was to provide staff (departments) and associated Agencies, Boards and Commissions (ABCs) with a budget guidance benchmark prior to the development and presentation of the annual budget;

WHEREAS the purpose of this budget guidance benchmark was to direct staff to produce an annual budget in accordance to this Council direction, with prioritization of projects and programs;

WHEREAS this past practice, for unknown reasons, appears to have stopped;

WHEREAS the 2023 total (operating and capital) budget was \$1,512 million, which after revenues, translated to a \$38.3 million (or 9.43%) increase to the levy, that was reduced 1.85% via assessment growth, AND, a rate increase of \$11.3 million (or 8.59%) in water and wastewater, AND, an increase of 2.3 million (or 5.6%) in a special waste management levy, AND, another \$56.5 million (or 100%) in a special transit levy;

WHEREAS the 2022 total budget was \$1,447,877,873, which after revenues, translated to a \$17 million (or 4.19%) increase to the levy, and a rate increase of \$8.7 million (or 5.24%) in water, wastewater and waste management services;

WHEREAS the 2021 total budget was \$ 1,559,292,828, which after revenues, translated to a \$12.7 million (or 3.24%) increase to the levy, AND, a rate increase of \$4.2 million (or 2.60%) in water, wastewater and waste management services;

WHEREAS the 2020 total budget was \$1,390,740,868, which after revenues, translated to a \$26.8 million (or 7.34%) increase to the levy, AND, a rate increase of \$9.5 million (or 6.25%) in water, wastewater and waste management services;

WHEREAS the 2019 total budget was \$ 1,248,177,885, which after revenues, translated to a \$19 million (or 5.47%) increase to the levy, and a rate increase of \$6.5 million (or 4.43%) in water, wastewater and waste management services;

WHEREAS staff have presented a 2024 budget with a projected levy increase of 9%;

WHEREAS from 2019 to 2023, the overall levy has increased \$113.8 million (or 19%) in property taxes and another \$42.5 million in rates;

WHEREAS household incomes have not increased 19% over this time, and will not increase another 9% in 2024;

WHEREAS net revenue for small businesses have not increased 19% over this time, and will not increase another 9% in 2024;

WHEREAS housing affordability has become a crisis in Niagara Region;

WHEREAS operating a small business in Niagara has become unprofitable; and

WHEREAS Regional Chair Jim Bradley released a statement on the 2024 budget that read, in part, "I want to publicly state that I find an increase of this amount to be unacceptable, and it is my expectation that senior staff will work with Regional Council to find ways to manage the increase and bring in a budget that is more affordable to taxpayers.

NOW THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED:

1. That Regional Council **ADOPT** the following budget mitigation measures:
  - a) That all regional departments and ABCs adopt a 2.5% budget guideline for 2024;

- b) That the Region of Niagara implement an immediate hiring freeze, and that all special circumstances for additional staffing in 2024 be submitted via a Business Case to the appropriate Standing Committee for consideration; and
- c) That all non-unionized staff earning greater than \$125,000 per annum have their wages frozen based on their 2023 compensation.

Moved by Councillor Huson  
Seconded by Councillor Kaiser

That the motion respecting 2024 Mitigation Measures **BE REFERRED** to the Budget Review Committee of the Whole, to allow staff to provide information respecting actions necessary to attain a 2.5% budget increase.

**Carried**

13.3 Auditor General's Special Report on Changes to the Greenbelt

The Regional Chair advised that the motion respecting Auditor General's Special Report on Changes to the Greenbelt was not received in accordance with Section 11.3 of the Procedural By-law; and would require a suspension of the rules of procedure in order to be considered.

Moved by Councillor Bateman  
Seconded by Rigby

That the rules of procedure, specifically Section 11.3 of the Procedural By-law, **BE SUSPENDED** to permit consideration of the motion respecting Auditor General's Special Report on Changes to the Greenbelt to be introduced.

Two-thirds majority not being achieved, the vote was declared,

**Defeated**

14. NOTICES OF MOTION

There were no notices of motion.

15. OTHER BUSINESS

There were no items of other business.

**16. CLOSED SESSION**

Councillor Gale indicated that he wanted to discuss Confidential Item CSD 41-2023, Minute Item 1.1, Closed Session minutes CSC 9-2023.

The Regional Clerk advised that the Closed Session minutes of the Corporate Services Committee meeting held on September 21, 2023, had been approved by Council under Agenda Item 11.5; therefore a motion to reconsider would be required.

Moved by Councillor Gale  
Seconded by Councillor

That Regional Council **RECONSIDER** the approval of Closed Session minutes CSC 9-2023.

