



THE REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY OF NIAGARA
CITIZEN COMMITTEE ON COUNCIL REMUNERATION
AGENDA

CCCR 3-2019

Friday, October 4, 2019

2:00 p.m.

Campbell East (CE) 103

Niagara Region Headquarters, Campbell East

1815 Sir Isaac Brock Way, Thorold

	Pages
1. <u>CALL TO ORDER</u>	
2. <u>DISCLOSURES OF PECUNIARY INTEREST</u>	
3. <u>PRESENTATIONS</u>	
4. <u>DELEGATIONS</u>	
5. <u>ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION</u>	
5.1 <u>CCCR-C 5-2019</u> Town of Banff - Council Remuneration Review Committee Report	3 - 24
5.2 <u>CCCR-C 6-2019</u> Approach Outline for Citizen Committee on Council Remuneration <i>This item is the Committee's outline for their review of Council remuneration based on the discussions to date.</i>	25 - 29
6. <u>CONSENT ITEMS FOR INFORMATION</u>	
6.1 <u>CCCR 2-2019</u> Minutes - Citizen Committee on Council Remuneration Tuesday, September 17, 2019	30 - 32
7. <u>OTHER BUSINESS</u>	

8. **NEXT MEETING**

The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, October 16, 2019 at 9:30 a.m. in Room CE 103.

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

If you require any accommodations for a disability in order to attend or participate in meetings or events, please contact the Accessibility Advisory Coordinator at 905-980-6000 (office), 289-929-8376 (cellphone) or accessibility@niagararegion.ca (email).



Council Remuneration Review Committee Report

June 2017

Committee Members:

David Bayne
Connie Macdonald
Brian Smythe

Table of Contents

Background	Page 3
Committee Terms of Reference	Page 4
Statement of Principles	Page 4
Approach	Page 5
Recommendations and Rationale	Page 8
Summary of Recommendations	Page 13

Appendices

1. Council Remuneration Review Committee Terms of Reference
2. Comparator Municipalities Market Analysis Table
3. Municipal Officers Expense Allowance Elimination Calculations
4. Council Remuneration Policy 076-2

Background

Council has established a Council Remuneration Policy that sets out compensation and benefits for the duly elected council of the day. The policy attempts to strike a balance between the work that is required of a public official and the call to serve one's community.

Council Compensation Policy C076-2 states that members of Banff Town Council will be provided with fair and reasonable remuneration for performing the duties of their office and reimbursement for the expenses that they incur in fulfilling their responsibilities.

Council salaries were first established in 1989 by a consultant hired to set salary grids for staff and council prior to the town's incorporation. Council salaries were adjusted in 2000 using a calculation based on cost of living increases received by the Town of Banff employees for the previous ten years. In 2006, the Town of Banff Corporate Affairs Sub-Committee was established to review and make recommendations on the remuneration provided to council. Following submission of the sub-committee's report, Council established its current remuneration and formula to determine increases on an annual basis.

In 2012, council convened a public committee to review council compensation and provide their recommendations for change. The Council Compensation Review Committee was established with a mandate to review, develop and present a report and recommendation of Council Remuneration for the term 2013-2016. The current Council Remuneration Policy C076-2 was adopted by council in July of 2013. The new policy stipulated that that a comprehensive remuneration review would take place every election year prior to the election, and that the review will be conducted through a committee comprised of Banff residents.

In the fall of 2016, council established the terms of reference and recruitment profiles for a Council Remuneration Review Committee (CRRC) and directed administration to advertise for the positions. Administration recruited members for the committee using newspaper advertisements, social media and the Town's website. Council appointed members at their 2016 annual organizational meeting. The appointed members brought a wealth of experience including expertise in financial management, human resources, intergovernmental relations and leadership.

The 2017 CRRC is comprised of three members: Mr. David Bayne, Ms. Connie Macdonald, and Mr. Brian Smythe. Two individuals who served during the 2013 remuneration review were appointed once again in 2016, thus providing the Committee with continuity and further insights into previous recommendations.

The Manager of Human Resources and the Municipal Clerk provided staff support to the public committee.

Committee Terms of Reference

The Terms of Reference identifies the Committee as an independent body charged with reviewing and bringing forward recommended changes on guiding principles for remuneration, base salary and per diems, benefits and allowance, full time equivalent status and periodic adjustments and remuneration review for the mayor and councilors.

The final report and recommendation of the CRRC are not binding upon council, and may be amended or set aside as council deems appropriate.

The Terms of Reference are attached to this report as Appendix B.

Statement of Guiding Principles for Town of Banff Council Remuneration

The CRRC recognized the importance of considering both the unique circumstance of public office within the Town of Banff, and the review of compensation as it relates to municipal public office in a manner that reflects the duties, responsibilities, skill, effort, authority and decision making. The residents of Banff believe that the Mayor and Councillors bring value to the community and should be remunerated appropriately in accordance with Banff's unique iconic stature as an international tourist destination and associated public profile of its elected officials.

The philosophy is to base the compensation for the Mayor and Councillors on a realistic scale and should reflect the demanding nature and responsibilities of that public office in order to attract capable candidates; however such compensation must also be reasonable to both members of council and to the citizens of Banff.

The CRRC's deliberations and resulting recommendations were undertaken with consideration of the following:

- There is a need for greater accountability to address growing expectations of the community with respect to the Mayor and Councillors' responsibilities and obligations throughout their term of office.
- Council salaries should not be perceived as a barrier to those seeking to serve the public in the office of Mayor or Councillor.
- The level of compensation should attract competent, motivated and well qualified community-minded citizens for the offices of Mayor and Councillor.
- The complexity, responsibilities, time commitments and accountabilities associated with the role of Mayor and Council in our community is unique based on its stature as an international tourist destination.
- Remuneration must be transparent, fiscally responsible, and easily understood by the electorate.

Approach

The first meeting of the CRRC was held in February of 2017. Following a review of the Terms of Reference for the Committee, members spent time in each meeting reviewing background information gathered to support their work. Information included previous council compensation review documentation and reports, Town of Banff policies pertaining to council remuneration, allowance and expenses, comparator municipality compensation information and recent compensation review reports from other municipalities. The CRRC reviewed, in detail, the approved remuneration recommendations following the 2013 compensation review to determine if they were still relevant given today's circumstances.

The CRRC held three subsequent meetings. Meetings focused on the selection of an appropriate comparator group of municipalities based on criteria to compare compensation practices, the establishment of a Statement of Principles, a review of total compensation, and development of the included recommendations against the Statement of Principles.

The review process was consistent with the Committee Terms of Reference and as part of the review process, the following documents, surveys and information were reviewed and discussed by the CRRC:

- Approved Town of Banff documents related to Council remuneration
- Information concerning the roles and responsibilities of municipal councils
- 2013 Town of Banff Council Compensation Review Report to Council
- Survey of current council on compensation and with an estimation of time commitments for the current Mayor and Council
- Council Remuneration Municipal Comparisons
 - City of Airdrie
 - Town of Canmore
 - Town of Chestermere
 - Town of Cochrane
 - Town of High River
 - Town of Okotoks
 - Town of Strathmore
 - MD of Foothills
 - Rockyview County
 - Resort Municipality of Whistler
 - Town of Sylvan Lake

* All reference documents are available from the Town of Banff Municipal Clerk.

