Waste Management Advisory Committee Meeting Minutes

Wednesday, May 15, 2019, 7 p.m.

Niagara Region Headquarters Building, Campbell West, Committee Room 4 1815 Sir Isaac Brock Way, Thorold, Ontario

WMAC Members Present

Ms. Holly Washuta

Mr. Vince Pignataro

Dr. Abrar Baig

Mr. Rocco DiMatteo

Dr. John Bacher

Regrets

Mr. Gregg Furtney

Mr. Gavin Coman

Absent

Mr. Mike Balsom

Niagara Region Waste Management Services Staff Present

Mr. Brad Whitelaw, Waste Management Policy and Planning Program Manager Ms. Sandy Sawatzky, Waste Management Clerk/Program Administrator

1. Approval of Agenda

Motion: To approve the May 15, 2019 Agenda

Moved By: Vince Pignataro Seconded By: Rocco DiMatteo

Carried.

2. Business Arising from Previous Minutes

There was no business arising from previous minutes

3. Presentations

There were no presentations

4. Items for Consideration

There were no items for consideration

5. Items for Information

Motion: to receive as block Moved By: Dr. John Bacher Seconded By: Dr. Abrar Baig

Carried.

5.2 WMPSC-C 4-2019

Illegal Dumping

- Member commented that it seemed like a lot of effort for very little result (i.e. 2 convictions 1 fine). Dumping is going up; effort is going up.
- Response The 11% figure is the increase in reporting in 2018, compared to 2017, not an increase in illegal dumping incidents. With the ability for residents to report illegal dumping, the number of reports are going up, but it does not mean the number of illegal dumping incidents are going up.
- Member asked where the illegal dumping is occurring.
- Response The Region has jurisdiction for illegal dumping which occurs on public property only, not on private property.
- A member felt illegal dumping can be classified into 2 categories: 1) casual littering, and 2) other criminally-large amounts (i.e. people who are habitual and use the same place).
- Member commented that areas should have more garbage bins, like plazas.
- Response By raising awareness and having different avenues for reporting and staff investigating them, this should help to reduce illegal dumping incidents.
- Member commented on plaza owners with dumpsters illegal dumping from other people in these bins (has seen mattresses etc.)
- Response Some residents may not be aware of Region's large item collection service. The Region provides information on its website, brochures to new homeowners when they pick up their recycling bins, etc.

5.3 WMPSC-C 5-2019

Public Stakeholder Engagement Results on Proposed Collection Service Options

- Member commented on the Metroline report and number of phone calls made to obtain their findings.
- Response To obtain the requested margin of error and obtain all of the demographics in the various local area municipalities, Metroline had to make more than this number of phone calls. The number in the report is the actual number of completed calls.
- Member asked when making the calls, were they made during specific hours? If no answer, was a message left?
- Response Metroline called all day, up to 8 p.m. Resident was asked if they were available to respond to survey or request a call back, at a later time. Landlines and cell numbers were called.
- Member asked if residents were told how long the survey would take.
- Response Yes, residents were told it will take about 7 to 8 minutes (page 127 of Metroline Report). Metroline are professionals and performed similar studies for Waterloo Region and City of Hamilton.

- Member suggested increasing the results by reducing the time to complete the survey.
- Response Some residents were able to complete the survey within a few minutes, but others may have needed a longer time, in order to explain the questions further.
- Member suggested an option that may have been missed should have been "Every other week garbage collection in winter months" only to prevent maggets.
- Response –When bidding on the contract, a bidder would need to include pricing, based on the maximum number of trucks needed to cover weekly garbage collection throughout the rest of the year. As a result, there would not be any cost savings to this option.
- Member mentioned again the issue with maggots in the summer, if every other week garbage collection is implemented.
- Response If residents recycle and utilize the Green Bin, then what is left in the garbage bag won't attract maggots.

5.4 WMPSC-C 6-2019

Special Events Recycling and Organics – 2018 Program Results

- Member asked if there are a lot of costs associated with these events.
- Response As the Region receives more interest in this program, costs will increase. In addition, there were increased costs in 2018 for the purchase of new carts and locks. Niagara Region continues to strengthen its partnership with Eco-Defenders.

5.9 <u>WMPSC-C 13-2019</u>

Multi-Residential Textile Diversion Pilot Program Update

- Member asked how the Region's Multi-Residential (MR) textile program was progressing.
- Response Niagara Region will be looking at expanding this program. Q1 2019 results show about 3,500 kg of textiles were collected from 15 MR properties.
- Member asked for clarification of which items are included as textiles in this program.
- Response Textiles include: belts, shoes, clothing, purses, drapes, sheets, etc. Collection bins are set-up at various MR buildings, and the collected items are sent to local charities.
- Member asked if Community Care was involved in the MR textile program.
- Response A Request For Quotation was issued in October 2017.
 Community Care did not submit a bid. The three successful qualifying not-for-profit organizations were: Goodwill Niagara, Diabetes Canada, and Big Brothers Big Sisters of Niagara Falls.