Two-thirds majority not being achieved, the motion was declared,

**Defeated**

Moved by Councillor Huson  
Seconded by Councillor Ip

That Council **DO NOW MOVE** into closed session for the purposes of receiving information of a confidential nature respecting:

A Matter respecting Personal Matters about Identifiable Individuals under s. 239(2) of the Municipal Act, 2001 - Recruitment of Commissioner of Public Works and Deputy Chief Administrative Officer

**Carried**

Moved by Councillor Witteveen  
Seconded by Councillor Ugulini

That Regional Council **EXTEND** this meeting's curfew to 11:00 p.m.

**Carried**

Council resolved into closed session at 10:07 p.m.

**17. BUSINESS ARISING FROM CLOSED SESSION**

Council reconvened in open session at 10:29 p.m., with the following individuals in attendance:

Council: Bradley (Regional Chair), Bateman, Campion, Chiocchio, Craitor, Davies\*, Diodati, Easton, Foster, Ganann, Heit, Huson, Insinna, Ip, Kaiser, Morocco, Redekop, Rigby, Seaborn, Secord, Siscoe\*, Steele, Ugulini, Whalen, Witteveen, Zalepa

Absent/Regrets: Gale, Grant, Jordan, Junkin, Sorrento, Villella

Staff: F. Meffe, Director, Human Resources, A.-M. Norio, Regional Clerk, R. Tripp, Chief Administrative Officer

\* indicates members who participated electronically, all other members participated in person

**17.1 Confidential CAO 12-2023**

A Matter respecting personal matters about Identifiable Individuals under s. 239(2) of the Municipal Act, 2001 - Recruitment of Commissioner of Public Works and Deputy Chief Administrative Officer.

Moved by Councillor Foster  
Seconded by Councillor Whalen

That Confidential Report CAO 12-2023, dated September 21, 2023, respecting A Matter respecting Personal Matters about Identifiable Individuals under s. 239(2) of the Municipal Act, 2001 - Recruitment of Commissioner of Public Works and Deputy Chief Administrative Officer, **BE RECEIVED** and the recommendations contained therein **BE APPROVED**.

**Carried**

**18. BY-LAWS**

Moved by Councillor Seaborn  
Seconded by Councillor Witteveen

That the following Bills **BE NOW READ** and **DO PASS**:

Bill 2023-60

A by-law authorizing the borrowing upon amortizing debentures in the principal amount of \$100,000.00 for a capital work of The Corporation of the Town of Lincoln.

Bill 2023-61

A by-law to authorize the borrowing upon amortizing debentures in the principal amount of \$1,833,342.36 for a capital work of The Corporation of the Town of Lincoln.

Bill 2023-62

A by-law to authorize the borrowing upon amortizing debentures in the principal amount of \$11,162,500.00 for a capital work of The Corporation of the Town of Lincoln.

Bill 2023-63

A by-law to authorize the borrowing upon amortizing debentures in the principal amount of \$3,181,100.00 for a capital work of The Corporation of the Town of Fort Erie.

Bill 2023-64

A by-law to authorize the borrowing upon amortizing debentures in the principal amount of \$820,000.00 for a capital work of The Corporation of the Town of Niagara-on-the-Lake.

Bill 2023-65

A by-law to authorize the borrowing upon amortizing debentures in the aggregate principal amount of \$2,210,200.00 for capital works of The Corporation of the City of St. Catharines.

Bill 2023-66

A by-law to authorize the borrowing upon serial debentures in the aggregate principal amount of \$2,672,600.00 for capital works of The Corporation of the Township of West Lincoln.

Bill 2023-67

A by-law to appoint an Integrity Commissioner for The Regional Municipality of Niagara and to Repeal By-law 2021-37.

Bill 2023-68

A by-law to amend By-law 120-2010, being The Procedural By-law.

Bill 2023-69

A by-law to Appoint Acting Deputy Regional Clerks.

Bill 2023-70

A by-law to amend By-law 89-200 to provide the regulation of traffic on Regional Highways (Stopping prohibition Regional Road 81 in The Town of Niagara-on-the-Lake).

Bill 2023-71

A by-law to amend By-law 89-2000 being a By-law to Provide for the Regulation of Traffic on Regional Highways (Consolidated Schedule W (Speed Limits)).

Bill 2023-72

A by-law to appoint a Temporary Deputy Regional Clerk.

Bill 2023-73

A by-law to adopt, ratify and confirm the actions of Regional Council at its meeting held September 21, 2023.

**Carried**

**19. ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 10:34 p.m.

---

Jim Bradley  
Regional Chair

---

Kelly Lotimer  
Legislative Coordinator

---

Ann-Marie Norio  
Regional Clerk