Input from Members of Council

Members of council were asked to complete a questionnaire developed by the CRRC. Questions posed to council related to past, current and future demands being placed on council and the compensation received for performing their duties.

Town of Banff Council Compensation Philosophy

The CRRC was briefed on the Town of Banff's compensation philosophy and principles around council's current remuneration based on the work of the previous review committee. These are the guiding principles that drive the Town's decision-making about how to pay council. In keeping with the compensation philosophy the committee aimed at providing a total compensation package that attracts suitable candidates balanced with the commitment to effective stewardship of public funds.

Market Survey Findings of Comparative Municipalities

The CRRC engaged administration to conduct research of comparator municipalities to assist them in making informed recommendations.

The following municipalities were established by the CRRC as the appropriate comparator for the purposes of establishing compensation for elected officials:

- Town of Canmore
- Town of Cochrane
- Town of Okotoks
- Resort Municipality of Whistler

Compensation and allowance information provided from these comparative municipalities are included within this report as Appendix C.

Municipal Officers Expense Allowance - 2017 Federal Budget Changes

The CRRC was updated by administration on changes in the 2017 Federal Budget that would affect council's current municipal officer's expense allowance.

Under the current federal tax legislation, up to one-half of a municipal councilor's total remuneration can be excluded from income (tax free). Total remuneration consists of a council members salaries, per diems, and general expense allowance.

While the federal tax laws allow up to one-half of total salary to be excluded from income, Alberta council members are only entitled, under the Municipal Government Act to receive one-third of their remuneration as a general allowance. Councillor's are not required to account for the allowance.

257.1(2) One third of the remuneration paid in 1999 and later years by a municipality to a councilor is deemed to be an allowance for expenses that are incidental to the discharge of the councilor's duties.

Currently Town council members remain under this provision with one-third of their remuneration being treated as expenses related to carrying out their duties (a tax free allowance) and two-thirds of their council remuneration remains taxable. This sum is not reflected in their salaries.

The 2017 Federal Budget eliminates the councillor tax exemption

- *Remove the tax exemptions for non-accountable expense allowances paid to members of provincial and territorial legislative assemblies and to certain municipal office-holders. This exemption is only available to certain provincial, territorial and municipal office holders, and provides an advantage that other Canadians do not enjoy.*

Further detail in the 2017 Federal budget States:

The reimbursement of expenses incurred in the course of carrying out the duties of an office or employment is generally not a taxable benefit to the recipient. By contrast, a non-accountable allowance for which an individual does not have to provide details or submit receipts to justify amounts paid is generally a taxable benefit.

Municipal officials may, however, receive non-accountable allowances for work expenses that are not included in computing income for tax purposes.

Budget 2017 proposes to require that non-accountable allowances paid to these officials be included in income. The reimbursement of employment expenses will remain a non-taxable benefit to the recipient.

In order to provide affected organizations more time to adjust their compensation schemes, this measure will apply to the 2019 and subsequent taxation years.

The CRRC considered the various options including:

- 1) Continuation of one-third tax free for 2018 and fully taxable, no change in gross pay in 2019.
- 2) Continuation of one-third tax free for 2018 and fully taxable and adjust gross pay to maintain same net pay in 2019.
- 3) Discontinuation of one-third tax free in 2018 and establish fully taxable gross pay starting the beginning of the 2017-2021 term of office.

There are no additional financial implications should the council decide to retain the one-third tax exempt status starting for 2018 and not adjust the gross pay in 2019.

Eliminating the one-third tax exempt status in 2018 and establishing the total compensation amounts starting at the beginning of the next council term would result in an annual financial impact of approximately \$35,000 starting in 2019 rather than 2018 due to increased compensation amounts.

A comparative analysis of the three options with detailed calculations (i.e. income tax projections) is attached as Appendix D to this report. The calculation for mayor assumes single source of income from the Town, and the calculations for councillor assume multiple sources of income. Actual marginal tax rates will vary based on all sources of income and deductions available to members of council.

Recommendations & Rationale

Recommendations on the Remuneration of the Mayor

The position of Mayor should remain a full-time position.

That effective upon the swearing in of a new Council in October, 2017, the Mayor remuneration should be adjusted to reflect the average of the comparator group (Canmore, Cochrane, Okotoks and Whistler); and that the mayor should not receive per diems.

Further it is recommended that the 1/3 tax exempt allowance be retained for the year 2018. Effective 2019, the one-third tax-free portion of the mayor's remuneration would be eliminated and the mayor's salary be adjusted to generally reflect a neutral impact on the mayor's net salary.

Specifically, it is recommended that the base salary for the Mayor be adjusted as follows:

- (a) Effective October 23, 2017 until December 23, 2018 increase from \$79,953 to \$80,540. (1/3 non taxable)
- (b) Effective December 24, 2018 (first pay of 2019) increase from \$80,540 to \$93,426 (100% taxable); plus the market percentage increase approved in the annual budget and granted to all other Town of Banff employees.
- (c) In 2020 and 2021 increase the salary by the same market percentage approved in the annual budget and granted to all other Town of Banff employees.

Rationale

The role of the Mayor of Banff has evolved over time. The Mayor has all the responsibilities of the other members of Council as well as actively advocating for the Town of Banff at local, provincial, national and even international levels. There is an expectation from the public that there is more importance placed on the role of the Mayor, including visibility and public commitments. There is also a need to establish a system of remuneration which would appropriately reflect these job requirements while recognizing the loss of other income opportunities while serving as mayor.

The work of the Mayor cannot be confined to a definable period of daily business, but is a seven-day-a-week commitment. Personal time, including vacations, can only be planned around this commitment.

The remuneration of Mayor is reflective of the time commitment and degree of responsibility for this position.

Analysis was conducted using the comparator municipalities to determine what the salary level should be for the position of Mayor.

Analysis indicated that no additional compensation should be provided for items such as chairing committees or representing the Town at an agency, board or committee.

With regard to the 1/3 tax exempt allowance, the CRRC is of the view that while members of council may not necessarily anticipate a salary increase during their term of office, they do not expect a decrease, nor is a decrease appropriate. As the current one-third tax free provides a savings to the municipality it should be maintained in 2018.

Recommendations on the Remuneration of Councillors

Recommendation

The position of councilor continues should continue to be considered part-time with remuneration to be based on one-third of the mayor's salary.

That effective upon the swearing in of a new Council in October, 2017, Councillors should be remunerated at approximately one-third of that of the Mayor, which would be \$26,900 per annum.