5.10 WMPSC-C 15-2019

Recycling Centre End Market Update

- Member asked if prices were changing for cardboard and other recyclables.
- Response With the implementation of the Chinese National Sword Policy in 2018, there are stricter requirements regarding quality of recyclables. This has resulted in a significant impact on end markets and lower revenues for municipalities. For fibres (i.e. cardboard, newsprint, boxboard) and containers, the Region has taken a significant hit, anticipating an overall budget short fall of \$3.3 million in 2019. Niagara Region has a two stream recycling collection program, so its losses would be less than those municipalities with a single stream recycling collection program.

5.11 <u>WMPSC-C 18-2019</u>

Anti-Litter Campaign

- Member felt this is a great campaign and hopes to be able to piggy back it with other programs.
- Response The Region is actively trying to promote anti-litter, including placing advertising in bus shelters, social media, and working with various clean-up groups (i.e. Clean City).
- Member felt this is a nice program that should be presented to elementary school kids.
- Response The Region's interns do make presentations at schools and summer camps on various Waste Management topics.

5.12 WMPSC-C 20-2019

Recycling Product News - Building on a Unique Model

- Member inquired if the Region's Recycling Centre is in jeopardy under the new Provincial Legislation.
- Response Extended Producer Responsibility could result in stewards being responsible for all aspects of the recycling program (i.e. collection, processing). We don't have any specific details from the Province on when this would occur, however the anticipated timeline is within the next 3-5 years.
- Member asked if there are any municipalities or companies building new processing facilities or expanding their existing facilities.
- Response Building new facilities or expanding an existing facility could result in an extensive payback period. If stewards do take over within the next 5 years, municipalities may not receive any payback on their investment.

5.13 PWC-C 1-2019

Emterra Collection Contract Update

- Staff explained the Region is continuing to working with Emterra on their collection issues.
- Member mentioned in his area, when Emterra misses their collection day, residents are really good about it. They will call in and if not collected one day, then it is usually collected the next day.
- Response When doing the stakeholder consultation for the next contract, the Region heard complaints from residents, including "if they missed one week, then it would a month with no collection, under an every-other-week garbage collection scenario". When the Province's minimum wage went up, it was difficult to retain collection staff. Toronto and Hamilton have a mixture of municipal and contract employees. Toronto has a living wage clause included in their contract.
- Member asked if they can do that in Toronto, why not here.
- Response Our current collection contract does not include this provision.
- Member commented that waste collection is a very difficult job to do.
 Residents notice it because it is so important. As a result, when something goes wrong, everybody is aware of it.

5.14 PW 20-2019

Base and Enhanced Services for Next Collection Contract

- Member mentioned the problems with Emterra could be inevitable by accepting the lowest bid, and he hopes this will not happen with the future contract.
- Response The Region's next contract will be issued using the Request For Proposal (RFP) process. This will allow for the decision to award to be based on other criteria, not just on lowest price. The purpose of the stakeholder consultations was to determine which collection services (i.e. every-other-week garbage) to include in the RFP. Waterloo Region realized a savings of \$1.5 million per year by implementing every-other-week garbage collection.
- Member stated he hopes some of the problems from the past won't be repeated.
- Response Collection vehicles typically last only 7 years. By extending Emterra's contract, they needed to invest more money for maintenance on them. It wouldn't be feasible for Emterra to purchase new collection vehicles, at this point in the contract.

5.15 Staff Directions Update

- No outstanding staff requests.
- 5.16 <u>WMAC Meeting Minutes</u> November 21, 2018 (Approved via Email)

6. Other Business

- Member asked about student housing in the area. Can the Region send them information, as they come from different areas?
- Response The Region does work with Brock University and Niagara College, and sends out letters in the spring and fall, which includes information on large item collection, recycling, etc. These letters go out to students and the landlords.
- Member asked if the Region meets with the dons of these residences.
- Response Yes, the Region meets with Brock University and Niagara College to advise and provide assistance.
- Member asked about flushable wipes. They shouldn't be able to call them flushable, when they are not. Where does the Region stand on this matter?
- Response The Region's Water/Waste Water Division already provides outreach to inform the public not to flush them down their toilet. Staff will provide a copy of this article to the Region's Water/Waste Water Division, for comment, and will report back to Committee on comments received.
- Member mentioned in their neighborhood, people going for walks carry a plastic bag to pick up litter. Would this be a good campaign for the Region to implement (i.e. "Leave it cleaner than the way you found it")? Another member suggested maybe just a campaign slogan or piggy back on the anti-litter program.

7. Next Meeting

Wednesday, September 18, 2019, 7 p.m.

Niagara Region Headquarters Building, Campbell West, Committee Room 4 1815 Sir Isaac Brock Way, Thorold, Ontario.

8. Adjournment - 8:30 p.m.

Motion: To adjourn

Moved By: Dr. John Bacher **Seconded By:** Vince Pignataro

Carried.

Staff Requests

1) Member brought in an article "Enviro group asks Competition bureau to probe claim of flushable wipes?" to the Committee, and requested Waste Management staff bring it to the attention of the Water/Waste Water Division, for their comment.

Note – If you require any accommodations for a disability in order to attend and participate in the WMAC meeting, please contact the Accessibility Advisory Coordinator at 905-980-6000, extension 3253, to make the appropriate arrangements.