Further it is recommended that the 1/3 tax exempt allowance be retained for the year 2018. Effective 2019, the one-third tax-free portion of a councillor's remuneration would be eliminated and the councillor's salary adjusted to generally reflect a neutral impact on the councillor's net salary.

Specifically it is recommended that the base salary for the Councillors be adjusted as follows:

- (a) Effective October 23, 2017 until December 23, 2018 increase from \$26,478 to \$26,900. (1/3 non taxable)
- (b) Effective December 24, 2018 (first pay of 2019) increase from \$26,900 to \$30,185 (100% taxable); plus the market percentage increase approved in the annual budget and granted to all other Town of Banff employees.
- (c) In 2020 and 2021 increase the salary by the same market percentage approved in the annual budget and granted to all other Town of Banff employees.

Rationale

Banff Councillors' work is such that a significant part-time commitment on the part of the elected official to fully perform their duties and obligations is necessary. Councillors' responsibilities require members to prepare for and attend meetings and events in addition to keeping informed on current issues while maintaining contact with residents. It should be understood that Councillors in a small community have a high public profile and that they are often required to be engaged with constituents on a daily basis.

Again, with regard to the 1/3 tax exempt allowance, the CRRC is of the view that while members of council may not anticipate a salary increase during their term of office, they do not expect a decrease, nor is a decrease appropriate. As the current one-third tax free provides a savings to the municipality it should be maintained in 2018.

Recommendation on Per Diems

Recommendation

That Councillors continue to receive a per diem for required attendance as an official representative outside the Bow Valley and that the same rates for per diems be retained in 2018.

It is recommended that the per diem rate be adjusted starting in 2019 to be net pay neutral based on the elimination of the 1/3 tax-free municipal officers expense. As the current one-third tax free provides a savings to the municipality it should be maintained in 2018.

Specifically the per diem rates should be as follows:

(a) Effective October 23, 2017

4 hours and less	\$90.00 (1/3 non taxable)
More than 4 hours	\$180.00 (1/3 non-taxable)

(b) Effective December 24, 2018

4 hours and less	\$105.00 (100% taxable)
More than 4 hours	\$210.00 (100% taxable)

Further, the CRRC recommends that for the purposes of travel the Bow Valley continued to be defined to include only Banff and Canmore.

Rationale

Currently the per diem rate is \$180 per day (4 hours or more) and \$90 per half day (4 hours or less). This is an amount that a Councillor would receive when out of the Bow Valley on Town business. This amount is to offset the salary amount when they need to take a day off work.

The Mayor would not receive a per diem as she or he would now be compensated as working in a full-time position and would continue to receive regular salary.

Recommendation on the Process for Future Remuneration Increases

Recommendation

That Mayor and Council Base Remuneration continue to be adjusted effective January 1 of each year by the same market formula used in the annual adjustment for Town wages approved in the Financial Plan for all Town of Banff employees.

Rationale

Due to the perceived conflict of interest in the process for wage adjustments, the level of compensation from members of council should be adjusted from time to time by an arm's length process.

The CRRC concluded that the amount of this adjustment was an acceptable basis for annual changes in compensation for council. The CRRC believes that an annual adjustment to the pay system ensures that council remuneration keeps pace with inflation and that large adjustment increases will not be required in the future.

Recommendation on Health Benefits Offered

Recommendation

That the current group extended health benefits plan and contributions rates provided for the class of elected officials be maintained for those members of Council who choose to be covered.

Council Member Group Benefits include:

- Life Insurance and Accidental Death and Dismemberment
- Dental Care
- Extended Health Care
- Employment and Family Assistance Program (confidential counselling)

Rationale

Following an analysis of the health benefits provided to council of other comparator municipalities in each case the comparator group mirrored those provided by the Town of Banff.

The group plan benefits are optional for members of Council. Using this benefit plan offers economies of scale because administration systems are already in place for Town employees. It is a cost-effective method of providing health benefits to Council.

Recommendation on RRSP Benefit Program

Recommendation

That council members be offered enrollment in the Town's group RRSP benefit where the Town contributes an agreed upon percent of bi-weekly regular wages each pay period. Contributions would begin at the commencement of the elected term and cease on the final date of the term.

Rationale

Elected officials are not eligible to participate in the Local Authorities Pension Plan of which the Town is a participating member. Since this policy was last reviewed, the Town of Banff has implemented a Registered Retirement Savings Plan for employees who are not eligible for in the LAPP due to employment status.

Following an analysis of the benefits provided to council of other comparator municipalities it was found that some municipalities provide a retirement benefit. Providing enrolment in a retirement plan would support the CRRC's total compensation consideration; "The level of compensation should attract competent, motivated and well qualified community-minded citizens for the offices of Mayor and Councillor" (page 4 of this report).

For consistency purposes the CRRC recommends that the RRSP contribution amounts be aligned with one of the two existing plan designs:

- | | | |
|-----------------------|---------------------------|--------------------------------------|
| a.) Internal FT Terms | 8% bi-weekly contribution | Approximate annual cost: \$19,400.00 |
| b.) Contracted Terms | 5% bi-weekly contribution | Approximate annual cost: \$12,100.00 |

Recommendation on Computer Allowance

Recommendation

No recommendation for change at this time.

Recommendation on Travel Expenses

Recommendation

No recommendation for change at this time.

Recommendation on Conference, Convention and Seminar Registration Fees

Recommendation

No recommendation for change at this time.

Recommendation on Attendance at Local Functions

Recommendation

No recommendation for change at this time.

Recommendation on Child Care Expenses

Recommendation

No recommendation for change at this time.

Recommendation on the Review of Council Remuneration

Recommendation

That Council continue to appoint an independent committee to review Council remuneration every four (4) years, during the last year of the term of each Council. No recommendations for change at this time.

Rationale

The CRRC deems that it would be good practice to conduct a review of the council compensation policy every council term. Having an independent public committee separates the process of determining remuneration from Council while providing a process that is both transparent and accountable.

Summary of Recommendations

It is recommended that Governance and Finance Committee direct administration to bring back to council amendments to Council Remuneration Policy to implement the following recommendations:

1. That the base salary for the Mayor be adjusted as follows:
 - a) Effective October 23, 2017 until December 23, 2018 increase from \$79,953 to \$80,540. (1/3 non taxable).
 - b) Effective December 24, 2018 (first pay of 2019) increase from \$80,540 to \$93,426 (100% taxable); plus the market percentage increase approved in the annual budget and granted to all other Town of Banff employees.
 - c) In 2020 and 2021 increase the salary by the same market percentage approved in the annual budget and granted to all other Town of Banff employees.
2. The base salary for the Councillors be adjusted as follows:
 - a) Effective October 23, 2017 until December 23, 2018 increase from \$26,478 to \$26,900. (1/3 non taxable)
 - b) Effective December 24, 2018 (first pay of 2019) increase from \$26,900 to \$30,185 (100% taxable); plus the market percentage increase approved in the annual budget and granted to all other Town of Banff employees.
 - c) In 2020 and 2021 increase the salary by the same market percentage approved in the annual budget and granted to all other Town of Banff employees.
3. Effective December 24, 2018 Per diem rates be adjusted as follows:
 - a) 4 hours and less \$105.00 (100% taxable)
 - b) More than 4 hours \$210.00 (100% taxable)
4. That Councillors be eligible for enrollment in the Town of Banff's group Registered Retirement Savings Plan from one of the following options:
 - i. Contribution rate of 8% of regular bi-weekly wages; or
 - ii. Contribution rate of 5% of regular bi-weekly wages
 With:
 - a) Optional councillor contribution
 - b) Contributions begin in the first pay period of the term and cease in the last pay period of the term (or on termination of position).

TOWN OF BANFF

Terms of Reference

Council Remuneration Review Committee

1.0 COMPOSITION OF COMMITTEE

- 1.1 The Council Remuneration Review Committee (the “Committee”) is comprised of three (3) members of the public eligible in accordance with the Town of Banff Committee Appointments Policy.
- 1.2 The Committee shall elect a chairperson at their first meeting.
- 1.3 Members of the Committee will be appointed by Council directly, according to the Town of Banff Committee Appointments Policy.
- 1.4 If a member resigns or is unable to serve, a replacement may be appointed from the original list of applicants.

2.0 TERM OF OFFICE

- 2.1 In the year prior to a general municipal election, the Committee is established as a temporary Council committee.
- 2.2 The Committee shall terminate upon acceptance of the Committee’s final report by Council, which shall be completed on or before June 30th of the year of a general municipal election.

3.0 STATEMENT OF PURPOSE

- 3.1 The purpose of the Committee shall be to review and provide recommendation to the Town of Banff Council (the “Council”) with respect to the Town of Banff Council Remuneration Policy for the next term of office.
- 3.2 The report may include, but is not limited to, recommendations with respect to:
 - i) establishing a set of guiding principles for council remuneration;
 - ii) establishing the appropriate remuneration to be paid to the Council including specific recommendations on base salary and per diem amounts;
 - iii) benefits offered;

- iv) allowances and expenses;
- v) full time equivalent status;
- vi) options for making periodic adjustments to established remuneration; and
- vii) the establishment of standards for remuneration review.

4.0 DUTIES AND POWERS

- 4.1 The Committee is advisory in nature, making recommendations to Council by way of report.
- 4.2 The chairperson and/or another Committee member shall present the Committee's recommendation to the Governance and Finance Committee prior to a public Council meeting to ensure comprehensiveness and completeness.
- 4.3 All decisions and recommendations of the Committee will be made through a consensus based approach. Consensus does not mean a decision that is perfect for all participants. It does mean a decision that all participants can live with, and that all participants agree to support the decision. For issues where consensus cannot be reached, the majority vote will determine the final decision.
- 4.4 The Committee will review relevant survey data and practices of other comparable markets (such as the Small Municipalities Human Resources Team – SMHRT) and the Alberta Municipal Services Corporation/Alberta Urban Municipalities Association – AUMA/AMSC. The Committee may conduct other reviews it feels are necessary to enable it to make recommendations.
- 4.5 The Committee is permitted to solicit external submissions and expertise as required.
- 4.6 Committee members will receive no honorarium for their volunteer services.

5.0 MEETINGS

- 5.1 The Committee will determine the meeting schedule they require to complete their mandate.
- 5.2 All Committee meetings shall be open to the public, with item protected by the Freedom of Information and Protection of Privacy Act discussed in camera in accordance with usual procedures.
- 5.3 The Committee meeting is to comply with the requirements of the *Municipal Government Act*, as amended, and the Procedural Bylaw of the Town of Banff, as amended or repealed and replaced from time to time.

6.0 LIAISON

- 6.1 The Manager of Human Resources, or designate, shall attend Committee meetings to act in an advisory capacity as a non-voting member.
- 6.2 The Municipal Clerk, or designate, shall provide administrative support to the Committee.

7.0 REVIEW

- 7.1 The Committee Terms of Reference shall be reviewed in the year preceding a general election to ensure that they reflect the current mandate of the Committee.

	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	K	L	M	N	O	P	Q	R
1	Location (Rate Year)	Population 2016	Full Time/Part Time	Mayor Salary from 2015 Financial Statements	Benefits & Allowances from 2015 Financial Statements	Full Time/Part Time	Councillor Average Salary from 2015 Financial Statements	Councillor Average Salary from 2015 Financial Statements	Councillor Average Benefits and allowances from 2015 Financial Statements	Comp	Per Diem-Mayor	Car	Per Diem-Council	Car	Benefits	Conference Training/Travel/Subsistence	Other
2	Banff	7851 (Fed) 9386 (Muni)	FT	\$78,674	\$3,361	6 PT	\$26,055	\$26,055	\$3,726	\$29,781	Reasonable childcare upon submission of receipt		< 4hrs-\$90.00 > 4hrs-\$180.00 Reasonable childcare upon submission of receipt		80% ER paid EHC + 100% ER paid Dental 100% ER paid AD&D, Life	As per Travel Policy (attached) 2016 Budget - \$6000.00 total	Computer All \$500.00/year (Nov 1 - Oct 31)
3	Canmore	13992 perm 3890 non perm	FT	\$77,647	\$10,314	6 PT	\$37,144	\$37,144	\$6,985	\$44,129	No	cra	< 4hrs-\$100 4-8 hrs-\$200 > 8hrs-\$300 no annual max	cra	Life, AD&D, Dep Life-70% ER 30%EE: Hlth, Dental-100%ER; HSA-\$850; Group RRSP 8.65%ER, 5.5%EE	Travel/Subs: M -up to \$1,500 C- up to \$750 Conferences: \$3,000 per council and for mayor	Computer
4	Cochrane	25,122	FT	\$83,086	\$11,311	6PT	\$27,967	\$27,967	\$6,880	\$34,847	no	cra	no	cra	Life, AD&D Dependant life, health/dental 100 ER also 100 EE Pd Options: Life, ad&D & Critical illness	Travel/Subs: M -up to \$5,000 C- up to \$1,667 Training: \$1,857 per council and for mayor	
5	Okotoks	28,881	FT	\$76,387	\$5,042	6 PT	\$38,672	\$38,672	\$3,210	\$41,882	< 4hrs-\$100 > 4hrs-\$200 or Child Carew/rcpt max \$2800 annually	cra	< 4hrs-\$100 > 4hrs-\$200 or Child Carew/rcpt max \$2800 annually	cra	ER-100%-Life,DepLife,AD&D,HCS EE-45%-Medical, Dental		
6	Whistler	12,000		\$85,038			\$34,384	\$34,384	\$0	\$34,384	Covered under expense policy (attached). No per diem. Reimbursed upon receipt.	no	Covered under expense policy. No per diem. Reimbursed upon receipt.	no	MSP, Extended Health, Dental (100% ER Paid). AD&D (\$15,000). Group Life (\$15,000). 6 month paid Maternity/Parental Leave. EFAP.	Covered under expense policy (attached)	
7	Mayor Average (w/Banff)			\$80,166.40			\$26,722.13	\$32,844.40	\$4,160.20	\$37,004.60							
8	Mayor Average (w/O Banff)			\$80,539.50			\$26,846.50	\$34,541.75	\$4,268.75	\$38,810.50							

	Gross	Taxable	Federal Tax	Alberta Tax	CPP	Total Tax	Take Home	Gross up amount	Gross up rate	Additional Cost to Town
Mayor										
100% Taxable	\$ 80,540.00	\$ 80,540.00	\$ 12,064.78	\$ 5,939.18	\$ 2,564.10	\$ 18,003.96	\$ 62,536.04			
1/3 Tax Free	\$ 80,540.00	\$ 53,693.33	\$ 5,721.30	\$ 3,027.44	\$ 2,564.10	\$ 11,312.84	\$ 69,227.16	\$ 93,426.40	1.16	\$ 12,886.40
Gross Up Amount 100% Taxable	\$ 93,426.40	\$ 93,426.40	\$ 14,433.12	\$ 7,226.70	\$ 2,564.10	\$ 24,223.92	\$ 69,202.48			
Councillor										
100% Taxable	\$ 26,900.00	\$ 26,900.00	\$ 3,624.40	\$ 2,533.96	\$ 1,137.50	\$ 7,295.86	\$ 19,604.14			
1/3 Tax Free	\$ 26,900.00	\$ 17,933.33	\$ 2,362.62	\$ 1,692.86	\$ 700.44	\$ 4,755.92	\$ 22,144.08	\$ 30,666.00	6.84	\$ 22,596.00
Gross Up Amount 100% Taxable	\$ 30,666.00	\$ 30,666.00	\$ 4,149.34	\$ 2,883.92	\$ 1,347.06	\$ 8,380.32	\$ 22,285.68			\$ 3,766.00 Per councillor

Mayor Basic Remuneration - 0 Tax Free	\$ 80,540.00	Bi-weekly	\$ 3,097.69		
Federal Tax	\$ 11,558.30		\$ 444.55		
Alberta Tax	\$ 5,869.50		\$ 225.75		
CPP	\$ 2,564.10		\$ 145.55		
Net Take Home	\$ 60,548.10		\$ 2,281.84		
Mayor Basic Remuneration - 1/3 Tax Free	\$ 80,540.00	Bi-weekly	\$ 3,097.69	Taxable Income	\$ 1,974.35
Taxable Income	\$ 53,693.33		\$ 1,974.35		
Federal Tax	\$ 5,721.30		\$ 220.05		
Alberta Tax	\$ 3,027.44		\$ 116.44		
CPP	\$ 2,564.10		\$ 91.07		
Net Take Home	\$ 69,227.16		\$ 2,670.13		
Mayor Basic Remuneration - 0 Tax Free	\$ 93,426.00	Bi-weekly	\$ 3,593.31		
Federal Tax	\$ 14,433.12		\$ 555.12		
Alberta Tax	\$ 7,226.70		\$ 277.95		
CPP	\$ 2,564.10		\$ 171.39		
Net Take Home	\$ 69,202.08		\$ 2,588.85		
Councillor Basic Remuneration - 0 Tax Free	\$ 26,900.00	Bi-weekly	\$ 1,034.62		
Federal Tax	\$ 3,624.40		\$ 139.40		
Alberta Tax	\$ 2,533.96		\$ 97.46		
CPP	\$ 1,137.50		\$ 43.75		
Net Take Home	\$ 19,604.14		\$ 754.01		
Councillor Basic Remuneration - 1/3 Tax Free	\$ 26,900.00	Bi-weekly	\$ 1,034.62	Taxable Income	\$ 689.74
Taxable Income	\$ 17,933.33		\$ 689.74		
Federal Tax	\$ 2,362.62		\$ 90.87		
Alberta Tax	\$ 1,692.86		\$ 65.11		
CPP	\$ 700.44		\$ 26.94		
Net Take Home	\$ 22,144.08		\$ 851.70		
Councillor Basic Remuneration - 0 Tax Free	\$ 30,184.00	Bi-weekly	\$ 1,160.92		
Federal Tax	\$ 4,149.34		\$ 159.59		
Alberta Tax	\$ 2,883.92		\$ 110.92		
CPP	\$ 1,347.06		\$ 51.81		
Net Take Home	\$ 21,803.68		\$ 838.60		

Mayor assumes basic tax exemption (code 1) at 2017 rates
Councillor assumes claim code "0" at 2017 rates

POLICY COUNCIL REMUNERATION



Policy C076-2

1.0 POLICY

Members of Council will be provided with fair and reasonable remuneration for performing the duties of their office and reimbursement for the expenses that they incur in fulfilling their responsibilities.

2.0 PURPOSE

This policy is intended to clarify the remuneration and benefits available to a member of Council as well as determine which expenses will be assumed by the municipality when carrying out their official duties.

3.0 SCOPE

This policy applies to Council.

4.0 RESPONSIBILITIES

- 4.1 Council is responsible for approving this policy and any amendments to it.
- 4.2 The Manager of Corporate Services is responsible for ensuring members of Council are compensated in accordance with this policy.

5.0 RELATED POLICIES

- 5.1 C048 – Travel Guidelines

6.0 DEFINITIONS

- 6.1 **Bow Valley** means the area between and including Francis Cooke Landfill and Lake Louise.
- 6.2 **Council** includes the positions of Mayor and Councillors.
- 6.3 **Base remuneration** is an all-inclusive amount provided to members of Council for their time and service with respect to attending to municipal matters including all meetings of Council or one of its boards, committees or commissions.

7.0 GENERAL

- 7.1 While the hours of work for members of Council are not regulated, the position of Mayor is considered to be “full-time” while Councillor’s positions are considered to be “part-time”.
- 7.2 In accordance with provisions of the Municipal Government Act, one-third of the annual remuneration paid to a member of Council will be paid as an allowance for expenses incidental to the discharge of their duties and will not be included in computing council’s taxable income in a taxation year. This allowance for expenses is intended to cover costs related to maintaining a home office and travel within the Bow Valley.

8.0 BASE REMUNERATION

- 8.1 Base remuneration shall be paid to members of Council for the performance of their duties as elected officials and provided for in Schedule “A” of this policy.

- 8.2 Effective January 1 of each year the Manager of Corporate Services shall adjust the base remuneration by the same percentage salary change approved in the annual budget and granted to all other Town of Banff employees.
- 8.3 Base remuneration will be paid biweekly with the regular Town of Banff pay cycle.

9.0 PER DIEMS

- 9.1 Councillors may claim a per diem for required attendance as an official representative of the Town at conferences, workshops, seminars and meetings outside the Bow Valley as provided for in Schedule 'A' of this policy.
- 9.2 The Mayor is not eligible to claim per diems.
- 9.3 In situations where a member of Council is appointed to represent the Town in an official capacity on and external agency, board or committee, and a per diem is paid by that organization, the per diem received must be reported to the Town Manager and paid into Town revenue.

10.0 BENEFITS

- 10.1 Members of Council participate in Town of Banff benefit programs where eligible and as outlined in the terms of the contract with the chosen benefit provider and based on the cost share provided to Town of Banff employees.

11.0 ALLOWANCES AND EXPENSES

11.1 Computer Allowance

- a) Members of Council are required to use a computer device for municipal business. Members of Council that wish to use their own personal computer instead of having the Town supply them with a computer for municipal business shall receive a \$500 annual allowance.
- b) The allowance is for the period of November 1 to October 31. If the member of Council leaves office prior to the end of this period, the member of Council shall repay a prorated amount for every full month that they are not eligible for the allowance. If the member of Council chooses not to use their personal computer for council work anymore, then the Town will supply a computer and the member of Council shall repay the Town for the unused portion of the allowance.

11.2 Travel Expenses

- a) Members of Council shall be reimbursed for travel and related expenses in accordance with Policy C048 – Travel Guidelines.
- b) Spouses of members of Council shall be reimbursed for travel and related expenses when accompanying their spouse to a conference, convention or seminar, to a maximum of one per year for the spouse of a Councillor, and to a maximum of two per year for the spouse of the Mayor, subject to the amount approved in the annual operating budget for this purpose.

11.3 Conference, Convention and Seminar Registration Fees

- a) The Town will pay registration fees for each Councillor to attend a maximum of two conferences, conventions or seminars per year in Canada, with no more than one per year outside of Alberta.
- b) The Town will pay registration fees for the Mayor to attend a maximum of four conferences, conventions or seminars per year in Canada, with no more than two per year outside of Alberta.

11.4 Attendance at Local Functions

The Town will pay costs associated with attendance of elected officials and their spouses at local functions when they are attending as official representatives of the Town.

11.5 Child Care Expenses

Members of Council shall be reimbursed for reasonable child care expenses incurred when attending meetings, conferences, conventions or seminars in an official capacity, upon submission of receipts.

12.0 REVIEW OF COUNCIL REMUNERATION

12.1 Council remuneration is to be reviewed during the last year of the term of each Council.

12.2 Council may request a committee of public members to review Council remuneration and bring forward recommendations that would be effective for the newly elected council.

13.0 EXCEPTIONS

13.1 Exceptions to this policy may be made by a majority vote of council.

14.0 ATTACHMENTS

Schedule A - Council Remuneration Schedule

15.0 REPEALS POLICY: C076-1**16.0 EFFECTIVE DATE: OCTOBER 28, 2013****17.0 APPROVAL HISTORY**

Approved:	2013.07.08	COU13-184
-----------	------------	-----------

Karen Sorensen
Mayor

Robert Earl
Town Manager

SCHEDULE A
Council Remuneration Schedule
(2013)

BASE REMUNERATION

Effective October 28, 2013

Mayor	\$77,000 per annum (1/3 non-taxable)
Councillor	\$25,500 per annum (1/3 non-taxable)

PER DIEM RATES

Effective October 28, 2013:

4 hours and less	\$90.00 (1/3 non-taxable)
More than 4 hours	\$180.00 (1/3 non-taxable)

OTHER REMUNERATION

Effective October 28, 2013

Computer Allowance	\$500 (1/3 non-taxable) (for the period of November 1 to October 31)
---------------------------	---

Note: Schedule A is reviewed and updated by the Manager of Corporate Services on an annual basis under the authority of Council Policy C076-2, Section 8.2. A Council resolution is not required to approve these annual updates.

Based on our Goals and Purpose, I thought I would draft an outline of our approach and some principles we could use to determine our recommendations. I am following some of the original format from 2003 for consistency.

The CCCR should recognize the importance of considering both the unique circumstance of public office within the region of Niagara, and the review of compensation as it relates to municipal public office in a manner that reflects the duties, responsibilities, skill, effort, authority and decision making.

Citizens' Committee Principles

- These principles are intended as an overall preference and not absolute rules to be adhered to. Specifically, the current remuneration arrangement could be used as a default. That is, there would be no recommendations to change current practices in the absence of compelling reasons to do so.
- Any recommendations would be guided by evidence-based information and conducive to *transparency, simplicity, and fairness*.
- The policy recommendations attempt to strike a balance between *the work that is required of a public official* and *the call to serve one's community*.
- Members of Regional Municipality of Niagara Council will be provided with *fair and reasonable remuneration* for performing the duties of their office.
- The CCCR should recognize the importance of considering both the unique circumstance of public office within the region of Niagara, and the review of compensation as it relates to municipal public office in a manner that reflects the duties, responsibilities, skill, effort, authority and decision making.

Broader General Principles that we have already discussed –

1. Remuneration must be *transparent, fiscally responsible, and easily understood by the electorate*;
2. Fair relativity with comparable positions;
3. The need to be fair to the individuals whose pay is being set, and to the taxpayer and other related individuals;
4. The requirements of the job;
5. The need to attract and retain competent individuals as councilors;
6. The economic conditions.

Goals & Purposes of the Committee –

Four goals outlined are as follows; however, there are really only two deliverables –

Goal #1 – Review the current council approved methodology used for annual council remuneration increases (i.e. percentage increase)

Goal #2 - Review the current external comparator group of municipalities and make recommendations on whether to maintain existing comparator group or to make amendments to existing group.

Goal #3 – Review external comparator regional and local municipal council methodology and rates and make recommendation for future methodology on base compensation for Regional Councilors.

Goal #4 – Prepare final report with recommendations to CSC and Regional Council for approval.

Two Deliverables:

1. Recommendations to maintain or alter the comparator group
2. Recommendations on the methodology

Data/Tools required for Assessing Remuneration –

1. Union and Non-Union wage increases over the period of 2008 to 2019
2. Councilors wage increases broken down by Core CPI and Conference Board of Canada percentages
3. Current Regional Comparative group
4. Local Municipalities Comparative group
5. Research done by Sabrina Hill on Township of Banff and St. Catharines as well as any other local municipalities' methodologies
6. Landscape brief of feedback collected by Sabrina Hill
7. Possible councilor survey
8. Weighted Averages of data based on Integrity, Reliability & Relevance using a 1 to 5 assignment
9. Dropbox or Google Drive for committee collaboration.

Criteria Checklist –

- Current base pay across jurisdictions
- Council Size across jurisdictions
- Budget size across jurisdictions
- Population size across jurisdictions
- Population Growth across jurisdictions
- Income Growth
- Residents per Councilor

Post Script: *much of this information can be extracted from FACT BOOK, September 30, 2018, Page 79 to 103 of the materials we were sent.*

Approach Outline –

1. Agree on Committee Principles.
2. Explore & determine relevant criteria for assessing remuneration.
3. Review data/information already requested/received to determine if criteria requirement is satisfied.
4. Review draft of Weighted Averages definition and application of weighting.
5. Apply Weighted Values to data/information received in a Matrix as it relates to each Goal & Purpose.
6. Begin analysis of each deliverables (see draft methodology) using weighted values (i.e. *what information is relevant to which Goal or Purpose*).
7. Determine if recommendations are warranted.
8. Develop language around the recommendations using evidence based analysis for support.
9. Signoff on recommendations.

Weighted Values Draft Discussion –

A two-part suggestion from Bob Haig was made that we use the following methodology to arrive at recommendations, here is a draft definition of the terms for our discussion –

Part 1 – **Terminology** – here are suggested titles we could apply to the data/information we use as we evaluate the criteria decided on

1. **Integrity** – *meaning integrity of the information can be defined as the dependability and trustworthiness of information.*
2. **Reliability** – *meaning the information is evidence based that is derived from or formed by objective evidence.*
3. **Relevance** – *meaning the data/information used directly relates to the matters being discussed.*

Part 2 – **Weighted Value** – here are some definitions of weighting that we can discuss for use in determining what weight the data/information contributes to the evidence used to make the recommendations.

1. **Not Important** – this classification contributes very little to the integrity, reliability or relevance of information required to make a recommendation.
2. **Slightly Important** – this classification adds some information but does not support the integrity, reliability or relevance required to make a recommendation.
3. **Important** – this classification adds information and supports less than 2 aspects of integrity, reliability or relevance required to make a recommendation.
4. **Fairly Important** – this classification adds information and supports 2 or more aspects of integrity, reliability or relevance required to make a recommendation.
5. **Very Important** – this classification supports all aspects of integrity, reliability and relevance required to make a recommendation.

Draft Approach Outline – Deliverables**Deliverable #1 – Recommendations to maintain or alter the comparator group****Methodology –**

- Review current application of Core CPI and Conference Board of Canada percentage applications and compare to Union and Non-Union wage increases for the period of 2008 to 2019
- Review what the increases are applied to (i.e. *just the base?*)
- Compare the current application to other regions and municipalities
- Apply the criteria decided upon to the current external comparator group of municipality & determine if the group is reflective of the Niagara Region
- Review the various methodologies compiled from different jurisdictions
- Discuss differences if warranted

Conclusion –

- Determine if the current application is in line with other regions/municipalities
- Determine if there are recommendations for amendments to existing group
- Determine if there are recommendations for future methodology and rates
- Determine the fairness across the various aspects compared
- Determine the ability to defend the conclusion and document it
- Move to the possible recommendation category

Deliverable #2 – Recommendations on the methodology**Methodology –**

- Identify potential methodologies
- Review the potential methodologies based in the criteria
- Apply a weighted value to each recommendation
- Assign a priority to each recommendation
- Ensure recommendations are backed by an evidence-based conclusion, tables, and language
- Apply the macro- and micro reasoning for the recommendation

Conclusion -

- Prepare the final report

Committee Members & Participants –

Name	Email Address	Phone Number
Bob Haig		
Margo Pinder		
Sabrina Hill		
Ann-Marie Norio	Ann-Marie.Norio@niagararegion.ca	905-980-6000; #3220
Kristen Angrilli	Kristen.angrilli@niagararegion.ca	905-980-6000

**THE REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY OF NIAGARA
CITIZEN COMMITTEE ON COUNCIL REMUNERATION
MINUTES**

**CCCR 2-2019
Tuesday, September 17, 2019
Campbell East (CE) 103
Niagara Region Headquarters, Campbell East
1815 Sir Isaac Brock Way, Thorold**

Committee: B. Haig , S. Hill, M. Pinder (Committee Chair)

Staff: K. Angrilli, Manager, Total Rewards, F. Meffe, Acting Director,
Human Resources, A.-M. Norio, Regional Clerk

1. CALL TO ORDER

Margo Pinder, Committee Chair, called the meeting to order at 2:00 p.m.

2. DISCLOSURES OF PECUNIARY INTEREST

There were no disclosures of pecuniary interest.

3. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION

Committee members discussed Correspondence Items CCCR-C 3-2019 and CCCR-C 4-2019 to better understand how these items could be utilized to determine a fair, transparent and simple methodology for council remuneration increases.

Committee summarized their discussions as follows:

- consider no longer including the Conference Board of Canada non union policy line percentages as part of the methodology
- consider tying the increase to non-union staff increases
- consider tying the increase to the core consumer price index (CPI)
- ensure any methodology includes consideration of both CPI and economic indicators in the Niagara Region
- consider a cap on the amount
- consider use of a rolling weighted average of staff increases
- consider a methodology that includes alignment with non-union increases blended with the Conference Board of Canada non union policy line percentages

Moved by B. Haig
Seconded by S. Hill

That the following items **BE RECEIVED** for information:

CCCR-C 3-2019
2008-2019 Wage Increase History - Niagara Region Union and Non-Union
Employee Groups

CCCR-C 4-2019
Niagara Region Council Annual Salary Formula Details 2008 - 2019

Carried

Committee Information Request(s):

Provide a copy of the non-union compensation policy.

Provide the income growth information the City of St. Catharines uses for their
Councillor remuneration methodology.

3.3 CCCR-C 5-2019

Town of Banff - Council Remuneration Review Committee Report

Due to time constraints, this item will be added to the agenda for the
meeting being held on Friday, October 4, 2019.

4. **CONSENT ITEMS FOR INFORMATION**

4.1 CCCR 1-2019

Minutes - Citizen Committee on Council Remuneration
Thursday, September 5, 2019

Moved by S. Hill
Seconded by B. Haig

That Minutes CCCR 1-2019, being the minutes of the Citizen Committee
on Council Remuneration meeting held on Thursday, September 5, 2019,
BE RECEIVED for information.

Carried

6. NEXT MEETING

The next meeting will be held on Friday, October 4, 2019 at 2:00 p.m. in Room CE 103, Regional Headquarters.

7. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 3:57 p.m.

Margo Pinder
Committee Chair

Ann-Marie Norio
Regional Clerk

**THE REGIONAL MUNICIPALITY OF NIAGARA
CITIZEN COMMITTEE ON COUNCIL REMUNERATION
MINUTES**

**CCCR 3-2019
Friday, October 4, 2019
Campbell East (CE) 103
Niagara Region Headquarters, Campbell East
1815 Sir Isaac Brock Way, Thorold**

Committee: B. Haig , S. Hill, M. Pinder (Committee Chair)

Staff: K. Angrilli, Manager, Total Rewards, F. Meffe, Acting Director,
Human Resources, A.-M. Norio, Regional Clerk

1. CALL TO ORDER

Margo Pinder, Committee Chair, called the meeting to order at 2:11 p.m.

2. DISCLOSURES OF PECUNIARY INTEREST

There were no disclosures of pecuniary interest.

3. PRESENTATIONS

There were no presentations.

4. DELEGATIONS

There were no delegations.

5. ITEMS FOR CONSIDERATION

5.1 CCCR-C 5-2019

Town of Banff - Council Remuneration Review Committee Report

Moved by S. Hill

Seconded by B. Haig

That Correspondence Item CCCR-C 5-2019, being the Council Remuneration Review Committee Report from the Town of Banff, **BE RECEIVED** for information.

Carried

Committee member S. Hill, prepared a summary of the Town of Banff report for use by the Committee. The summary is attached to these minutes.

5.2 CCCR-C 6-2019

Approach Outline for Citizen Committee on Council Remuneration

Moved by B. Haig

Seconded by S. Hill

That Correspondence Item CCCR-C 6-2019, being the Approach Outline for Citizen Committee on Council Remuneration, **BE APPROVED** as the basis for making determinations respecting council remuneration.

Carried

The Committee conducted a thorough discussion of the approach outline and decided that the final report would recommend to maintain the existing comparator group of municipalities and that Council increases would be tied to the non-union staff increase.

The Committee decided the final report should contain:

- the options the Committee considered and why some were excluded
- annual methodology
- reference to the City of St. Catharines methodology; and
- reference to the consideration of union and non-union increases

6. **CONSENT ITEMS FOR INFORMATION**

6.1 CCCR 2-2019

Minutes - Citizen Committee on Council Remuneration
Tuesday, September 17, 2019

Moved by B. Haig

Seconded by S. Hill

That Minutes CCCR 2-2019, being the minutes of the Citizen Committee on Council Remuneration meeting held on Tuesday, September 17, 2019, **BE RECEIVED** for information.

Carried

Committee Information Request(s):

Amend bullet point 6 in Minute Item #3 to clarify "unionized staff increases".

7. **OTHER BUSINESS**

There were no items of other business.

8. **NEXT MEETING**

The next meeting will be held on Wednesday, October 16, 2019 at 9:30 a.m. in Room CE 103.

9. **ADJOURNMENT**

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 3:21 p.m.

Margo Pinder
Committee Chair

Ann-Marie Norio
Regional Clerk

Citizen Committee on Council Remuneration

Meeting Notes for October 4th, 2019

The Banff Report

Similarities Between Banff and Niagara - Why I wanted Banff included in this review

- Banff's objectives and methodology overlap with ours in that we are both seeking 1. an *evidence-based approach* consistent with, 2. *transparency, simplicity, and fairness*, while being 3. *fiscally responsible*. PG25
- "The residents of Banff believe that ... *Councillors bring value to the community and should be remunerated appropriately in accordance with Banff's unique iconic stature as an international tourist destination*¹ and associated public profile of its elected officials." PG6
- "The philosophy is to base the compensation for ... Councillors on a *realistic scale*² and should reflect the demanding nature and responsibilities of that public office in order to attract capable candidates; however such *compensation must also be reasonable to both members of council and to the citizens of Banff*." PG6
- "The position of councillor continues should continue to be considered part-time..." PG11
- "*Councillors' responsibilities require members to prepare for and attend meetings and events in addition to keeping informed on current issues while maintaining contact with residents*. It should be understood that Councillors in a small community have a high public profile and that they are often required to be engaged with constituents on a daily basis." While the Regional Municipality of Niagara is considerable in size and population, many of the members of council come from small communities where they must, and indeed do, interact with their constituents. PG11

Concerns - or areas where our objectives differ from that of Banff's

- The new policy (Banff) stipulated that a comprehensive remuneration review would take place every election year prior to the election, *this is unnecessary if appropriate language is drafted that builds in the cost of labour*³. The formula or process that determines 'total increases' for non-union employees - by the *total rewards director* - for the region seems to achieve this task.
- The '*remuneration of councillors are tied to the mayor's base salary*.' This is problematic as it creates the incentive (for council) to drive up the mayor's compensation package as it will automatically trigger a pay raise for the rest of council. PG11

¹ In 2017-18, about 4.2 million people visited Banff, an increase of about 28 per cent from 3.3 million five years ago. It is estimated that around 30 million people visit Niagara Falls each year.

² Median total income of households in Niagara in 2015: \$65,086 - Data for income earned from a part-time position was not available in time for the submission of this document.

³ Tangentially, CPI and normal inflation would be factored into any rewards packages or the total increases calculation (and adjustments) by Region staff.

- The Banff policy addressed a number of other compensation packages that are outside the scope of our committee. PG13

Conclusion

- Considering the 'broader general principles' as laid out in previous meetings, I still feel that the CCCR should have more carefully considered the idea of seeking input from council members through the form of testimony or a questionnaire. Questions posed to council related to past, current and future demands being placed on council and the compensation received for performing their duties would have helped us by furthering our insight of the demands of the job. PG8
- Banff sought a balance between providing a "compensation package that attracts suitable candidates" and a "commitment to an effective stewardship of public funds." PG8
- "Council Base Remuneration continue to be adjusted effective January 1⁴ of each year by the same market formula used in the annual adjustment for Town wages approved in the Financial Plan for all Town of Banff employees." That the CCCR draft's a policy recommendation for council that is; 1. increases to councillor remuneration is tied to non-union staff employed by the region, 2. self-guiding in the sense that, unlike Banff, the issue does not need to be revisited every election cycle, and that 3. features language that strongly suggests that if the council wishes to change their remuneration package, that another CCCR be formed to review the feasibility and rationale behind any increase in compensation packages. PG12
- In the interest of accountability and transparency, cores values as established by the guiding document, "Due to the perceived conflict of interest in the process for wage adjustments, the level of compensation from members of council should be adjusted from time to time by an arm's length process." Tying remuneration to the increases received by non-union regional staff keeps up with inflation and removes the need for council to frequently revisit this issue. PG12
- While *optically* it is reasonable to consider basing (the) 'total increases to council remuneration' to the same increases unionized workers in the Region receive, especially considering they various unions represent a total of approximately eighty percent of the workforce, though because of logistics and the nature of the bargaining process, such a process is unfeasible at this time. PG26
- I don't believe that CPI (as it is redundant) should be a part of the formula for determining remuneration (directly) and that the Conference Board of Canada percentage is not an ideal metric⁵ and should not be considered as a part of the formula for future increases. The process of determining increases for non-union employees by the total rewards staff already considers inflation.
- Continuing a thought from the last point, the only issue I foresee with this formula (basing council increases to the percentage increase of non-union employees) is to effectively communicate the process and mechanism to determine said increases to the residents of the Region. An effort would need to be made by this committee to simply explain it to residents in a manner all might understand. (Broader General Principle 1) PG25

⁴ The date can be amended to a more suitable time if necessary. This date is just a place holder and borrowed from the Banff outline.

⁵ Some part of the Conference percentage is based on self-reporting. This is at odds with our stated goals of transparency and evidence-based information - and, considering the possibility of a questionnaire was rejected because questions over integrity, reliability, and relevance of submissions from Region councillors.